EXHIBIT A

April 14, 2023 1–4

	EENTOTTEET against 1 OOT OETOO		D
1	Page 1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	1	Page 3 PRESENT (Continued):
2	SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK	2	
3	SELENA STALEY, VIVIAN)	3	SMITH GAMBRELL RUSSELL,
4	HOLMES, and OLIVE IVEY,)	4	(1301 Avenue of the Americas, 21st Floor,
5	on behalf of themselves)	5	New York, New York 10019,
6	and all others similarly)	6	212-218-8760), by:
7	situated,)	7	MS. KATHRYN T. LUNDY,
8	Plaintiffs,)	8	klundy@sgrlaw.com,
9	-against-) No. 22-CV-6781 (JSR)	9	appeared via Zoom Video Conference on
10	FOUR SEASONS HOTELS AND)	10	behalf of the Defendants Hotel 57
11	RESORTS, HOTEL 57)	11	Services, LLC; Hotel 57, LLC; Ty Warner
12	SERVICES, LLC, HOTEL 57,)	12	Hotels & Resorts, LLC, H. Ty Warner, and
13	LLC, TY WARNER HOTELS &)	13	the deponent;
14	RESORTS, LLC, and H. TY)	14	
15	WARNER,)	15	SMITH GAMBRELL RUSSELL,
16	Defendants.)	16	(311 South Wacker Drive, Suite 3000,
17	The videotaped deposition of CATHY	17	Chicago, Illinois 60606,
18	HWANG, called as a witness for examination, taken	18	312-360-6000), by:
19	pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure of	19	MR. JAMES J. BOLAND,
20	the United States District Courts pertaining to the	20	jboland@sgrlaw.com,
21	taking of depositions, taken via Zoom video	21	appeared on behalf of the Defendants
22	conference before JACQUELINE M. TIMMONS, a Notary	22	Hotel 57 Services, LLC, Hotel 57, LLC,
23	Public within and for the County of DuPage, State	23	Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts, LLC, H. Ty
24	of Illinois, and a Certified Shorthand Reporter of	24	Warner, and the deponent;
1	Page 2 said state, at 280 Chestnut Avenue, Westmont,	1	Page 4 PRESENT (Continued):
2	Illinois, on the 14th day of April, A.D. 2023 at	2	
3	9:05 a.m.	3	STOKES & WAGNER, ALC,
4		4	(903 Hanshaw Road,
5	PRESENT:	5	Ithaca, New York 14850,
6		6	607-257-5165), by:
7	BRUSTEIN LAW PLCC,	7	MR. PAUL ERIC WAGNER,
8	(299 Broadway, 17th Floor,	8	pwagner@stokeswagner.com,
9	New York, New York 10007,	9	appeared via Zoom Video Conference on
10	212-233-3900), by:	10	behalf of the Defendant FSR
11	MR. EVAN CRAIG BRUSTEIN,	11	International Hotels, Inc.
12	evan@brusteinlaw.com,	12	
13	and	13	ALSO PRESENT:
14	RISMAN & RISMAN, P.C.,	14	MS. AMANDA YONUSHATIS, The Videographer.
15	(299 Broadway, 17th Floor,	15	·
16	New York, New York 10007,	16	REPORTED BY: JACQUELINE M. TIMMONS,
17	212-233-6400), by:	17	C.S.R., R.M.R., R.D.R.
18	MS. MAYA RISMAN,	18	Certificate No. 84-2949.
19	info@risman-law.com,	19	
20	appeared via Zoom Video Conference on	20	
	behalf of the Plaintiffs;	21	
21	Deliaii Oi the Fiaintilis/		
21	behalf of the Flathtills/	22	
	behalf of the Flaintills,	22	
22	behalf of the Flaintlifs,		



April 14, 2023 5–8

Page 7

Page 8

Page 5

THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This is videotape No. 1 to

- 2 the videotaped deposition of Cathy Hwang in the
- 3 matter of Selena Staley, et al., versus FSR
- 4 International Hotel, Incorporated, being heard
- 5 before the United States District Court, Southern
- 6 District of New York, Case No. 22-CV-6781.
- 7 This deposition is being held at
- 8 208 Chestnut -- Chestnut Ave. in Westmont,
- 9 Illinois, on April 14, 2023, at 9:06 a.m.
- 10 My name is Amanda. I'm the
- 11 videographer, Amanda, and the court reporter is
- 12 Jacqueline Timmons.
- 13 Counsel, will you please introduce
- 14 yourselves and affiliations, and the witness will
- 15 be sworn.
- 16 MR. BRUSTEIN: Good morning. Evan Brustein
- 17 Brustein Law, on behalf of the plaintiffs.
- 18 And I believe it's 280, not 208 Chestnut
- 19 Ave., just --
- 20 MS. HWANG: That's correct. It's 280 Chestnut
- 21 Avenue.
- 22 MS. RISMAN: Maya Risman, Risman & Risman on
- 23 behalf of plaintiffs.
- 24 MR. BOLAND: Jim Boland from Smith Gambrell

- to call the witness Ms. Hwang. Thank you.
- MR. BRUSTEIN: And I hope that this is the
- 3 last question you answer on behalf of the witness.
- 4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 5 Q. Ms. Hwang, I represent the plaintiffs in
- 6 this action in the Southern District of New York.
- 7 Are you represented by counsel today?
- 8 A. Yes.

12

- 9 Q. And what are the names or name of the
- 10 attorneys that are representing you today?
- 11 A. Jim Boland and Kathryn Lundy.
 - Q. And what law firm are they with?
- 13 A. Freeborn, which has recently been
- 14 changed to SGR. I don't remember the full name of
- 15 the firm. Smith -- you have to tell me the rest.
- 16 MR. BOLAND: Whatever you remember.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. SGR.
- 19 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 20 Q. And are you going to allow Mr. Boland to
- 21 decide what you are referred to today?
- 22 A. I prefer to be addressed as Cath --
- 23 Ms. Hwang.
- 24 Q. Not a problem, Ms. Hwang. Thank you.

Page 6

1

- 1 Russell on behalf of the Warner defendants and
- 2 Ms. Hwang.
- 3 MS. LUNDY: Kathryn Lundy of Smith Gambrell
- 4 and Russell, also on behalf of the Warner
- 5 defendants and Ms. Hwang.
- 6 MR. WAGNER: Paul Wagner of Stokes Wagner on
- 7 behalf of FSR International Hotels, Inc.
- 8 MS. HWANG: Cathy Hwang, the Chief Financial
- 9 Officer of Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts.
- 10 (WHEREUPON, the witness was duly
- 11 sworn.)
- 12 CATHY HWANG,
- 13 called as a witness herein, having been first duly
- 14 sworn, was examined and testified as follows:
- 15 EXAMINATION
- 16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 17 Q. Good morning, Ms. Hwang.
- 18 A. Good morning.
- 19 Q. For today's purposes, do you prefer that
- 20 I call you Cathy or Ms. Hwang?
- 21 MR. BOLAND: Ms. Hwang.
- 22 MR. BRUSTEIN: Thank you, Mr. Boland, but I'm
- 23 asking the witness.
- 24 MR. BOLAND: And I'm telling you, you're going

A. Thank you.

- 2 Q. I will be asking a series of questions
- 3 today, and the reporter will be recording your
- 4 answers. As I said, I represent the plaintiffs in
- this action in the Southern District of New York.

You must give verbal responses. Please

- 7 do not nod your head or say "uh-huh." I'm looking
- 8 to find out everything you know regarding the facts
- 9 and circumstances surrounding the lawsuit. For
- 10 that reason, I'm looking for complete answers.
- 11 Is that understood?
- is that understoo
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. Please keep your voice up and speak
- 14 clearly so the court reporter can transcribe the
- 15 deposition accurately. Do you understand?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Please wait for me to finish asking the
- 18 question before you answer. This makes it easier
- 19 for the court reporter to take down what we are
- 20 saying and will get us through the deposition
- 21 quicker, okay?

- A. Yes.
- 23 Q. If you do not understand a question,
- 24 tell me you don't understand, and I will rephrase



April 14, 2023 9 - 12

deletary of reel against 1 ook of roo	140
Page 9 1 it, okay?	1
2 A. Okay.	2
3 Q. If you do not hear any part of a	3
4 question, please tell me, and I will repeat it,	4
5 okay?	5
6 A. Okay.	6
7 Q. I only expect you to testify about	7
8 things you remember. If you don't remember, tell	8
9 me you don't remember, okay?	9
10 A. Okay.	10
I1 Q. This testimony is given under oath,	11
12 which is similar to the oath you would take on	12
13 stand at trial. Do you understand that you took an	13
14 oath to give complete and truthful answers?	14
15 A. Yes.	15
16 Q. If you realize during the deposition	16
17 that an earlier answer was inaccurate or	17
18 incomplete, let me know, and I will give you a	18
19 chance to correct it, okay?	19
20 A. Okay.	20
Q. You may review the transcript that will	21
be generated by the court reporter from the	22
23 testimony today, and after your review, you may	23
correct any errors you find in the transcript.	24
Page 10	_
Do you understand that?	1
2 A. Yes.	2
3 Q. Now, if you make changes to the	3
4 transcript, I will be able to comment on those5 changes at trial, okay?	4
6 A. Okay.	5
7 Q. We can take breaks during the	6 7
8 deposition. If you need to take a break, let me	8
9 know. But we can't take a break while a question	9
10 is pending. This means that if I ask a question,	10
11 you must answer the question before we can take a	11
12 break, okay?	12
13 A. Okay.	13
14 Q. And if you answer a question, that means	14
15 that you both understand it and are answering it	15
16 truthfully, okay?	16
I AND DOLAND OLD AN ALL	

Page 11 You can answer. BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you understand the rules of the deposition for today? A. Yes. Q. How did you choose to be represented by Mr. Boland? A. He -- he was referred from Mr. Warner's personal attorney. Q. And did you do any research of Mr. Boland before retaining him as an attorney? A. No. Mr. Warner's attorney did so. Q. I'm sorry? A. Mr. Warner's attorney researched. I did not. Q. And who is Mr. Warner's attorney that you're referring to? A. Greg Scandaglia. Q. Have you ever had your deposition taken before? A. Yes. Q. How many times? Page 12 A. Once. Q. And what case was that? A. It was for a case against Montecito Club in Santa Barbara. Q. And were you a plaintiff or defendant or something else in that case? A. Defendant. Q. And what is your connection to --A. Oh --Q. -- Montecito? A. -- I'm sorry. I need to correct. We're the plaintiff. Q. You were the plaintiff? A. Yes. MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: 17 Q. And why were -- why were you suing 18 Montecito? A. No, I don't remember the -- I believe it 20 was Mr. Root. We were Montecito Country Club. I

21 was representing as a corporate officer of the

Q. And what is the corporate name for the

22 club, and it was a lawsuit against Mr. Root.

24 Montecito Country Club?

23

17 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. 18 You may answer.

19 BY THE WITNESS:

20 A. Okay.

21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

22 Q. Well, if you answer a question, that

23 means that you understood the question, okay?

MR. BOLAND: Same objection.

CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 13–16

1	MR BOLAND:	Objection, vague.
	WIN. DOLAND.	Objection, vague.

- 2 BY THE WITNESS:
- 3 A. It's Montecito Club, Montecito Country
- 4 Club.
- 5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 6 Q. And who owns the Montecito Country Club?
- 7 A. Montecito Country Club Property, LLC.
- 8 Q. And who owns Montecito Country Club,
- 9 LLC?
- 10 MR. BOLAND: Objection.
- 11 BY THE WITNESS:
- 12 A. I -- I don't know the complex legal
- 13 entity structure. It is -- there's many legal
- 14 structures, and it indirectly leads up to
- 15 Mr. Warner.
- 16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 17 Q. When was that prior deposition?
- A. I believe it was either end of 2021
- 19 or -- or 2022 or earlier in 2023.
- 20 Q. And is that case still pending?
- 21 A. Yes. To my knowledge, yes.
- 22 Q. What was the basis for that lawsuit?
- 23 A. It was easement encroachment.
- 24 Q. Now, you said that there were other
 - Page 14
- 1 legal entities involved in -- in the ownership of
- 2 that company. Are you an officer in each one of
- 3 those legal entities?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. How many of those legal entities are you
- 6 an officer?
- 7 A. I would estimate about 30 to 40 legal
- 8 entities. I don't know the exact count.
- 9 Q. And when you say 30 to 40 legal
- 10 entities, is that just related to the Montecito
- 11 Country Club or is that for all Ty Warner-related
- 12 companies?
- 13 A. All Ty Warner-related companies.
- 14 Q. And do you have the same title in each
- 15 one of the Ty Warner-related companies or different
- 16 titles?
- 17 A. Same title.
- 18 Q. And what title is that?
- 19 A. Vice president/treasurer/secretary.
- 20 Q. So you have three titles in each one of
- 21 those corporate entities?
- 22 A. It's vice president slash secretary
- 23 slash treasurer.
- 24 Q. How long have you known Ty Warner?

- Page 15
 A. I worked for Mr. Warner for about six
- 2 years, a little over six years now.
- 3 Q. And how long have you known him?
- 4 A. I met him probably back in the mid
- 5 2000s.
- 6 Q. When you say mid 2000s, is that like
- 7 2005?

9

15

- 8 A. Yes. I don't know the exact year.
 - Q. How did you come to meet?
- 10 A. I met him at my parents' place of
- 11 business. He was a customer.
- 12 Q. And what is your parents' place of
- 13 business?
- 14 A. They have a dry cleaners.
 - Q. And were you working at that dry
- 16 cleaners when you met him?
- 17 A. Yes. I was visiting and working.
- 18 Q. What was your job at the dry cleaners
- 19 when you met him?
- 20 A. I was not an official employee there. I
- 21 was just stopping in to help out from time to time.
- 22 Q. What type of tasks did you do to help
- 23 out at the dry cleaners when you met Mr. Warner?
- 24 A. I worked at the front receiving

- 1 customers.
 - 2 Q. Now, you said that you were a VP in
 - 3 these companies. Are you the VP of finance for the
- 4 30 or 40 companies that you work with in connection
- 5 with Mr. Warner, or something else?
- 6 A. My officer title for all the companies
- 7 is vice president/treasurer/secretary. I am the
- 8 chief financial officer for Ty Warner Hotels &
- 9 Resorts, but I'm also the vice
- 10 president/secretary/treasurer of Ty Warner Hotels &
- 11 Resorts.
- 12 Q. Do you -- do you have other titles for
- 13 the companies that you work for besides your
- 14 official title?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Objection, vague.
- 16 You can answer.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. No.
- 19 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 20 Q. Are you the VP of finance or chief
- 21 financial officer for any other companies besides
- 22 Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts?
- 23 A. To be clear, I'm the chief financial
- 24 officer for Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts, and I'm the



April 14, 2023 17–20

	<u></u>	LETTY OTT LET against 1 Ook of 100	110			17 20
	1	Page 17 vice president, not vice president of finance, of	1	Q. F	acebook?	Page 19
	2	all the other	2	A. N	0.	
	3	Q. Thank you for	3	Q. A	part from the case that you were	
	4	A legal entities.	4		in, have you been involved in and	vour
	5	Q. Thank you for clarifying.	5	•	n here today, have you had any inv	•
	6	Have you ever testified as a witness	6	-	ner litigation involving Mr. Warner or	
	7	outside of the one deposition?	7	entities?	3	
	8	A. No.	8	A. N	o.	
	9	Q. Now, you said that you were involved in	9		s there any condition, either mental,	
	10	that other lawsuit as an officer. Were you	10		or physical, that would impair your a	
	11	involved in the decision to bring that lawsuit?	11		truthfully today?	
	12	A. No.	12	-	No.	
	13	Q. What is your involvement in that lawsuit	13		Are you taking medication of any kir	nd
	14	other than as an officer? Did you have any	14		ld impair your ability to testify	
	15	connection other than being deposed?	15	truthfully		
	16	A. No.	16	-	No.	
	17	Q. Have you ever been convicted of a crime?	17		And is there any medication that you	1
	18	A. No.	18		ave taken that you haven't taken in	
	19	Q. What e-mail address or addresses do you	19		ours that would impair your ability to	
	20	use?	20	testify tru		•
	21	A. My work e-mail address is	21	=	No.	
	22	chwang@tymail.com.	22		And have you taken any drugs or al	cohol
	23	Q. Do you have any e-mail addresses for any	23		st 24 hours?	COTIO
	24		24		No.	
	- '			,		
Ī	1	Page 18 secretary/treasurer?	1	Q. [Did you review any documents to pr	Page 20 epare
	2	A. I may be assigned to another e-mail	2		's deposition?	OP G. O
	3	address for Montecito Country Club, but that's all	3	-	BOLAND: Objection. That's a yes	or no
	4	forwarded to my tymail.com address.	4	question.		
	5	Q. Do you have any personal e-mail	5	•	BRUSTEIN: I don't believe that that	's a
	6	addresses that you use for any non-personal	6	proper of		. • •
	7	purposes, such as communicating with Mr. Warner?	7		BOLAND: Well, it's the objection I'm	า
	8	A. No.	8		It's a yes or no question, and then	
	9	Q. Do you have how many cell phones do	9	•	hings. It's a yes or no for right now	
	10	you have?	10	-	ou can answer.	-
	11	A. One personal cell phone and one work	11		BRUSTEIN: You cannot Mr. Bola	and we
	12	cell phone.	12		early on, and the question was did	
	13	Q. And do you do any business on your	13		nything. We do not need you to na	
	14	personal cell phone?	14	question	•	indio ino
	15	A. No.	15	•	ou have already interfered by answ	erina.
	16	Q. Does Mr. Warner have your personal cell	16		Iwang as to how she would like to	_
	17	phone number?	17		which she's already shown she's o	
	18	A. I don't believe so.	18		ness to answer the questions, and I	-
	19	Q. Do you have any social media presence?	19		you please not interfere.	
	20	A. No.	20		BOLAND: It's a yes or no question	
	21	Q. Are you on LinkedIn?	21		ou may you may answer.	-
	22	A. No.	22		BRUSTEIN: There are no speaking	י
	23	Q. How come?	23		ns and stop coaching the witness.	đ
- [20	Q. HOW COME:	23	ODJECTION	is and stop coaching the withess.	

24



A. I just choose not to be.

MR. BOLAND: I'm not coaching the witness,

April 14, 2023 21–24

Page 24

				Pag
1	counsel.	I'm protecting privilege.	There's a	

- 2 privilege line that could be breached here, and I'm
- 3 allowing her to go into it slowly. That's all.
- 4 You can get your answers. If you could please --
- 5 MR. BRUSTEIN: Excuse me, I would just ask for
- 6 clarification from the videographer if Mr. Boland
- 7 is also on camera for this deposition.
- 8 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: He is not on camera.
- 9 MR. BRUSTEIN: I would ask that he be part of
- 10 the video camera recording for this. It appears
- 11 that he wants to continue speaking in an improper
- 12 way, and I'd like that to be captured for the
- 13 record.
- 14 MR. BOLAND: I think I'm captured, but that's
- 15 fine. Go ahead.
- 16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 17 Q. Did you review any documents to prepare
- 18 for today's deposition?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. What documents did you review?
- 21 MR. BOLAND: Okay. I'm going to object as
- 22 privileged only to the extent that you reviewed
- 23 documents provided to you by counsel or with

of that that was with counsel or provided by

The other one is privileged.

counsel, please feel free to answer the question.

6 actually spoke in a recorded deposition where you

10 you're asking questions and taking depositions and

7 said it was completely fair game as long as it

8 wasn't asked where she got the source. So I

9 understand that you feel very differently when

MR. BRUSTEIN: That's actually not how you

24 counsel.

4

5

23

- Page 23
 A. I reviewed documents prior to today's
- 2 deposition. But --
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - Q. And --
- 5 A. -- it was really in preparation for what
- 6 was supposed to be scheduled for today, my
- 7 deposition as the corporate representative.
- 8 So the question is a little unclear to
- 9 me.

4

- 10 Q. And when you say as corporate
- 11 representative, are you referring to a 30(b)(6)
- 12 deposition?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Outside of -- and did any of those
- 15 documents refresh your recollection?
- 16 A. Some e-mails.
- 17 Q. Which e-mails refreshed your
- 18 recollection?
- 19 A. Just some e-mails exchanged between
- 20 myself and Four Seasons corporate.
- 21 Q. And did anything else refresh your
- 22 recollection other than e-mails?
- 23 A. No.
- 24 Q. Now --

Page 22

- e 1 A. May I take a break?
 - 2 Q. -- did you graduate from college?
 - 3 A. May I take a break?
 - 4 Q. You want to take a break?
 - 5 A. Yes.
 - 6 Q. We can take a break.
 - 7 A. Okay.
 - 8 Q. How long do you need?
 - 9 A. Just five minutes. Would that be okay?
 - 10 Q. Not a problem.
 - 11 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are --
 - 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - 13 Q. Do you want to come back at 10:31? Or,
 - 14 I guess, 9:31 for you.
 - 15 A. Okay.
 - 16 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going --
 - 17 MR. BRUSTEIN: I don't need an hour and five
 - 18 minutes.
 - 19 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: -- off the record at
 - 20 9:26 a.m.
 - 21 (WHEREUPON, a recess was had.)
 - 22 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the
 - 23 record at 9:31 a.m.
 - 24 MR. BOLAND: Did you want to clarify

If you did a review of documents outside

defending them, but there's a record for a reason. 11 12 MR. BOLAND: What you said was just not even 13 close to being true. 14 You may proceed. 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN: 16 Q. Ms. Hwang -- Ms. Hwang, I'm not asking 17 you if Mr. Boland or any other attorney provided 18 documents to you. I'm simply asking if you 19 reviewed any documents to prepare for today's 20 deposition. 21 MR. BOLAND: Oh, I think she answered. 22 Objection, asked and answered.

ESQUIREDESCRIPTION SOLUTIONS

24 BY THE WITNESS:

You can answer again.

April 14, 2023 25–28

something?

2 THE WITNESS: Yes. I'd like to clarify a

3 statement I made earlier.

4 You asked if I was involved in any

5 litigation. Just for completeness, I would like to

6 state that I personally, as an individual, am not

7 involved in any litigation. However, as a

8 corporate officer, there's some legal matters that

9 I am involved in.

10 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

11 Q. Thank you for pointing that out.

12 What legal matters are you involved in

13 as a corporate officer?

14 A. There's an open lawsuit against a

15 general contractor for installation of wallpaper at

16 Four Seasons Hotel New York.

17 Q. And what corporate entity are you acting

18 as a corporate officer in that litigation?

19 A. Hotel 57, LLC.

20 Q. And what is your corporate officer title

21 for Hotel 57, LLC?

22 A. Vice president/treasurer/secretary.

23 Q. And what is your involvement as a

24 corporate officer in that litigation?

Page 25 Page 27
A. He discussed it with his attorney, Greg

2 Scandaglia.

3 Q. After he discussed it with -- well,

4 without discussing any conversations he had with

5 his attorney, did you have conversations with

6 Mr. Warner about proceeding with litigation

7 involving wallpaper?

8 A. I don't recall.

Q. Well, was there any conversation had

10 before you ended up being the one responsible for

11 the wallpaper litigation for Hotel 57, LLC?

A. My conversation was through counsel.

13 Q. So you never spoke to Mr. Warner about

14 the decision to file or not file a lawsuit over

15 wallpaper?

16 A. There were discussions about the

17 wallpaper matter, but I don't recall if I spoke to

18 him exactly about his decision.

19 Q. And when was the wall -- do you mind if

20 we refer to that as the wallpaper lawsuit?

21 A. Sure.

23

6

22 Q. When was the wallpaper lawsuit filed?

I don't know the exact date.

24 Q. Was it in the six years that you were

Page 26

A. My -- my knowledge is institutional and

2 just rep -- just acting as a corporate officer and

3 owner's representative.

4 Q. Are you the point person for that

5 litigation for Hotel 57, LLC?

6 A. Can you clarify your question?

7 Q. Are you the person acting on behalf of

8 Hotel 57, LLC, as the corporate officer to make

9 sure that litigation is handled properly?

10 A. Yes.

1

11 Q. And were you involved in the decision to

12 file that lawsuit?

13 A. The owner made that decision to file the

14 lawsuit.

15 Q. And who's the owner that made that

16 decision?

19

17 MR. BOLAND: Objection, vague.

18 BY THE WITNESS:

A. I'm sorry. I'd like to state that it

20 was Mr. Warner.

21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

22 Q. And were you involved in conversations

23 with Mr. Warner about the decision to file that

24 lawsuit about the wallpaper?

Page 28

1 working as a corporate officer for Mr. Warner's

2 companies?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Do you know if it was before or after

5 March of 2020?

Yes, it was after.

7 Q. Is it still going on?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And where did you file that lawsuit?

10 MR. BOLAND: Objection, vague.

11 Just, counsel, are -- the "you," are you

12 referring to Ms. Hwang personally?

13 MR. BRUSTEIN: No, I'm referring to her in her

14 corporate officer role, but if she's a -- she's in

15 charge of the litigation for Hotel 57, LLC.

16 MR. BOLAND: Okay. So I'm going to object.

17 MR. BRUSTEIN: So --

18 MR. BOLAND: It's still value, use of the

19 term.

20 You can answer.

21 BY THE WITNESS:

A. I believe it's in the state of New York.

23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

24 Q. And is that state or federal court?



CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 29–32

Page 31

Page 32

A.	I don't know.
----	---------------

- 2 Q. And did you review the complaint before
- 3 it was filed in court?
- 4 A. Yes.

1

14

- 5 Q. And did you make sure that everything in
- 6 that complaint was accurate before starting a
- 7 lawsuit on behalf of Hotel 57, LLC?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And was it all accurate?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. You said legal matters. Were there
- 12 other legal matters that you were involved in
- 13 besides the wallpaper lawsuit?
 - A. Myself as an individual, no.
- 15 Q. As a corporate officer, were there other
- 16 legal matters that you were involved in?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. How many others?
- 19 A. I don't know exactly.
- 20 Q. More or less than five?
- 21 A. Less than five.
- 22 Q. What -- and is that less than five
- 23 including the wallpaper lawsuit?
- 24 A. Yes.

- 1 A. I don't know if the legal -- if the
- 2 legal entity is the same, but I believe so.
- 3 MR. BRUSTEIN: Mr. Boland, I'm going to ask
- 4 you to limit your objections to "objection." There
- 5 are not speaking objections, and I believe that
- 6 you're aware of that.
- 7 MR. BOLAND: I'm not speaking. I'm just
- 8 providing a legal basis. That's all.
- 9 MR. BRUSTEIN: And that is not necessary.
- 10 Some might call it coaching, and I'd rather not
- 11 involve the court, but you can certainly continue
- 12 to object.
- 13 MR. BOLAND: I will object as I see
- 14 appropriate under the rules in the Federal Rules of
- 15 Civil Procedure, counsel. Thank you.
- 16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 17 Q. Now, when you say that Ty Warner Hotels
- 18 & Resorts sued to terminate the management
- 19 agreement, what does that mean?
- 20 A. Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts wished to
- 21 terminate its agreement with Four Seasons as the
- 22 operator of the hotel.
- 23 Q. And when did Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts
- 24 initiate that lawsuit?

Page 30

1

- Q. And is that including this case?
- 2 A. Yes.

- 3 Q. So what is another lawsuit that you're
- 4 involved in as a corporate officer?
- 5 A. There's a -- there's a termination that
- 6 has been filed with Four Seasons.
- 7 Q. When you say "termination," what does
- 8 that mean?
- 9 A. Termination of management agreement.
- 10 Q. And who initiated that lawsuit?
- 11 A. Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts.
- 12 Q. And who did Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts
- 13 initiate a termination of management agreement
- 14 with?
- 15 A. Can you clarify your question?
- 16 Q. Did Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts sue
- 17 someone or a company or legal entity to terminate a
- 18 management agreement?
- 19 A. Four Seasons.
- 20 Q. Is that the same Four Seasons as in this
- 21 lawsuit?
- 22 MR. BOLAND: Objection, vague.
- 23 You can answer.
- 24 BY THE WITNESS:

- A. I believe it was either 2021 or '22.
- 2 Q. And when in 2021 do you believe it was?
- 3 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 4 BY THE WITNESS:
- 5 A. I don't recall.
- 6 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 7 Q. Why does Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts want
- 8 to terminate or end the contract with Four Seasons?
- 9 A. Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts believes that
- 10 operator's interests are not aligned with
- 11 ownership.
- 12 Q. Now, what hotel or hotels are the
- 13 management agreements at issue in that lawsuit?
- 14 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 15 BY THE WITNESS:
- 16 A. The two hotels would be Four Seasons
- 17 Hotel New York and Four Seasons Resort Santa
- 18 Barbara.
- 19 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 20 Q. Is Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts -- when
- 21 did you -- withdrawn.
- 22 Do you believe that the operator of Four
- 23 Seasons Hotel New York has violated the management
- 24 agreement?



April 14, 2023 33–36

SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS 33					
1	Page 33 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.	1	Q.	Did anyone?	Page 35
2	You can answer.	2	Α.	The I'll let you finish the question	n
3	MR. BRUSTEIN: We're going to have to call the	3	Q.	No, no, no, please. With Zoom, i	
4	court if you keep coaching.	4		fusing. So I don't mean to cut you	
5	MR. BOLAND: I'm not coaching the witness,	5	Α.	But my predecessor, the former of	
6	counsel. I'm just making an objection, and she can	6		al officer, however, she did.	
7	answer as she sees fit.	7	Q.	What was her name?	
8	MR. BRUSTEIN: You cannot comment on the	8	A.	Donna Snopek.	
9	question form. You can object. That's it.	9	Q.	When did she leave the company	/ or
10	MR. BOLAND: Have you ever made an objection	10	compa	•	
11	in court, counsel?	11	A.	2019.	
12	You may answer.	12	Q.	Do you know why she left?	
13	BY THE WITNESS:	13	A.	I don't know any reasons for her	
14	A. Can you repeat your question?	14	termin	•	
15	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	15	Q.	She was terminated?	
16	Q. Do you believe that the operator has	16	A.	Yes.	
17	violated the hotel management agreement with	17	Q.	And who terminated her employ	ment?
18	respect to Four Seasons Hotel New York?	18	A.	Mr. Warner.	
19	MR. BOLAND: Same objection.	19	Q.	Who?	
20	You can answer.	20	A.	The decision to terminate her wa	ıs
21	BY THE WITNESS:	21	Mr. Wa	arner, but I an attorney was hire	d to
22	A. Yes.	22	handle	the termination personally.	
23	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	23	Q.	Did she work in more than ten co	ompanies
24	Q. How do you believe that they have	24	or corp	porate entities for Mr. Warner?	
	Page 34			N/	Page 36
1	violated it?	1		Yes.	
2	A. I don't believe that Four Seasons was	2		And was she terminated from all of	tnose
3	acting as an agent in the best interests of the	3	•	ite entities at the same time?	
4	ownership.	4		Yes.	
5	Q. By doing what?	5		Prior to her termination, did she ha	
6	A. An agent has a duty to maximize the hotel's profitability, and that was not the case.	6 7	entities	ne title in each one of those corpora	te
l .	Q. What when did you first believe that	_	_	Yes.	
8	the operator, Four Seasons, was not doing its duty	8	_	What was her corporate title back t	hon?
9	to maximize profits for the owner?	10	Q.	. BOLAND: Objection.	ileli:
11	A. I need you to clarify if you mean my	11		E WITNESS:	
12	belief as an individual.	12		Her corporate officer title was the s	ame
13	Q. Sure. As an individual, when did you	13		e, vice president/treasurer/secretary	
14	first believe?	14		e, vice president neasuren secretary R. BRUSTEIN:	·
15	A. 2017.	15		You testified that you've been wor	kina
16	Q. And why do you believe the interests are	16		Warner for approximately six years	-
17	not aligned?	17		e; is that correct?	, .
18	A. Upon review of financials, I do not	18	A.	Yes.	
	oponionon or initialiolato, i do not		,		

19

21

22

24

23 termination?

20 title prior to her termination?



23 Four Seasons back in 2017?

A. I, myself, did not.

21 it should be.

22

19 believe that the assets for the hotel is being

20 managed properly and the expenses are higher than

Q. And did you raise these concerns to the

Q. So did you and Ms. Snopek share the same

Q. What was your title prior to her

A. Can you repeat the question?

April 14, 2023 37–40

Page 39

Page 40

		Page 3
Q.	Prior to Ms. Snopek's termination i	in

- 2 2019, what title or titles did you have for the
- 3 Warner entities?
- 4 A. I was not an officer of Warner entities.
- 5 Q. What was your position in the companies
- 6 prior to her 2019 termination?
- 7 A. I was the senior financial analyst for
- 8 Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts.
- 9 Q. Did you work for the other corporate
- 10 entities or just Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts back
- 11 before Ms. Snopek was terminated?
- 12 A. I worked for Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts.
- 13 Q. So you have only been a corporate
- 14 officer for approximately 30 Warner entities since
- 15 2019?
- 16 A. Since 2020.
- 17 Q. When in 2020 did you become a corporate
- 18 officer for approximately 30 of Mr. Warner's
- 19 entities?
- 20 A. I don't recall.
- 21 Q. Did you have to apply to get this
- 22 promotion?
- 23 A. No.
- 24 Q. Who promoted you to corporate officer

- 1 the day-to-day operations of those 30 to 40
- 2 entities before you were appointed an officer in
- 3 them?
- 4 A. I -- I supported Ms. Snopek, and I was
- 5 involved in communication with some of the entities
- 6 and some of the businesses.
- 7 Q. Can you name all of the corporate
- 8 entities that you're an officer in?
 - A. I can't name them off the top of my
- 10 head.

9

- 11 Q. How many can you name?
- 12 A. Maybe about ten.
- 13 Q. Why don't you name the ten that you can
- 14 recall being a corporate officer of.
- 15 A. Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts; Hotel 57,
- 16 LLC; 1260 BB Property, LLC; San Ysidro BB Property,
- 17 LLC; Montecito Club Property, LLC; A Fairway
- 18 Property, LLC; Sandpiper Golf Course or Golf Club
- 19 Property, LLC; Hot Springs, LLC; Tell Road, LLC; TY
- 20 Mex, LLC.
- 21 I believe that's ten.
- 22 Q. Do you remember any others?
- 23 A. It's a complex legal structure. It
- 24 would take me a while to jog my memory on all legal

Page 38

- 1 for the 30 to 40 Warner entities?
- 2 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 3 BY THE WITNESS:
- 4 A. Mr. Warner.
- 5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 6 Q. Did he discuss each one of the entities
- 7 individually with you or collectively?
- 8 A. He did not discuss them individually
- 9 with me.
- 10 Q. Did you know that you were going to be
- 11 corporate officer for 30 to 40 different entities?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. How did you come to learn that you would
- 14 be a corporate officer for 30 to 40 corporate
- 15 entities?
- 16 A. I was appointed as replacement for Donna
- 17 Snopek.
- 18 Q. Did you have any knowledge of the 30 to
- 19 40 entities before you were appointed a corporate
- 20 officer in each one of them?
- 21 A. Yes. I was aware that she was the
- 22 legal, or the officer of all the legal entities,
- 23 the 30 to 40 legal entities.
- 24 Q. But did you have involvement in any of

- 1 entities.
- 2 Q. Are you a corporate officer for more
- 3 than a hundred Warner entities?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. I'm sorry, did you say no?
 - A. No.

- 7 Q. Now, for the corporate entities that you
- 8 named, do they all have employees?
- 9 A. No.
- 10 Q. Of the ones that you named, which ones
- 11 have actual employees?
- 12 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 13 BY THE WITNESS:
- 14 A. I believe all of them do except for
- 15 Hotel 57, LLC.
- 16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 17 Q. Hotel 57, LLC, has zero employees?
- 18 A. I believe all the entity -- all the
- 19 employees are in -- under a different legal entity.
- 20 Q. And what's the front legal entity?
- 21 A. Hotel 57 Services, LLC.
- 22 Q. And how many employees does Hotel 57
- 23 Services, LLC, have?
- 24 A. I don't know.



April 14, 2023 41–44

SE	ELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASO	NS	HOTE	ELS	41–44
	Page 41				Page 43
1	Q. Back in January of 2020, how many	1		BOLAND: Object to the form.	
2	employees did Hotel 57 Services have?	2		WITNESS:	
3	A. I don't know the exact number.	3		As I indicated, I don't know the exa	
4	Q. Was it more or less than 500?	4		of employees. This is just a guess	s that I'm
5	A. I would have to guess. If I was to	5	giving y		
6	guess, I would say it was more than 500.	6		BRUSTEIN:	
7	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Mr. Brustein	7		And what's that based on?	
8	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	8		Based on my previous experience,	
9	Q. As a corporate officer, is it important	9	_	ng metrics and the performance of	
10	to know the number of employees?	10	Q.	Now, where did you go to college	?
11	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	11	Α.	I went to University of Illinois at	
12		12			
13	•	13	Q.	And did you graduate?	
14	The number of employees vary.	14	Α.	Yes.	
15	, 5 1	15	Q.	What did you graduate with a deg	ree in?
16	,	16	Α.	Accounting.	
17	•	17	Q.	And what year did you graduate?	
18	•		Α.	2001.	
19	want to get on the record. My boss wanted me to	19	Q.	And where did you work after a	
20	clarify for you that this is okay with the two of	20		t any degrees after graduating from	n college?
21	you he says it's prejudiced by the jury having	21	Α.	Yes.	
22	, , , ,	22	Q.	What other degrees?	
23	,	23	Α.	Master's in accounting.	
24	time this is the last time I will ask you,	24	Q.	And when did you get that degree	?
_	Page 42				Page 44
1	everything is good? The shot has both of them in	1	Α.	2002.	
	it. I just	2	Q.	And where did you get that degre	ee?
3	MR. BRUSTEIN: We can have Ms. Hwang in the	3	Α.	University of Illinois Chicago.	
4	in the shot by herself.	4	Q.	And where did you work after gra	aduating
5	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. Give me just a	5		ur Master's.	
6	second.	6	Α.	ConAgra Foods.	
7	We are can we go off and I'll reframe	7	Q.	I'm sorry?	
	it.	8	_	ConAgra Foods.	
9	We are going off the record at 9:57 a.m.	9	Q.	What position did you hold for the	at
10	(WHEREUPON, discussion was had	10	compa	•	
11	off the record.)	11	Α.	Staff accountant.	
12		12	Q.	And did you get any degrees aft	er your
13		13		's in accounting?	
14		14	Α.	No.	
15	• •	15	Q.	How long did you work as the ac	ccountant
16	, , ,	16		nAgra Foods?	
17	many employees do you estimate that they had back	17	Α.	About two years.	
18	•	18	Q.	Why did you stop working?	
19		19	A.	The company was going through	n some
20	•	20		on, and I left to seek opportunity	
21	for, you know, November 2019, you know, New Year's	21	elsewh		1
22	,	22		And so what opportunity did you	seek
23	was the low point of employees at Hotel 57	23	next?		

24



24 Services, LLC?

A. I went to work for Nicor Gas.

April 14, 2023 45–48

SE	LENA	STALEY -against- FOUR SEASO	NS	HOTE	ELS	45–48
		Page 45	_		\\//bat.usa.usummalatiamahin lika	Page 47
1	Q.	And what's that?	1		What was your relationship like	with
2	Α.	That's a gas utility company.	2		rner back in the early 2000s?	_
3	Q.	What did you do for them?	3		There was no relationship. I wa	ıS
4	Α.	I was a staff accountant.	4		ced to him.	
5	Q.	And how big of a company is that?	5		Who introduced you to him?	
6	Α.	It provides gas for Northern Illinois.	6	Α.	My mother.	
7	It's larg		7	Q.	Did you get his phone number v	when she
8	Q.	3 ,	8		ced you to him?	
9	Α.	Seven years.	9	Α.	No.	
10		And why did you stop working there?	10	Q.	Did you exchange e-mails with	Mr. Warner
11	A.	It was acquired by another company, and	11	-	your mother introduced him?	
12		rporate function was being transitioned to	12		No.	
13	its hea	adquarters out of state.	13	Q.	Did you ever see Mr. Warner o	utside of
14	Q.	, 3	14	your pa	arents' store?	
15	A.	I went to work at Navistar.	15	A.		
16	Q.	•	16	Q.	How many times did you see M	1r. Warner at
17	A.	I was a financial analyst.	17	your pa	arents' store?	
18	Q.	And how long did you work for them?	18	A.	Maybe three times.	
19	A.	Two years.	19	Q.	So why did he contact you mor	e than a
20	Q.	And then what did you do?	20		e later?	
21	A.	I went to work for TransUnion.	21	MR	. BOLAND: Objection, foundation	n.
22	Q.	And what did you do for TransUnion?	22	BY TH	IE WITNESS:	
23	A.	I was a senior financial analyst.	23	A.	He was sharing, and he asked	me what I
24	Q.	And how long did you work there?	24	did. A	nd I said I work for I'm a financ	cial
		Page 46				Page 48
1	Α.	Three years.	1	-	t. So he just struck up a conver	rsation. It
2		And then where did you go?	2	-	st small talk.	
3	Α.	I went to ConAgra Foods.	3	_	R. BRUSTEIN:	
4	Q.	Is that the same ConAgra Foods that you	4	Q.	That was back in early 2000?	
5		een at initially?	5	Α.	No, in 2016.	
6	Α.		6	Q.	How did you meet him again i	
7	Q.	Why did you go back to them?	7	Α.	I was visiting my parents' store	e, and he
8		It was moving its headquarters back to		happer		
9	Chicag		9	Q.	And	
10	Q.	And so what year was it that you went	10	A.	to come in.	
11	back t	o ConAgra Foods?	11	Q.	I'm sorry. Continue.	
12	Α.		12	A.	What was your question?	
13	Q.	And how long did you work there	13	Q.	So I asked how you met him	
14	Α.	Three months.	14		you saying that you met him ag	ain at your
15	Q.	the second time?	15	parent	ts' store in 2016?	
16		Why only three months?	16	A.	'''	•
17	Α.	Mr. Warner approached me with an	17	parent	ts' store, and I was there visiting	g, helping
18	oppor	tunity to work for his company.	18	out.		
19	Q.	Had you been speaking to Mr. Warner	19	Q.	And did he remember you fro	m ten years
20	since	back in early 2000?	20	prior?		
21	A.	No. I was introduced to him in	21	A.	I don't know.	
00	_	3.47	00	_	D'.l	

22

23 24



24 I did not see him for years.

Q. When were you --

A. -- mid-2000, but I did not speak to him.

22

Q. And when you spoke to him in 2016, did

Q. Did you remember him?

A. I knew of him.

1

5

CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 49–52

Page 51

you exchange phone numbers?	

- 2 A. He gave me his phone number when he
- 3 offered me a position in his company. I did not
- 4 give him --
- 5 Q. He offered you --
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. He -- he gave you his phone number in
- 8 your parents' store the first time you saw him back
- 9 in 2016?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of that
- 12 question.
- 13 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 14 Q. What number did he give you?
- 15 A. His cell phone number.
- 16 Q. And was that a personal or a business
- 17 phone number?
- 18 A. It's his business phone number.
- 19 Q. And did he offer you a specific position
- 20 in his company?
- 21 A. Financial analyst.
- 22 Q. And did he tell you which company you
- 23 would be working for?
- 24 A. His hotels company.

- A. Yes.
- 2 Q. So why did you quit your job that you
- 3 had worked for once before to go work for
- 4 Mr. Warner?
 - A. It sounded like a great opportunity.
- 6 Q. What did he tell you about the
- 7 opportunity that made it sound great?
- 8 A. He said he needed a financial analyst to
- 9 look over his businesses and review the performance
- 10 of his hotels.
- 11 Q. Were you -- and is that what you did
- 12 once you went to work for Ty Warner Hotels &
- 13 Resorts?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Are you part of the reason that -- or
- 16 the work that you did, the reason that Donna Snopek
- 17 said Four Seasons was not upholding its part of the
- 18 hotel management agreements?
- 19 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of that
- 20 question.
- 21 BY THE WITNESS:
- 22 A. Can you clarify your question.
- 23 MR. WAGNER: Same objection for me.
- 24 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

Page 50

6

- 1 Q. And did you know what hotels he owned at
- 2 that point?
- 3 A. He mentioned to me -- he informed me
- 4 that he owned two Four Seasons.
- 5 Q. And which ones did he say?
- 6 A. New York and Santa Barbara.
- 7 Q. And what is Mr. Warner's business phone
- 8 number that he gave you?
- 9 A. Are you asking for his phone number?
- 10 Q. I'm asking you for the business phone
- 11 number that he gave you, yes.
- 12 A. I don't know his phone number by heart.
- 13 It's in my -- it's recorded in my phone.
- 14 Q. Do you know what area code it is?
- 15 A. I believe it's 630.
- 16 Q. All right. We can leave a space in the
- 17 record and when you have an opportunity to review
- 18 the transcript, you can fill that in.
- Now, did he offer you a specific salary
- 20 when he told you that he wanted you to work for his
- 21 company?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. You had just started at a new company
- 24 that you worked for previously, right?

- Page 52 Q. Was your analysis that you conducted as
- 2 a financial analyst for Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts
- 3 part of the basis that Donna Snopek used to claim
- 4 that Four Seasons was not honoring the hotel
- 5 management agreement?
 - A. I don't know what Ms. Snopek used.
 - Q. Did you make findings as a financial
- 8 analyst about with whether or not Four Seasons was
- 9 honoring the hotel management agreement?
- 10 A. I reviewed the financial results, but I
- 11 didn't indicate one way or the other.
- 12 Q. Did you provide an analysis of the
- 13 financial results?
- MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of that one.
- 15 BY THE WITNESS:
- 16 A. I reported the financial results to
- 17 Ms. Snopek.
- 18 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 19 Q. Did you also provide the results to
- 20 Mr. Warner?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. At the time that Mr. Warner hired you,
- 23 did he tell you that he was unhappy with the
- 24 arrangement he had with Four Seasons and the



April 14, 2023 53–56

Page 55

Dr	00 52
Го	age 53
management of the two Four Seasons propertie	s he

- 2 owned?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. Is Mr. Warner unhappy with the
- 5 management of the two Four Seasons properties he
- 6 owns?
- 7 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.
- 8 You can answer.
- 9 BY THE WITNESS:
- 10 A. I don't know how he feels.
- 11 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 12 Q. Have you discussed it with him?
- 13 A. I have talked to him about the hotel's
- 14 performance.
- 15 Q. You testified that as a corporate
- 16 officer, you initiated litigation to terminate the
- 17 hotel management agreement against Four Seasons.
- 18 MR. BOLAND: Objection. I think that
- 19 misstates her testimony.
- 20 BY THE WITNESS:
- 21 A. That's -- that's not what I said.
- 22 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 23 Q. Were you involved in the decision to
- 24 initiate the lawsuit as a corporate officer to

- 1 more profitable?
- 2 A. No.
- 3 Q. So what did he tell you about you,
- 4 management of the hotel or the Four Seasons
- 5 managing the hotel? What did he mean by that?
- 6 MR. BOLAND: I'm going to -- I'm only going to
- 7 object, counsel, because you keep using the word
- 8 "you." And I just don't know what you're referring
- 9 to. I don't think it's clear.
- 10 MR. BRUSTEIN: Thank you.
- 11 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 12 Q. Mr. Warner told you that we need to
- 13 manage the hotel, right?
- 14 A. Just to be clear, Four Seasons, as the
- 15 operator, manages the hotel, and I assess the
- 16 performance and oversee the operations. But it is
- 17 Four Seasons who's managing the hotel.
- 18 Q. But when you spoke to Mr. Warner about
- 19 your assessments, you said that he told you, tell
- 20 me if I'm wrong, that we need to manage the hotel.
- 21 Did I get that right?
- 22 A. I meant that we need to have the
- 23 operator improve their management of the hotel's
- 24 performance. This --

Page 54

1

- 1 terminate the hotel management agreements for the
- 2 two Four Season properties?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. Do you know if Mr. Warner approves of
- 5 terminating the hotel management agreements for the
- 6 two Four Season properties?
- 7 A. Yes. He approved the termination.
- 8 Q. As someone that did a financial analysis
- 9 of those two properties, did you discuss your
- 10 analysis with Mr. Warner before the termination
- 11 litigation began?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. What did you tell him?
- 14 A. To be clear, it wasn't just my analysis.
- 15 There were other third-party experts who were
- 16 engaged to assess the hotel's performance.
- 17 Q. What did you tell him?
- 18 A. I told him the hotel's not profitable.
- 19 Q. What did Mr. Warner tell you?
- 20 A. He said we need to -- to manage the
- 21 hotel or have Four Seasons manage the hotel, that
- 22 we stop losing money.
- 23 Q. Did Mr. Warner tell you that if you
- 24 manage the hotel without Four Seasons, it could be

- Q. What did you -- sorry.
- 2 A. I use the term "we" loosely, because
- 3 it's Four Seasons, again, managing the hotel's
- 4 day-to-day operations.
- 5 Q. What did you do to try and get the Four
- 6 Seasons to manage the hotel better?
- 7 A. There was a rate strategy that was
- 8 implemented under Mr. Warner's direction.
- 9 Q. When was that?
- 10 A. I believe it was 2018.
- 11 Q. Did that satisfy Mr. Warner's concerns
- 12 about the operation of the Four Seasons Hotel New
- 13 York?
- 14 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.
- 15 You can answer.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 A. It satisfied his wish to have a pricing
- 18 strategy in place. I don't know if it satisfied
- 19 him overall.
- 20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 21 Q. For purposes of the deposition, can we
- 22 refer to the Four Seasons Hotel New York as FSNY?
- 23 A. I think I would prefer to make a
- 24 distinction and say property level team for the



April 14, 2023 57–60

Page 59

Page 60

		Page 57
1	employees that are actually at the hotel and	

- 2 managing the hotel, because there's also a
- 3 distinction with Four Seasons corporate employees
- 4 who are also involved in management of the hotel.
- 5 Q. I'm just talking about the hotel itself,
- 6 the physical --
- 7 A. The hotel itself? You mean the physical
- 8 building?
- Q. Yes, managing the building.
- 10 A. Okay.
- 11 MR. BOLAND: The --
- 12 BY THE WITNESS:
- 13 A. So you want it -- so you want to --
- 14 okay.
- 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 16 Q. I'll keep referring to everything as
- 17 Four Seasons Hotel New York. That's fine.
- 18 Now, did Mr. Warner have any more
- 19 complaints about the management of the Four Seasons
- 20 Hotel New York after the price structure was put
- 21 into place?
- 22 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 23 BY THE WITNESS:
- 24 A. There were rates that he was not

- 1 know, are located in -- in various states and
- 2 cities. The legal entities do not have individual
- 3 offices.
- 4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 5 Q. Does Hotel 57, LLC, have a principal
- 6 place of business at 280 Chestnut Ave. in Westmont,
- 7 Illinois?
- 8 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 9 BY THE WITNESS:
- 10 A. I believe the business address is
- 11 280 Chestnut, Westmont, Illinois.
- 12 Q. And is that the principal place of
- 13 business for Hotel 57, LLC?
- 14 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 15 BY THE WITNESS:
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 18 Q. Hotel 57 Services, LLC, does it have a
- 19 principal place of business at 280 Chestnut Avenue,
- 20 Westmont, Illinois?
- 21 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 22 BY THE WITNESS:
- 23 A. Yes. Again, the business address for
- 24 Hotel 57, LLC, I believe, is at 280 Chestnut

- 1 satisfied with as it related to group and corporate
- 2 business.
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 4 Q. Did he tell you why he wasn't satisfied?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Now, let me back up for a second. Where
- 7 was your office located when you first began
- 8 working for Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts?
- 9 A. 280 Chestnut Avenue, Westmont, Illinois.
- 10 Q. And is that the same principal place of
- 11 business for each of the other corporate entities
- 12 that you're an officer in?
- 13 A. Yes. Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts is
- 14 based in 280 Chestnut Avenue in Westmont, Illinois.
- 15 Q. But you testified that there are about
- 16 30 to 40 corporate entities that you're an officer
- 17 in, right?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Do all of those 30 to 40 entities have
- 20 the same principal place of business as Ty Warner
- 21 Hotels & Resorts?
- 22 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 23 BY THE WITNESS:
- 24 A. So place of business, as you already

- 1 Avenue.
- 2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- Q. And is it also the principal place of
- 4 business for Hotel 57 Services, LLC?
- 5 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 6 BY THE WITNESS:
- 7 A. Can you clarify what you mean by
- 8 principal place of business?
- 9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 10 Q. Have you ever heard that phrase used
- 11 before?
- 12 A. Yes. But I'm not sure if I'm getting
- 13 the distinction.
- 14 Q. Have you ever used that phrase before?
- 15 A. I don't know if I've used that phrase
- 16 before.
- 17 Q. What do you understand that phrase to
- 18 mean?
- 19 A. The business address.
- 20 Q. So is the principal place of business
- 21 for Hotel 57 Services, LLC, 280 Chestnut Ave.,
- 22 Westmont, Illinois?
- 23 MR. BOLAND: Same objection.
- 24 BY THE WITNESS:



April 14, 2023 61–64

Page 63

Page 64

1	Δ	V۵c	

- 2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 3 Q. Why was Mr. Warner not satisfied with
- 4 the pricing structure for Hotel 57 -- for Four
- 5 Seasons Hotel New York?
- 6 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.
- 7 BY THE WITNESS:
- 8 A. So his pricing strategy related to the
- 9 transient business, but the group business rates
- 10 were rather low.
- 11 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 12 Q. When you were a financial analyst for Ty
- 13 Warner Hotels & Resorts, did you meet regularly
- 14 with Mr. Warner?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. And did you meet in person or on the
- 17 phone or something else?
- 18 A. Usually in person.
- 19 Q. Did you call him on his cell phone?
- A. He usually called me.
- 21 Q. And did he usually call you from the
- 22 business cell phone number that he had initially
- 23 given you or some other number?
- 24 A. Business cell phone number.

- Page 61 1 A. Katy@tymail.com.
 - 2 Q. Did you send it to any other e-mail
 - 3 addresses?

4

12

- A. No.
- 5 Q. Now, did you regularly send e-mails to
- 6 Mr. Warner about issues as they came up?
- 7 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 8 BY THE WITNESS:
- 9 A. I gave him a daily report of Four
- 10 Seasons Hotel New York.
- 11 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - Q. And was that in e-mail format --
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. -- or as an attachment?
- 15 A. I believe it was -- well, it was sent
- 16 through e-mail. It may have been in the body of
- 17 the e-mail and also as an attachment.
- 18 Q. Do you still give him those kind of
- 19 reports today?
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. When did you stop giving him those
- 22 reports?
- 23 A. I don't recall the year exactly.
- 24 Q. Was it before or after the hotel shut

Page 62

- 1 Q. Did he ever leave you voice mails?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Did you communicate with Mr. Warner by
- 4 e-mail?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Did he use the e-mail address that
- 7 you've given that was a tymail or did he have a
- 8 different e-mail address that he contacted you at?
- 9 A. Tymail.
- 10 Q. Now, when you did the financial analysis
- 11 for Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts about the management
- 12 of Four Seasons Hotel New York, did you do that in
- 13 some sort of report?
- 14 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 15 BY THE WITNESS:
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 18 Q. And did you e-mail a copy of that report
- 19 to Mr. Warner?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. What e-mail address did you send it to?
- 22 A. You want his work e-mail address?
- 23 Q. I want whatever e-mail address you sent
- 24 it to?

- 1 down in March of 2020?
- 2 A. It was before.
- 3 Q. Why did you stop giving him e-mail
- 4 reports?

- 5 A. He said he didn't need it anymore.
 - Q. Did you still continue to e-mail with
- 7 him about updates on the hotel even if it wasn't a
- 8 daily report?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Do you still e-mail with Mr. Warner
- 11 about the hotel?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. When is the last time you e-mailed with
- 14 Mr. Warner about the hotel?
- 15 A. About Four Seasons Hotel New York?
- 16 Q. Yes, about Four Seasons Hotel New York.
- 17 A. It may have been a few weeks ago.
- 18 Q. Did you search your e-mails for
- 19 discovery related to this case?
- 20 A. I did not. The IT team did that. I did
- 21 not perform the search.
- 22 Q. Now, you testified that you reviewed
- 23 e-mails that refreshed your memory. Did any of
- 24 those e-mails involve communications you had



CATHY HWANG

April 14, 2023

SE	LENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASO	NS	
1	Page 65 directly with Mr. Warner?	1	Page 67 documents you printed out since this litigation
2	A. No.	2	
3	Q. Have you e-mailed with Mr. Warner about	3	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
		4	BY THE WITNESS:
5	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	5	A. Yes.
6	BY THE WITNESS:	6	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
7	A. I don't recall. It may have been a	7	Q. And did you understand that you have an
	phone call.	8	obligation as an officer when litigation is
	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	9	involved not to destroy corporate documents related
10	Q. When you e-mail with Mr. Warner, does he	10	
11	respond back?	11	A. Yes.
12	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	12	
13	BY THE WITNESS:	13	
14	A. Yes.	14	
15	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	15	
16	Q. And is he quick to respond to your	16	•
17	e-mails, or do you need to follow-up?	17	-
18	MR. BOLAND: Same objection.	18	•
19	BY THE WITNESS:	19	
20	A. It varies.	20	•
21	MR. BOLAND: Evan, we're coming up on about an	21	MR. BOLAND. Tean. MR. BRUSTEIN: how long do you want to
22	hour. I'm just saying, suggesting an hour since we		take?
23	last broke. Whenever it's a good time for you.	23	
24	MR. BRUSTEIN: Sure. Just a few more minutes.	_	Just every hour or so is good.
	WIN. BINOOTEIN. Outc. Gust a few more minutes.	27	•
1	Page 66 MR. BOLAND: Whenever it's good for you.	1	Page 68 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going off the record
2	MR. BRUSTEIN: Thank you.		at 10:30 a.m.
3	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	3	(WHEREUPON, a recess was had.)
4	Q. Now, when you have reports and documents	4	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the
5	to share with Mr. Warner, how does he like to		record at 10:45 a.m.
6	review them?	6	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
7	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	7	Q. Ms. Hwang, are you ready to continue?
8	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	8	A. Yes.
9	Q. Has Mr I'll rephrase it.	9	Q. And did you speak to anyone during the
10	Has Mr. Warner indicated a preference	10	break?
11	for how he likes to receive large exhibits or	11	A. Counsel.
12	attachments to e-mails?	12	Q. I'm not asking you what the
13	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	13	communication was, but did you speak to anyone
14	BY THE WITNESS:	14	during the break?
15	A. Yes, he likes to review them on paper.	15	A. Yes. I spoke to Mr. Boland.
16	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	16	Q. Now, earlier you testified that
17	Q. And does he have you print them out or	17	Ms. Snopek was terminated. What is your
18	do you just e-mail to him and then he handles	18	understanding of the reason that she was
19	printing it out on his own somehow?	19	
20	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	20	A. I was not given the reason.
20	WIK. BOLAND. Object to the form.	20	A. I was not given the reason.

21

22

24

23 BY THE WITNESS:

A. I don't know.



Q. And have you been maintaining all of the

21 BY THE WITNESS:

23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

A. I print it out.

Q. What did you believe the reason to be?

MR. BOLAND: Sorry about that.

April 14, 2023 69 - 72

SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASO	ONS HOTELS	69–72
Page 69		Page 71
1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	1 A. Assistant secretary. 2 Q. Is it the same title for each on	o of the
Q. Had you had any concerns about3 Ms. Snopek's job performance up until that point?	2 Q. Is it the same title for each on 3 entities?	e or the
4 A. No.	4 A. Yes.	
5 Q. Now, you testified that there was other)
6 litigation that you were involved in, and you	5 Q. Does Mr. Hicks report to you? 6 A. Yes.	
7 mentioned the hotel management agreement and you		ietant
8 mentioned the wallpaper lawsuit.	8 secretary?	istant
9 Were there any other lawsuits that you	9 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	
10 were involved in as a corporate officer?	10 BY THE WITNESS:	
11 A. Yes. There's a wage-an-hour lawsuit for	11 A. I don't know.	
12 San Ysidro Ranch.	12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	
13 Q. And is which company is being sued in	13 Q. Was he an assistant secretar	v hefore vou
14 that lawsuit?	14 were appointed secretary?	y bololo you
15 A. San Ysidro BB Property.	15 A. Yes.	
16 Q. And what is your role in that	16 Q. And what is his background?	
17 litigation?	17 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form	
18 A. I'm just the officer of the legal	18 BY THE WITNESS:	•
19 entity.	19 A. He is an employee of Ty War	ner Hotels &
20 Q. Are there any other officers in that	20 Resorts.	
21 legal entity?	21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	
22 A. Yes.	22 Q. How long has he been emplo	ved by Ty
23 Q. How many?	23 Warner Hotels & Resorts?	, , ,
24 A. Two others.	24 A. 19 years.	
Page 70	1 Q. Do you know why he reports	Page 72
2 A. Mr. Warner and Joseph Hicks.	2 instead of you reporting to him?	to you
3 Q. What is Mr. Warner's position in that	3 A. Mr. Warner appointed me to t	he chief
4 entity?	4 financial officer, and he has wanted J	
5 A. President.	5 to report to me.	осор
6 Q. Does he have any other titles?	6 Q. And do you report to Mr. War	ner?
7 A. I don't recall.	7 A. Yes.	
8 Q. And just for the record, when you say	8 Q. Is the reporting structure the	same for
9 "Mr. Warner," what is his full legal name?	9 each of the 30 to 40 legal entities that	
10 A. H. Ty Warner.	10 involved in?	•
11 Q. And is H. his full legal first name?	11 A. Yes.	
12 A. I think it's Harold Ty Warner.	12 Q. Does Mr. Warner have final	
13 Q. Now, is so for purposes of this, are	13 decision-making authority for each of	the legal
14 you okay with me calling him Mr. Warner?	14 entities?	-
15 A. Yes.	15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form	١.
16 Q. Is Mr. Warner the president of each o	-	
17 the other entities that you're an officer in?	17 A. Yes.	
	1	

Q. What is Mr. Hicks' position in each of

Is he an officer in each of the entities

- 20 decision, do you have the ability to overrule? 21 A. No.
- 22

19

18 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

- Q. Do you bring all decisions to
- 23 Mr. Warner?
- 24 MR. BOLAND: Objection. Object to the form.

Q. If you disagree with Mr. Warner about a



A. Yes.

20 the entities?

18

19

CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS April 14, 2023 73 - 76

Page 75

Page 76

1 BY THE WITNESS:

- 2 A. All and every single decision, for every
- 3 business, for all of his properties?
- 4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 5 Q. Yes.
- 6 A. No.
- 7 Q. What type of decisions do you not need
- 8 authority to bring to Mr. Warner?
- MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. 9
- 10 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. I guess materiality of, you know, a 11
- 12 simple invoice I'm not going to ask Mr. Warner for
- 13 his approval.
- 14 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 15 Q. Is there a dollar threshold that you
- need to request permission from Mr. Warner?
- 17
- 18 Q. Would you request permission from
- 19 Mr. Warner for a \$5,000 item?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Objection. Object to the form.
- 21 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. It depends on the subject matter and --22
- 23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 24 Q. Is it possible --

- Q. Now, how often do you speak to
- Mr. Warner on the phone?
- MR. BOLAND: Objection. 3
- BY THE WITNESS:
- 5 A. It -- it varies.
- BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- Q. Do you speak to Mr. Warner every week? 7
- 8 MR. BOLAND: Same objection, overbroad.
- BY THE WITNESS:
- 10 A. Not every week.
- 11 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - Q. Do you speak to Mr. Warner most weeks?
- MR. BOLAND: Objection. Object to the form. 13
- 14 BY THE WITNESS:
- 15 A. What do you mean by "most weeks"?
- 16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 17 Q. Would you say that on any given day,
- 18 there's a 50 percent chance or better that you will
- talk to Mr. Warner?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 21 BY THE WITNESS:
- 22 A. It's -- it really depends on what's
- 23 going on that day. Mr. Warner could be reaching
- 24 out to me at any point in time. I -- I don't know.

- A. -- his involvement with --
- 2 MR. BOLAND: I think she wasn't finished yet.
- 3 MR. BRUSTEIN: My apologies.
- 4 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. It depends on the subject matter and his 5
- 6 involvement.
- 7 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 8 Q. Is it possible that you might need
- 9 Mr. Warner's authority for some purchases or
- 10 invoices as low as \$5,000?
- 11 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 12 BY THE WITNESS:
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 15 Q. Would it be fair to say that if he
- 16 required approval for something as low as -- well,
- 17 withdrawn.
- 18 Do you consider \$5,000 to be a high or
- 19 low amount of money in the scope of the types of
- 20 deals that you're doing for Mr. Warner's companies?
- 21 A. Again, it's really not -- it's sometime
- 22 the materiality and the dollar threshold, but it's
- 23 also his wish to be involved in certain decision
- 24 making.

- BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 2 Q. Does Mr. Warner reach out to you by
- 3 e-mail?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Does he reach out to you by cell phone?
- 6
- 7 Q. Do you have Zoom meetings or Teams
- meetings or other types of videoconferencing
- meetings with him?
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. So is it fair to say that the
- 12 communication you have with him is either on the
- phone or by e-mail or, I guess, old fashion mail?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Approximately how many e-mails a week do
- 16 you exchange on average with Mr. Warner?
- 17 MR. BOLAND: Objection, overbroad.
- 18 You can answer.
- 19 BY THE WITNESS:
- 20 A. Again, it varies.
- 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 22 Q. You testified earlier that the last time
- 23 you saw Mr. Warner was approximately January
- 24 of 2020?



April 14, 2023 77-80

Page 80

1	Λ	Yes.
	Α.	169.

- 2 Q. Prior to that, how frequently were you
- 3 seeing him in person?
- 4 MR. BOLAND: Objection, overbroad.
- 5 You can answer.
- 6 BY THE WITNESS:
- 7 A. Every week, at least a few times a week.
- 8 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 9 Q. Did you regularly schedule meetings, or
- 10 was it just when things came up?
- 11 A. Just when things come up.
- 12 Q. Are there any issues that come up that
- 13 require a call or an e-mail or face-to-face meeting
- 14 with Mr. Warner?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 A. Can you repeat that question, please.
- 18 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 19 Q. I'll ask it differently.
 - With respect to prior to January of 2020
- 21 when you were meeting a few times a week with
- 22 Mr. Warner, were you still e-mailing with him on a
- 23 relatively regular basis back then?
- 24 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

- Page 79
 1 of 2020, you have not had any communication with
 - 2 Mr. Warner outside of telephone calls, e-mails and
 - 3 regular mail?

9

23

1

- 4 A. Yes, that's correct.
- 5 Q. When you were having your meetings
- 6 face-to-face with Mr. Warner, did he expect you to
- 7 bring hard copies of the documents you were
- 8 discussing with him?
 - MR. BOLAND: Objection, found -- sorry.
- 10 Objection, foundation.
- 11 You can answer.
- 12 BY THE WITNESS:
- 13 A. When you say face-to-face meetings, do
- 14 you mean prior to January of 2020?
- 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 16 Q. Yes.
- 17 A. Yes, I would bring him printouts.
- 18 Q. And did you have a folder that you kept
- 19 the printouts or copies of the printouts that you
- 20 were making for Mr. Warner for corporate
- 21 recordkeeping purposes?
- 22 A. I kept electronic copies.
 - Q. Do you still have all of those
- 24 electronic copies today?

Page 78

ŀ

- 1 BY THE WITNESS:
- 2 A. Yes.

- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 4 Q. Since you stopped meeting in person with
- 5 him, would you say that you e-mail with him more or
- 6 less frequently than you did prior to January 2020?
- 7 A. I'd say about the same.
- 8 Q. When you speak with Mr. Warner, do you
- 9 take notes on those conversations?
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. When Mr. Warner speaks to you over the
- 12 phone and gives you directions, how do you remember
- 13 what he's told you to do?
- 14 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 15 BY THE WITNESS:
- 16 A. By memory.
- 17 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 18 Q. Did you e-mail with Mr. Warner about the
- 19 COVID-19 pandemic?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Objection.
- 21 BY THE WITNESS:
- 22 A. I don't recall.
- 23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 24 Q. Is it fair to say that since January

- A. Yes.
- 2 Q. Since January 2020, how have you been
- 3 getting those same types of documents for your
- 4 meetings or telephone calls with Mr. Warner about
- 5 the different meeting topics?
- 6 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 7 BY THE WITNESS:
- 8 A. Can you clarify your question, please.
- 9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 10 Q. Had you been e-mailing or printing and
- 11 mailing hard copies of the documents to Mr. Warner
- 12 so that he could follow along in whatever physical
- 13 documents you were talking about?
- 14 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 15 BY THE WITNESS:
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 18 Q. Which method were you using?
- 19 A. Both
- 20 Q. And are you still maintaining electronic
- 21 copies of all of the documents you've been sharing
- 22 with Mr. Warner since January 2020?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. And did you share documents and other



2

CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 81–84

Page 83

Page 84

	F	Pa
1	materials, be they spreadsheets or analysis or	

- 2 pamphlets, or anything like that with Mr. Warner
- 3 about closing the hotel back in March of 2020?
- 4 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 5 BY THE WITNESS:
- 6 A. You'll have to repeat your question,
- 7 please.
- 8 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 9 Q. Sure.
- 10 Did you share documents and other
- 11 materials, physical, you know, things to look at,
- 12 with Mr. Warner about the decision to close the
- 13 Four Seasons Hotel New York?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. And do you have copies of the things
- 16 that you shared with him about closing the Four
- 17 Seasons Hotel New York in March 2020?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Have you shared documents and other
- 20 materials with Mr. Warner about conversations about
- 21 reopen -- reopening the Four Seasons Hotel New York
- 22 with Mr. Warner?
- 23 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 24 BY THE WITNESS:

1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

- Q. And were those documents that you needed
- 3 to e-mail him or send him in the mail?
- A. It was by e-mail.
- 5 Q. And do you still have those e-mails that
- 6 you sent to Mr. Warner?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. And was that to the katy@tymail.com
- 9 e-mail address?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Now, have you discussed this lawsuit
- 12 with Mr. Warner?
- 13 A. No, not directly.
- 14 Q. Have you ever discussed retaliating
- 15 against someone for bringing the lawsuit with
- 16 Mr. Warner?
- 17 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 18 BY THE WITNESS:
- 19 A. I don't know what you mean. Can you
- 20 repeat your question?
- 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 22 Q. Have you ever discussed retaliating
- 23 against someone that sued Mr. Warner or one of his
- 24 entities?

- A. Do you mean by e-mail and mail?
- 2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 3 Q. Yes.
- 4 A. There were certain discussions by e-mail
- 5 and mail.
- 6 Q. And do you still have copies of all of
- 7 those documents and materials that you shared by
- 8 e-mail and mail with Mr. Warner about --
- 9 MR. BOLAND: Objection.
- 10 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 11 Q. -- reopening the Four Seasons Hotel New
- 12 York after March 2020?
- 13 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 14 BY THE WITNESS:
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 17 Q. What were the discussions you had with
- 18 Mr. Warner about reopening the Four Seasons Hotel
- 19 New York after March 2020?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Objection, overbroad.
- 21 You can answer.
- 22 BY THE WITNESS:
- 23 A. I present -- I presented the reopening
- 24 plans presented by Four Seasons as the operator.

- 1 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 2 BY THE WITNESS:
- 3 A. No.
- 4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 5 Q. Have you ever discussed taking action
- 6 against someone for bringing a lawsuit against
- 7 Mr. Warner or one of his entities?
- 8 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 9 BY THE WITNESS:
- 10 A. No.
- 11 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 12 Q. As a corporate officer, would you ever
- 13 retaliate against one of the plaintiffs in this
- 14 case for bringing this lawsuit?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 A. No.
- 18 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 19 Q. As a corporate officer, would you hold
- 20 it against the plaintiffs that they believe they
- 21 have been wronged by the defendants in this case?
- 22 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 23 BY THE WITNESS:
- 24 A. What do you mean by "hold against the



CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 85–88

Page 87

1 plaintiffs"?

2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

- 3 Q. Would you consider their employment at
- 4 the Four Seasons Hotel New York differently because
- 5 they brought this lawsuit?
- 6 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 7 BY THE WITNESS:
- 8 A. I'm not involved with employment
- 9 decisions.
- 10 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 11 Q. Is it your testimony that there are
- 12 other people at Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts that are
- 13 involved in the hotel decisions, or is it your
- 14 testimony that no one at Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts
- 15 has any involvement with employment decisions for
- 16 the Four Seasons Hotel New York?
- 17 A. No one at Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts has
- 18 employment decisions.
- 19 Q. Is it your testimony that Ty Warner
- 20 Hotels & Resorts has no oversight of how many
- 21 employees Four Seasons Hotel New York employs?
- 22 MR. BOLAND: Objection to form. Object to the
- 23 form.
- 24 You can answer.

Page 86

- 1 BY THE WITNESS:
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 4 Q. Yes, it's your testimony that Ty Warner
- 5 Hotels and Resorts has no oversight of the number
- 6 of employees?
- 7 A. No oversight.
- 8 Q. Does Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts have any
- 9 oversight of the salaries for employees of Four
- 10 Seasons Hotel New York?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. Does Ty Warner Hotels & Resort have any
- 13 oversight of sick time for employees at Four
- 14 Seasons Hotel New York?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 Q. Does Mr. Warner have oversight of the
- 17 number of employees at Four Seasons Hotel
- 18 New York?
- 19 A. No.
- 20 Q. Does Mr. Warner have the ability to
- 21 direct people to hire and fire employees of Four
- 22 Seasons Hotel New York?
- 23 A. No.
- 24 Q. Does Mr. Warner --

- A. I would -- I would like just -- just to
- 2 be clear, there's only two positions that he has
- 3 influence over, and I don't think he can make the
- 4 final decision. There's two key positions, the
- 5 general manager and director of sales and
- goneral manager and an octor of oaloo and
- 6 marketing. But he does not have the firing7 decisions for those employees.
- 8 Q. Does Mr. Warner have the authority to --
 - A. And, I'm sorry, may I add one more
- 10 thing?

9

17

20

- 11 Q. Yes.
- 12 A. And that was per management agreement.
- 13 Q. Does Mr. Warner have the ability to
- 14 determine which employees are placed on furlough?
- 15 A. He has no decision in which employees
- 16 can be placed on furlough.
 - Q. Does Mr. Warner have authority to decide
- 18 to pay or not pay employees on furlough?
- 19 A. No, he does not.
 - Q. Does Mr. Warner have authority to bring
- 21 employees back to work at the Four Seasons Hotel
- 22 New York?
- 23 A. No.
- 24 Q. Does Mr. Warner have the authority to

Page 88

- 1 open or close the Four Seasons Hotel New York to
 - 2 guests?

- A. No.
- 4 Q. Does Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts have the
- 5 authority to open or close the Four Seasons Hotel
- 6 New York to guests?
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. Who are you claiming has the authority
- 9 to open and close the Four Seasons Hotel New York
- 10 to guests?
- 11 A. The operator, Four Seasons.
- 12 Q. Does Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts have
- 13 veto power over the operator's ability to open or
- 14 close the Four Seasons Hotel New York to guests?
- MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 A. No, Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts does not
- 18 have the authority.
- 19 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 20 Q. Does Mr. Warner?
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. What is your understanding of why Four
- 23 Seasons Hotel New York is not open today?
- 24 A. The hotel closed due to the pandemic



April 14, 2023 89-92

SE	SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS			89-92
	Page 89			Page 91
1	under the local mandate, and it remains closed	1	A. I don't understand your question.	
2	until we can find a way to open up the hotel	2	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	
3	profitably and safely.	3	Q. What is Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts	
4	 Q. Who determines the profitability 	4	trying to accomplish through the litigation to	
5	necessary to reopen the hotel?	5	terminate the management agreement with F	our
6	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	6	Seasons	
7	BY THE WITNESS:	7	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	
8	 A. Four Seasons has provided projections. 	8	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	
9	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	9	Q for	
10	Q. Do you, as an officer of Ty Warner	10	MR. BOLAND: I'm sorry. I didn't meant t	0
11	Hotels & Resorts, have any objection to Four	11	I thought you were done.	
12	Seasons deciding that the hotel can open tomorrow?	12	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	
13	MR. BOLAND: Objection, overbroad.	13	Q for the Four Seasons New York Ho	otel?
14	You can answer.	14	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	
15	BY THE WITNESS:	15	BY THE WITNESS:	
16	A. No.	16	A. Will you please repeat the question.	
17	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	17	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	
18	Q. Is Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts or	18	Q. What does Mr. Warner want to get o	ut of
19	Mr. Warner taking any position in its litigation to	19	terminating the hotel management agreemer	nt with the
20	terminate its agreement with Four Seasons about the	20	Four Seasons?	
21	management of the hotel that is preventing the Four	21	MR. BOLAND: Objection to the form and	
22	Seasons Hotel New York from reopening?	22	foundation.	
23	A. That was a long question. Would you	23	BY THE WITNESS:	
24	please repeat.	24	A. He wants to modify the management	fee
	Page 90			Page 92
1	Q. Sure.	1		
2	You testified that there is litigation	2	should say the Four Seasons' interests are	aligned
3	to terminate Four Seasons' operation of the Four		with ownership.	
4	Seasons Hotel New York, right?	4	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	
5	A. Uh-huh.	5	Q. And when you say ownership, doe	-
6	Q. I'm sorry. You just need to answer	6	other than Mr. Warner own stake in the co	
7	verbally.	7	MR. BOLAND: Oh, object to the form a	ınd it's
8	MR. BOLAND: You have to answer verbally.	8	vague.	
9	BY THE WITNESS:	9	You can answer.	
10	 A. Okay. Can you please repeat. 	10	BY THE WITNESS:	

A. Okay. Can you please repeat.

11 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you just read back that

12 question, please.

13 (WHEREUPON, the record was read

by the reporter as requested.)

15 BY THE WITNESS:

16 A. Yes.

14

17 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

18 Q. Is the purpose of that litigation to

prevent Four Seasons from being able to operate the

Four Seasons Hotel New York?

21 MR. BOLAND: No. Objection, overbroad,

22 foundation.

23 You can answer.

24 BY THE WITNESS:

- Page 92 s -- I
- aligned
- anyone
- pany?
- d it's
- 10 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. Hotel 57, LLC, there's many other legal 11
- 12 entities above it, and Mr. Warner owns it
- 13 indirectly. He is not --
- 14 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 15 Q. And when you say he owns it -- go ahead.
- A. He's not the direct owner of Hotel 57, 16
- 17 LLC.
- Q. Is he the owner of each of the corporate
- 19 entities above Hotel 57, LLC?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Objection. Object to the form.
- 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 22 Q. Directly or indirectly.
- 23 MR. BOLAND: No. Same objection.
- 24 BY THE WITNESS:



April 14, 2023 93–96

Page 95

1 A. Indirectly.

2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

3 Q. Are you a corporate officer in any -- in

4 all of those other entities?

5 A. Yes.

7

6 Q. What are those other corporate entities?

A. I don't know them by memory.

8 Q. Is it more than five?

9 A. I don't know.

10 Q. As a corporate officer, shouldn't you

11 know which companies you work for?

12 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

13 BY THE WITNESS:

14 A. Yes. And you'll understand when you see

15 the entity structure.

16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

17 Q. We'll leave a space in the record so

18 that you can provide the entity structure.

Now, would it be fair to say that all

20 roads through all those different corporate entity

21 structures still lead to Mr. Warner as the owner,

22 directly or indirectly, of Hotel 57, LLC?

23 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

24 BY THE WITNESS:

Page 93 1 Hotels & Resorts.

Q. Has Mr. Warner's involvement in Four

3 Seasons Hotel New York changed since the hotel was

4 shut down in March 2020?

5 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and

6 foundation.

7 BY THE WITNESS:

8 A. Can you clarify your question?

9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

10 Q. Has Mr. Warner's involvement in Four

11 Seasons Hotel New York changed since the hotel

12 closed in March 2020?

13 MR. BOLAND: Same objection.

14 BY THE WITNESS:

15 A. What do you mean by involvement?

16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

17 Q. Is he more or less involved since the

18 hotel closed in March 2020?

19 MR. BOLAND: Same objection.

20 BY THE WITNESS:

21 A. He has not been there physically since

22 March of 2020.

23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

24 Q. Does he call you more frequently about

Page 94

1 A. Yes, indirectly, it leads to Mr. Warner.

2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

3 Q. Now, you testified that the hotel closed

4 down in approximately March 2020 because of

5 COVID-19, right?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. When did you first learn of COVID-19?

8 A. I don't recall the exact month.

9 Q. What year?

10 A. 2020.

11 Q. Was it before the hotel closed down,

12 though, in March 2020?

13 A. Before March 2020, yes.

14 Q. Now, who pays your salary?

15 A. Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts.

16 Q. Are you paid by any of the other

17 entities that you're a corporate officer?

18 A. No.

19 Q. You get no compensation from any of the

20 other legal entities?

21 A. No, I do not.

Q. Do those legal entities connect back to

23 Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts or just to Mr. Warner?

A. It does not connect back to Ty Warner

Page 96

1 the Four Seasons Hotel New York since the hotel

2 closed in March 2020, or less frequently?

3 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

4 BY THE WITNESS:

5 A. More frequently.

6 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

7 Q. I'm sorry, you said more?

8 A. More.

9 Q. Does he e-mail you more or less

10 frequently since the hotel closed in March 2020

11 about Four Seasons Hotel New York?

12 A. The same.

13 Q. When you have calls with Mr. Warner

14 about the Four Seasons Hotel New York, do you

15 follow-up with him to memorialize those

16 conversations in e-mail?

17 A. No, not usually.

18 Q. Does he?

19 A. No.

20 Q. Are there any other litigation that

21 you're involved in as a corporate officer besides

22 the ones that you mentioned so far today?

23 A. Yes. There's an employee severance

24 matter for Four Seasons Hotel or Four Seasons



CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 97-100

Page 100

 •	D 1		

- Resort Santa Barbara.
- 2 Q. And what is your involvement in that
- 3 litigation?
- 4 A. I'm the corporate officer.
- 5 Q. And when you say you're the corporate
- 6 officer, you testified earlier that Mr. Hicks and
- 7 Mr. Warner were also corporate officers.
- 8 Are they corporate officers of that
- company as well? 9
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Are you acting as the corporate
- 12 representative, or are they also involved in those
- litigations --13
- 14 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 16 Q. -- partly?
- 17 MR. BOLAND: Sorry. Object to the form.
- 18 BY THE WITNESS:
- 19 A. I'm acting as the corporate
- 20 representative.
- 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 22 Q. And do you do that for all of the
- 23 corporate entities that you have a corporate
- 24 officer role?

- Page 99 1 of the entities that you happened to be corporate
- officer -- the corporate officer of that, correct?
- 3 A. Yes.

4

- Q. So I'm asking if Mr. Hicks also is
- involved as a corporate officer in any of the
- litigation that you mentioned?
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. Are you responsible as a corporate
- 9 officer for reviewing the filings that are being
- 10 made in these litigations to make sure that they're
- 11 accurate?
- 12 A. Yes.
- Q. And are you reviewing the filings before 13
- 14 they're being submitted to court?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. And have you done that in this case?
- 17 Α. Yes.
- 18 Q. And have you done that in the other
- 19 cases that you testified about yet?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Have you testified about all the
- 22 litigation that you're involved in?
- 23 MR. BOLAND: Objection to form.
 - 24 BY THE WITNESS:

Page 98

- MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the
 - A. No. BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - 3 Q. What other litigation are you involved
 - 4 in?
 - 5 A. Maybe I misunderstood your question. I
 - thought you asked if I have testified for all the
 - 7 litigations that I mentioned.
 - 8 Q. My apologies.
 - 9 A. No.
 - 10 Q. I'm asking if you have given an
 - exhaustive list of all the litigation matters that
 - you're involved in as a corporate officer or if
 - 13 there are others?
 - 14 A. I -- I don't know.
 - 15 Q. To the extent that there are other
 - 16 litigation out there that you're involved with as
 - 17 the corporate officer, would it be fair to say that
 - 18 your role is the same as a corporate representative
 - making sure that the filings are accurate if you're

 - involved in that litigation? 20
 - 21 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the
 - 22 question.
 - 23 BY THE WITNESS:
 - 24 A. Would you please repeat your question.

2 question. 3 BY THE WITNESS:

- A. I'm not involved in every single 4
- 5 entity's business. If it comes to my attention,
- 6 yes, then I act as the corporate representative.
- 7 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- Q. Let me ask it differently. For each of
- 9 the litigation matters that you've testified about,
- are you acting as the corporate representative? 10
- 11 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 12 BY THE WITNESS:
- 13 A. Can you tell me the difference corporate
- 14 representative and corporate officer?
- 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 16 Q. I'm asking you, are you acting on behalf
- 17 of the corporation, or are you doing it as part of
- 18 the team?
- 19 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 20 BY THE WITNESS:
- 21 A. I don't understand your question.
- 22 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 23 Q. So you testified that you, Mr. Hicks and
- 24 Mr. Warner are the three corporate officers at each



April 14, 2023 101-104

	<u> </u>	101 10-
1	Page 101 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	Page 103 1 communications or are there some that Mr. Warner is
2	Q. To the extent there are other	2 not involved in?
3	litigations that you don't currently remember,	3 MR. BOLAND: Objection, overbroad.
4	would it be fair to say that your role in those	4 You can answer.
5	other cases would be the same, to make sure that	5 BY THE WITNESS:
6	the filings are accurate?	6 A. There's some that he Mr. Warner is
7	MR. BOLAND: Same objection.	7 not included in the communication.
8	BY THE WITNESS:	8 MR. BRUSTEIN: All right. At this point, I'm
9	A. Yes.	9 going to be introducing an exhibit. I just want to
10	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	10 make sure that the exhibits have not been opened.
11	Q. Are you aware of any litigation that	11 THE REPORTER: They have not been opened.
12	Mr. Hicks takes that role in?	12 MR. BRUSTEIN: Okay. Wonderful.
13	A. I'm not aware of everything that he's	13 I'm going to be introducing Exhibit
14	involved in.	14 No. 1, and I will be sharing that in the chat.
15	Q. Is it possible that there's litigation	15 MR. BOLAND: Do you want do you want the
16	Mr. Hicks is involved in that involves the	16 court reporter to get it? The court reporter has
17	corporate entities that you're the corporate	17 got custody of the envelope.
18	officer of that you don't know about them?	18 THE REPORTER: Do you want me to open it
19	A. Yes.	19 and
20	Q. Would you agree that since he reports to	20 MR. BRUSTEIN: I am going to ask her to
21	you, if one of the entities you're the corporate	21 MR. BOLAND: Okay.
22	officer in is being sued, he should be telling you	22 MR. BRUSTEIN: get the envelope.
23	that kind of information?	23 THE REPORTER: There's a lot of this tape.
24	MR. BOLAND: Objection, vague, overbroad.	24 MR. BOLAND: You'll get it.
	Page 102	Page 104
1	You can answer	1 THE REPORTER: Okay, I have Exhibit 1.
1 2	You can answer. BY THE WITNESS:	1 THE REPORTER: Okay. I have Exhibit 1. 2 MR. BRUSTFIN: Can you please share that
2	BY THE WITNESS:	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that
2 3	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes.	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please.
2 3 4	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the
2 3 4 5	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you	 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll
2 3 4 5 6	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about?	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me.
2 3 4 5 6 7	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me. 7 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS:	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me. 7 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was 8 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Joe communicates to Mr. Warner as well,	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me. 7 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was 8 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit 9 No. 1, for identification, as of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Joe communicates to Mr. Warner as well, and he may there may be times when he has not	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me. 7 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was 8 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit 9 No. 1, for identification, as of 10 4/14/23.)
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Joe communicates to Mr. Warner as well, and he may there may be times when he has not informed me of everything.	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me. 7 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was 8 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit 9 No. 1, for identification, as of 10 4/14/23.) 11 MR. BOLAND: This does not have Bates numbers
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Joe communicates to Mr. Warner as well, and he may there may be times when he has not informed me of everything. BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me. 7 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was 8 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit 9 No. 1, for identification, as of 10 4/14/23.) 11 MR. BOLAND: This does not have Bates numbers 12 on it, Evan. Did you know that?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Joe communicates to Mr. Warner as well, and he may there may be times when he has not informed me of everything. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And how does he communicate with	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me. 7 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was 8 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit 9 No. 1, for identification, as of 10 4/14/23.) 11 MR. BOLAND: This does not have Bates numbers 12 on it, Evan. Did you know that? 13 MR. BRUSTEIN: I did not.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Joe communicates to Mr. Warner as well, and he may there may be times when he has not informed me of everything. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And how does he communicate with Mr. Warner?	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me. 7 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was 8 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit 9 No. 1, for identification, as of 10 4/14/23.) 11 MR. BOLAND: This does not have Bates numbers 12 on it, Evan. Did you know that? 13 MR. BRUSTEIN: I did not. 14 MR. BOLAND: So we don't know about these
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Joe communicates to Mr. Warner as well, and he may there may be times when he has not informed me of everything. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And how does he communicate with Mr. Warner? A. Same way; by phone, e-mail.	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me. 7 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was 8 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit 9 No. 1, for identification, as of 10 4/14/23.) 11 MR. BOLAND: This does not have Bates numbers 12 on it, Evan. Did you know that? 13 MR. BRUSTEIN: I did not. 14 MR. BOLAND: So we don't know about these 15 docs.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Joe communicates to Mr. Warner as well, and he may there may be times when he has not informed me of everything. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And how does he communicate with Mr. Warner? A. Same way; by phone, e-mail. Q. Do you e-mail Mr. Hicks about the Four	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me. 7 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was 8 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit 9 No. 1, for identification, as of 10 4/14/23.) 11 MR. BOLAND: This does not have Bates numbers 12 on it, Evan. Did you know that? 13 MR. BRUSTEIN: I did not. 14 MR. BOLAND: So we don't know about these 15 docs. 16 Okay. There you go.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Joe communicates to Mr. Warner as well, and he may there may be times when he has not informed me of everything. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And how does he communicate with Mr. Warner? A. Same way; by phone, e-mail. Q. Do you e-mail Mr. Hicks about the Four Seasons Hotel New York?	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me. 7 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was 8 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit 9 No. 1, for identification, as of 10 4/14/23.) 11 MR. BOLAND: This does not have Bates numbers 12 on it, Evan. Did you know that? 13 MR. BRUSTEIN: I did not. 14 MR. BOLAND: So we don't know about these 15 docs. 16 Okay. There you go. 17 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Joe communicates to Mr. Warner as well, and he may there may be times when he has not informed me of everything. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And how does he communicate with Mr. Warner? A. Same way; by phone, e-mail. Q. Do you e-mail Mr. Hicks about the Four Seasons Hotel New York? A. You mean the lawsuit or other matters?	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me. 7 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was 8 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit 9 No. 1, for identification, as of 10 4/14/23.) 11 MR. BOLAND: This does not have Bates numbers 12 on it, Evan. Did you know that? 13 MR. BRUSTEIN: I did not. 14 MR. BOLAND: So we don't know about these 15 docs. 16 Okay. There you go. 17 THE WITNESS: Thank you. 18 MR. BRUSTEIN: Okay. So I am now going to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Joe communicates to Mr. Warner as well, and he may there may be times when he has not informed me of everything. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And how does he communicate with Mr. Warner? A. Same way; by phone, e-mail. Q. Do you e-mail Mr. Hicks about the Four Seasons Hotel New York? A. You mean the lawsuit or other matters? Q. Let's start with the lawsuit.	MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll just keep this one for me. (WHEREUPON, a certain document was marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit No. 1, for identification, as of 4/14/23.) MR. BOLAND: This does not have Bates numbers on it, Evan. Did you know that? MR. BRUSTEIN: I did not. MR. BOLAND: So we don't know about these docs. Okay. There you go. THE WITNESS: Thank you. MR. BRUSTEIN: Okay. So I am now going to paste the first exhibit into the chat if anyone
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Joe communicates to Mr. Warner as well, and he may there may be times when he has not informed me of everything. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And how does he communicate with Mr. Warner? A. Same way; by phone, e-mail. Q. Do you e-mail Mr. Hicks about the Four Seasons Hotel New York? A. You mean the lawsuit or other matters? Q. Let's start with the lawsuit. A. No.	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me. 7 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was 8 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit 9 No. 1, for identification, as of 10 4/14/23.) 11 MR. BOLAND: This does not have Bates numbers 12 on it, Evan. Did you know that? 13 MR. BRUSTEIN: I did not. 14 MR. BOLAND: So we don't know about these 15 docs. 16 Okay. There you go. 17 THE WITNESS: Thank you. 18 MR. BRUSTEIN: Okay. So I am now going to 19 paste the first exhibit into the chat if anyone 20 would like to download it.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Joe communicates to Mr. Warner as well, and he may there may be times when he has not informed me of everything. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And how does he communicate with Mr. Warner? A. Same way; by phone, e-mail. Q. Do you e-mail Mr. Hicks about the Four Seasons Hotel New York? A. You mean the lawsuit or other matters? Q. Let's start with the lawsuit. A. No. Q. Other matters of the Four Seasons Hotel	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me. 7 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was 8 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit 9 No. 1, for identification, as of 10 4/14/23.) 11 MR. BOLAND: This does not have Bates numbers 12 on it, Evan. Did you know that? 13 MR. BRUSTEIN: I did not. 14 MR. BOLAND: So we don't know about these 15 docs. 16 Okay. There you go. 17 THE WITNESS: Thank you. 18 MR. BRUSTEIN: Okay. So I am now going to 19 paste the first exhibit into the chat if anyone 20 would like to download it. 21 I'm going to be going through it for
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Joe communicates to Mr. Warner as well, and he may there may be times when he has not informed me of everything. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And how does he communicate with Mr. Warner? A. Same way; by phone, e-mail. Q. Do you e-mail Mr. Hicks about the Four Seasons Hotel New York? A. You mean the lawsuit or other matters? Q. Let's start with the lawsuit. A. No. Q. Other matters of the Four Seasons Hotel New York?	MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll just keep this one for me. (WHEREUPON, a certain document was marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit No. 1, for identification, as of 4/14/23.) MR. BOLAND: This does not have Bates numbers on it, Evan. Did you know that? MR. BRUSTEIN: I did not. MR. BOLAND: So we don't know about these docs. Okay. There you go. THE WITNESS: Thank you. MR. BRUSTEIN: Okay. So I am now going to paste the first exhibit into the chat if anyone would like to download it. I'm going to be going through it for ease of not having a thousand exhibits, we're going
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	BY THE WITNESS: A. Yes. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And is that the kind of thing that you would expect to tell Mr. Warner about? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Joe communicates to Mr. Warner as well, and he may there may be times when he has not informed me of everything. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And how does he communicate with Mr. Warner? A. Same way; by phone, e-mail. Q. Do you e-mail Mr. Hicks about the Four Seasons Hotel New York? A. You mean the lawsuit or other matters? Q. Let's start with the lawsuit. A. No. Q. Other matters of the Four Seasons Hotel	2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can you please share that 3 mark that as Hwang Exhibit 1, please. 4 MR. BOLAND: Well, do you want to stamp the 5 copy that you give to the witness, and then I'll 6 just keep this one for me. 7 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was 8 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit 9 No. 1, for identification, as of 10 4/14/23.) 11 MR. BOLAND: This does not have Bates numbers 12 on it, Evan. Did you know that? 13 MR. BRUSTEIN: I did not. 14 MR. BOLAND: So we don't know about these 15 docs. 16 Okay. There you go. 17 THE WITNESS: Thank you. 18 MR. BRUSTEIN: Okay. So I am now going to 19 paste the first exhibit into the chat if anyone 20 would like to download it. 21 I'm going to be going through it for



CATHY HWANG

April 14, 2023 108

SE	LENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASO	HOTELS	105–108
1	Page 105 if you want, but I'm just going to be starting with	A. No.	Page 107
2	the first page.	BY MR. BRUS	TEIN
3	I am going to share my screen at this		. Warner have any involvement in
4	point so you can see the Bates numbers, Mr. Boland.	that decision?	. Warner have any involvement in
5	MR. BOLAND: Well, I'm just going to note that	A. No.	
6	the exhibit that the witness has has no Bates		it be fair to say at that point in
7	numbers, and whatever's in the chat doesn't change		was unprecedented on March 16, 2020?
8	that.		u say COVID-19 was unprecedented?
9	MR. BRUSTEIN: Well, this is actually my	Q. At that	,
10		A. Yes.	
11		Q. Had y	ou seen what was happening in China
12	during your depositions, your copying team cut off	prior to it arriv	ing in the United States?
13	Bates numbers, so I'm just putting on the record	MR. BOLA	ND: Object to the form.
14	what the Bates numbers are.	BY THE WITN	IESS:
15	If you want to make an issue of it, go	A. No.	
16	right ahead.	BY MR. BRUS	STEIN:
17	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	Q. Had y	ou seen when it was happening in
18	Q. So the first one is WARNERDEF, and I'm	Italy prior to it	arriving in the United States?
19	going to be using the abbreviation WD 3098. It's	MR. BOLA	ND: Same objection.
20	the first page.	BY THE WITN	IESS:
21	Do you see that e-mail?	A. No.	
22	A. Yes.	BY MR. BRUS	STEIN:
23	Q. Is this an e-mail that you received?	Q. Turnir	ig the page to the next exhibit,
24	A. No.	WD I mean	next page in the exhibit, WD 9119. Do
	Page 106		Page 108
1	Q. Okay. Now, this says March 13, 2020,	-	te these e-mails between you and
2	Employee Guidelines for COVID-19. Is that about	Mr. Tausche	
	when the hotel Four Seasons Hotel New York	-	n, it was sent to me, but I don't
4	started to act differently because of COVID-19?	•	the e-mails.
5	MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.		, this mail talks about the FSNY
6	BY THE WITNESS:	-	n TWHR to temporarily close hotel
7	A. I don't recall.	operations.	AND. Which a mad'l are used toll '
8	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:		AND: Which e-mail are you talking
9 10	Q. Do you recall if it was before this?A. I I don't recall the dates.	about, I'm so	-
11	Q. Okay. I'm going to have you turn the	BY THE WI	
	page to page No. 2, and that's Bates No. WD 9121.	A. At the e-mails.	ne top of the page? There's two
'-	page to page No. 2, and that a bates No. ND 9121.	- 111ali5.	

- 13 Do you recognize this e-mail?
- 14 A. Clearly it was sent to me, but I -- I
- 15 don't recall the e-mail.
- Q. Does it refresh your recollection that
- 17 on about March 16, 2020, the Four Seasons Hotel New
- York took drastic measures because of the
- Coronavirus?
- 20 A. That's what's stated in the e-mail.
- 21 Q. Did you have any involvement in that
- 22 decision?
- 23 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 24 BY THE WITNESS:

- ng
- 12 e-mails.
- MR. BOLAND: Yeah. 13
- 14 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 15 Q. So the e-mail from Mr. Tauscher to you
- 16 on the bottom --
- 17 A. Yes.
- Q. -- it says, "Four Seasons is in
- 19 agreement with TWHR to temporarily close hotel
- 20 operations at FSNY."
- 21 Do you see that? It's the first line.
- 22 A. I see it.
- 23 Q. What does "TWHR" stand for?
- 24 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.



CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 109–112

Page 112

1	RV THE	: \//ITNIEQQ:

- 2 A. Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts.
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 4 Q. And so this e-mail is saying that Four
- 5 Seasons agreed with Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts to
- 6 close the operations at the Four Seasons Hotel New
- 7 York, right?
- 8 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 9 BY THE WITNESS:
- 10 A. That's what's stated in the e-mail.
- 11 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 12 Q. Had you had conversations with
- 13 Mr. Tauscher that Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts had
- 14 wanted to close the hotel, Four Seasons Hotel New
- 15 York, in March of 2020?
- 16 A. What I recall is Mr. Tauscher calling me
- 17 and informing me about the local mandate and that
- 18 it -- and what was going on, the widespread of
- 19 COVID-19 in the City of New York, the downturn of
- 20 the business --
- 21 Q. Did you track --
- 22 A. -- that --
- 23 Q. -- with Mr. Warner about --
- 24 MR. BOLAND: Were you finished with your

- Page 111
 A. After speaking with Mr. Tauscher, I
- 2 believe I informed Mr. Warner what was going on in
- 3 New York.

7

- Q. And what did Mr. Warner say?
- 5 A. I told him that the hotel would be
- 6 required to shut down due to the City mandate.
 - Q. And what did he say back?
- 8 A. And he said okay. I mean, what can you
- 9 do if it's under the local mandate.
- 10 Q. Did he tell you that TWHR should agree
- 11 with that decision?
- 12 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 13 BY THE WITNESS:
- 14 A. I know how it's stated in the e-mail,
- 15 but T -- TWHR does not have the authority to close
- 16 down the hotel.
 - And at the time, I -- I think it was a
- 18 requirement that under the City that the hotel
- 19 closed.

17

- 20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 21 Q. When you read it now, does it read to
- 22 you as though TWHR is giving authority to shut down
- 23 the hotel?
- 24 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

- 1 answer?
- 2 THE WITNESS: I'm not finished with my answer.
- 3 BY THE WITNESS:
- 4 A. What I recall --
- 5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 6 Q. Sorry.
- 7 A. -- was Rudy telling me about the local
- 8 mandates and that it would be -- that the hotel
- 9 would be required to shut down soon.
- 10 Q. Did you discuss that with Mr. Warner?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And did you discuss that on the phone or
- 13 by e-mail?
- 14 A. I don't recall.
- 15 Q. When you would get an e-mail like this,
- 16 would you forward that to Mr. Warner to keep him in
- 17 the loop?
- 18 A. I think, more often than not, I would
- 19 call him. There's times when I would forward him
- 20 e-mails, but it was usually a phone conversation.
- 21 So I can't recall if it was by e-mail or phone.
- 22 Q. But you recall that you did reach out to
- 23 him one way or the other after receiving the e-mail
- 24 from Mr. Tauscher?

- 1 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. I don't think it's authorizing anything.
- 3 Again, Four Seasons has authority to close and open
- 4 the hotel.
- 5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 6 Q. You sent the top e-mail back to
- 7 Mr. Tauscher, right?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Can you please read the last sentence in
- 10 the first paragraph.
- 11 A. We will agree -- we agree we will work
- 12 together on reopening the hotel at a time we both
- 13 agree is appropriate.
- 14 Q. Was that an accurate statement of how
- 15 you understood reopening the hotel?
- 16 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. Four Seasons and ownership has a
- 19 complicated relationship. Four Seasons has the
- 20 authority to manage the hotel and its employees.
- 21 And if -- and at times I -- I pushed the
- 22 envelope by saying that we agree, but I realize
- 23 TWHR does not have the authority to close or manage
- 24 the day-to-day operations of the hotel.



5

15

20

Page 113

CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 113-116

Page 115

Page 116

1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

2 Q. But in this e-mail you said that you

3 would agree to open it when both parties agreed it

4 was appropriate, right?

MR. BOLAND: Object to the form, misstates the 5

6 document.

BY THE WITNESS: 7

8 A. That's what's stated and --

9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

10 Q. And you --

MR. BOLAND: Please wait. I don't think she's

12 finished. She's not finished with her answer.

13 BY THE WITNESS:

14 A. But that's what's stated, and it was

15 probably referring to the funding which needs to be

16 provided in order to reopen the hotel.

17 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

18 Q. If Mr. Warner wanted to withhold

19 funding, could the hotel reopen?

20 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.

21 BY THE WITNESS:

22 A. Four Seasons can reopen the hotel. They

23 have the authority to reopen. So if they decided

24 to reopen without Mr. Warner's funding, that's

1 about COVID were global, correct?

MR. BOLAND: Object to the -- object to the

form of the question.

BY THE WITNESS:

A. This is a communications -- he's

6 referring to the communication that was sent to --

7 well, it's an internal communication between the

8 Four Seasons employees.

9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

10 Q. You were in Chicago at the time, right?

11

12 Q. This wasn't limited to New York, was it?

13 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

14 BY THE WITNESS:

A. Yes, that's correct.

16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

17 Q. So in March of 2020, would you agree

18 that it was a global pandemic?

19 A. March -- by March 20 of 2020, yes.

Q. And people were dying in great numbers

21 in New York City at that point, right?

MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. 22

23 BY THE WITNESS:

24 A. That's what the news reported, yes.

Page 114

1 their decision.

2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

3 Q. Is it your testimony that Mr. Warner has

the ability to withhold funding?

5 MR. BOLAND: Objection, vague, overbroad.

You can answer.

7 BY THE WITNESS:

8 A. Mr. Warner, under the management

agreement, funds the operating deficits for the

10 hotel.

6

11 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

12 Q. Let's turn ahead two pages in this

13 document. This is WD 9118. This is an e-mail

14 about how widespread COVID was at this point,

15 right?

16 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

17 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

18 Q. In part?

19 MR. BOLAND: Same objection.

20 BY THE WITNESS:

21 A. Are you referring to the e-mail at the

22 bottom half of the page?

23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

Q. I'm just saying that the announcements

1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

Q. And there were dead bodies piling up in

3 trucks in front of the hospitals because of the

overflow in the morgues?

A. I don't know personally, because I was

not in New York. But in the news, yes, that's what

was reported.

8 Q. Now, on March 20 of 2020, that's the

9 first time that the staff was notified that they

10 were going to be placed on furlough, right?

11 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.

12 You can answer.

13 BY THE WITNESS:

14

A. I don't know if that was the first time.

15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

Q. Let's turn the page, WD 9113. This is

17 an e-mail that you received from Rudy Tauscher

about an all employee update.

Does that refresh your recollection as

20 to the fact that the employees were notified on

March 19, 2020, about the pandemic shutting things

22 down at the hotel?

23 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

24 BY THE WITNESS:



April 14, 2023 117-120

Page 120

			Page 117
Α.	I see it in the e-mail.	I don't recall	_

- 2 the exact dates, but, yes, I see it in the e-mail.
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 4 Q. Was Mr. Warner involved in this
- 5 decision?
- 6 A. No.
- 7 Q. Did he have any involvement in notifying
- 8 the employees of the Four Seasons Hotel New York
- 9 about they're being placed on furlough?
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. Is there a reason that the employees
- 12 weren't notified before March 19, 2020 --
- 13 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.
- 14 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 15 Q. -- about --
- 16 MR. BOLAND: Sorry. Go ahead. I apologize.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. I don't know.
- 19 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 20 Q. -- about --
- 21 MR. BOLAND: Go ahead. Let him finish his
- 22 question.
- 23 I'll object. Then you can answer.
- 24 MR. BRUSTEIN: Let me -- withdraw.

- Q. At any point from March 2020 until now
- 2 has Mr. Warner refused to provide funds requested
- 3 by the Four Seasons Hotel New York?
- A. Ownership had provided a list of
- 5 operating expenses that the ownership would agree
- 6 to fund, and all those items have been funded.
- 7 Q. With respect to Mr. Warner's involvement
- 8 in Four Seasons Hotel New York, is there anyone at
- 9 Hotel 57 Services, LLC, other than yourself and
- 10 Mr. Hicks, that communicates with Mr. Warner
- 11 directly?
- 12 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.
- 13 BY THE WITNESS:
- 14 A. Can you repeat your question, please.
- 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 16 Q. You testified that you and Mr. Hicks are
- 17 officers of Hotel 57 Services, right?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Other than the two of you, is there
- 20 anyone else at Hotel 57 Services, LLC, who
- 21 communicates directly with Mr. Warner?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.
- 24 BY THE WITNESS:

Page 118 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

- 2 Q. Is there a reason that the Four Seasons
- 3 Hotel New York did not notify the employees of the
- 4 hotel prior to March 19, 2020, that the hotel would
- 5 be shutting down and they would be placed on
- 6 furlough?
- 7 MR. BOLAND: Objection. It assumes facts and
- 8 no foundation.
- 9 You can answer.
- 10 BY THE WITNESS:
- 11 A. I don't know.
- 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 13 Q. Earlier you testified that Mr. Warner
- 14 doesn't have the ability to open or reopen -- open
- 15 or close the Four Seasons Hotel New York, right?
- 16 He can just withhold funding for it, right?
- 17 MR. BOLAND: Objection, form.
- 18 BY THE WITNESS:
- 19 A. He can choose to provide funding of
- 20 operating deficits.
- 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 22 Q. Is Mr. Warner currently withholding
- 23 funding from the Four Seasons Hotel New York?
- 24 A. No.

- 1 A. No.
- 2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 3 Q. So if anyone else at Hotel 57 Services,
- 4 LLC, wanted to speak to Mr. Warner, they would have
- 5 to send a message to either you or Mr. Hicks; is
- 6 that correct?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Now, have you ever rejected a request to
- 9 fund something at hotel -- at Four Seasons Hotel
- 10 New York without bringing it to Mr. Warner?
- 11 A. Mr. Warner is aware of the items that we
- 12 have agreed to fund for hotel at -- hotel during
- 13 closure.
- 14 Q. Is he also aware of requests for funding
- 15 that are rejected?
- 16 MR. BOLAND: Objection, assumes facts.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. Again, he's aware of the items that we
- 19 agreed to fund.
- 20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 21 Q. I'm asking if you are telling him
- 22 everything or if you keep things from him when
- 23 requests come in to fund things at the Four Seasons
- 24 Hotel New York?



April 14, 2023 121-124

Page 124

Page 121 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

- 2 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. I don't keep things from him. I inform 3
- 4 him of the items that are funded.
- 5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 6 Q. Has there ever been a request for
- 7 funding since March 20, 2020, at the Four Seasons
- 8 Hotel New York that has not been funded by
- 9 Mr. Warner or any of his entities?
- 10 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 11 BY THE WITNESS:
- 12 A. There are certain payroll for certain
- positions that were not funded because it was not
- 14 staffing plan that ownership agreed to fund.
- 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 16 Q. When you say "ownership agreed to fund,"
- 17 was that your decision not to fund or someone
- else's? 18
- 19 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of that
- 20 question.
- 21 BY THE WITNESS:
- 22 A. The items that we agreed to fund during
- 23 hotel closure was discussed between myself and
- 24 Mr. Warner.

- Page 123 Q. -- did you discuss funding requests at
- Four Seasons Hotel New York with Mr. Warner that
- were not funded?
- A. Yes, he's aware of certain positions
- that were not agreed upon to be funded.
- 6 Q. Whose decision was it to not fund those
- 7 positions?
- A. Again, it was discussed with myself and
- Mr. Warner.
- 10 Q. Was it your decision not to fund those
- 11 positions?
- 12 A. We discussed the staffing plan and
- 13 those -- the positions that were not on the
- staffing plan were not funded.
- 15 Q. And whose decision was it to not fund
- 16 it? Was it you and Mr. Warner together or only one
- 17 of you?
- 18 A. Us together.
- 19 Q. So you agreed with Mr. Warner to not
- 20 fund certain employees' salaries?
- 21 MR. BOLAND: Objection, misstates testimony.
- 22 You can answer.
- 23 BY THE WITNESS:
- 24 A. Yes.

Page 122

BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

- 2 Q. Which employee positions did you reject
- 3 funding for?
- MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. 4
- BY THE WITNESS:
- 6 A. So, for instance, the director of IT.
- 7 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 8 Q. Was that your decision --
- 9 A. We agreed --
- 10 Q. -- or was it --
- 11 A. No, we agreed that he would work one day
- 12 a week, because during the closure, I did not see a
- need for a full-time IT director. And if he worked
- more than one day a week, we weren't funding the
- 15 additional hours.
- 16 Q. Was that decision, was that something
- 17 that you and Mr. Warner discussed and agreed to?
- 18 A. Yes, we went over every single position
- 19 on the staffing plan.
- 20 Q. Did you make notes of Mr. Warner's
- 21 feedback of the staffing plan?
- 22 A. No, we went over them together. And he
- 23 agreed to those positions.
- 24 Q. When you went over those plans, did they



1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

- Q. Were the items that were not to be
- 3 funded also discussed between yourself and
- 4 Mr. Warner?
- A. Well, us -- outside of what agreed to be 5
- funded, logically, is not funded. 6
- 7 Q. I'm just asking you for a straight
- 8 answer for the record.
- 9 MR. BOLAND: Objection, then. Asked and
- 10 answered.
- 11 MR. BRUSTEIN: Jim, I really need not speaking
- 12 more than myself and the witness. I know you get
- 13 paid by word sometimes, but in this circumstance,
- 14 it's not your deposition.
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Your question made no sense. I
- 16 need a straight answer.
- 17 If you want to ask her that question
- 18 again, you can do that. Or if you want to ask her
- 19 a different question, you can.
- 20 I'm not interrupting you. I'm making
- 21 minor objections and keeping quiet.
- 22 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 23 Q. Ms. Hwang --
- 24 Yes.



April 14, 2023 125–128

Page 127

			Page 125
1	have did they	/ have actua	I names associated with

- 2 people whose salaries were being cut?
- 3 MR. BOLAND: Object to form. That assumes
- 4 facts.
- 5 BY THE WITNESS:
- 6 A. No, I did not have the names of the
- 7 employees. Four Seasons did not disclose that
- 8 information to me.
- 9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 10 Q. With respect to the plan, how did you
- 11 present it to him? Was it by e-mail or hard copy
- 12 that you mailed to him?
- 13 A. By e-mail.
- 14 Q. Did he e-mail back a response with edits
- 15 to the plan?
- 16 A. No.
- 17 Q. Did he approve of every one of your
- 18 suggestions to cut funding?
- 19 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. Assumes
- 20 facts.
- 21 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. I don't -- I don't recall if there were
- 23 revisions from the first pass of staffing plan, but
- 24 it was discussed over the phone.

- 1 New York City.
- 2 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 4 Q. The top e-mail Tauscher says, "Please
- 5 share with Mr. Warner." Do you see that at the end
- 6 of the e-mail?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. What is your understanding of why
- 9 Mr. Warner needed to have this information?
- 10 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 11 BY THE WITNESS:
- 12 A. Reading this that Mr. Warner is -- he
- 13 just wanted to keep Mr. Warner informed of what was
- 14 going on in New York and at the hotel, and he
- 15 communicated that through me.
- 16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 17 Q. Now, how many positions did Mr. Warner
- 18 refuse to fund?
- 19 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. Assumes
- 20 facts and misstates the testimony.
- 21 You may answer.
- 22 BY THE WITNESS:
- 23 A. I don't recall.
- 24 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

Page 128

Q. Was it more or less than ten positions?

- 2 MR. BOLAND: Same objection.
 - 3 BY THE WITNESS:
 - 4 A. I don't recall.
 - 5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - 6 Q. In -- in approximately March 24, 2020,
 - 7 how many positions did the Four Seasons want funded
 - 8 that Mr. Warner refused to fund?
 - 9 A. To be clear, Four Seasons sent --
 - 10 provided staffing plans throughout the closure. I
 - 11 don't recall every instance of when they provided
 - 12 the staffing plan.
 - 13 And I can't recall if they provided the
 - 14 staffing plan on March 20th for the initial
 - 15 closure.
 - 16 Q. Now, did Ty Warner Hotel & Resorts
 - 17 provide the funding for some positions?
 - 18 MR. BOLAND: Objection, vague and overbroad.
 - 19 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - 20 Q. In -- in March of 2020, when the Four
 - 21 Seasons requested or provided a staffing plan, did
 - 22 Ty Warner Hotel & Resorts provide funding for some
 - 23 of those positions?
 - 24 MR. BOLAND: Objection, assumes facts.

Page 126

- 1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- Q. If there were revisions, would you have
- 3 saved those changes in a document?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. And would you have saved the original
- 6 version when you received the first copy?
- 7 A. Well, the original version would have
- 8 been presented by Four Seasons because they
- 9 determined the employment for their employees.
- 10 Q. Did you need to share your suggestions
- 11 to Mr. Warner before responding to the Four Seasons
- 12 about the staff funding?
- 13 A. Would you please repeat your question.
- 14 Q. Earlier you testified there were some
- 15 decisions you did not need Mr. Warner's approval
- 16 for. Was the decision about which staff positions
- 17 to fund or not fund something that required
- 18 Mr. Warner's approval?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Yes, it required his approval?
- 21 A. For funding purposes.
- 22 Q. Let's go two pages now further. This is
- 23 WD 9111. This e-mail is an update on the Corona
- 24 case -- Coronavirus cases continuing to increase in



CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 129–132

Page 132

1	BY THE WITNESS:	

- 2 A. I don't recall the exact timing of when
- 3 it was communicated from ownership to the operator
- 4 which positions would be funded. Again, I don't
- 5 remember the exact timing of when the staffing plan
- 6 was presented by Four Seasons to ownership.
- 7 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 8 Q. At the time that it was presented,
- 9 though, did Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts agree to
- 10 provide funding?
- 11 MR. BOLAND: Objection, vague.
- 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 13 Q. For the staff positions.
- 14 A. Initially, if the hotel -- or I should
- 15 say Rudy Tauscher and his property level team made
- 16 the decision of keeping certain employees on
- 17 payroll. We were funding those items until a
- 18 staffing plan was presented and we agreed to
- 19 certain positions.
- 20 Q. And when you say "we," are you referring
- 21 to Mr. Warner, Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts, or
- 22 something else?
- 23 A. Mr. Warner as part of Ty Warner Hotels &
- 24 Resorts.

1

- Page 131
 1 any business circumstance you could think of that
 - 2 would require the hotel to be closed for an
- 3 extended period of time?
- 4 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 5 BY THE WITNESS:
- 6 A. No.
- 7 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 8 Q. Let's turn to the next page. This
- 9 begins on WD 1586. I believe it's a three-page
- 10 document ending on WD 1588.
- 11 If you want to take a minute to just
- 12 look through those two pages. The second and third
- 13 page are, you know, just the signature line and
- 14 marked, and so it shouldn't take you that long. I
- 15 am going to remain focused on the main page.
- 16 A. Can you scroll up to the top of that
- 17 current page. Is that dated March 24th?
- 18 Q. Yes.
- 19 A. Okay.
- 20 Q. I can zoom out so you can see more of
- 21 the page if that's helpful for you. Is that
- 22 better?
- 23 A. Yes, thank you.
- 24 Q. Have you seen this document before?

- Q. When was the last position plan that you 1 A. No.
 - Q. Did you know that the hotel was
 - 3 providing notice that says pursuant to
 - 4 29 U.S.C. 2101, et. seq. in the New York WARN Act
 - 5 before it sent out notices?
 - 6 A. I wasn't aware of this, any
 - 7 communication at -- that the property level team
 - 8 would have sent out. It looks like this is from
 - 9 Elizabeth Ortiz. So I was not aware of these
 - 10 communications or the contents of the communication
 - 11 to the employees.
 - 12 Q. Earlier you testified that you think
 - 13 February was probably the earliest that someone
 - 14 would have been aware of COVID-19 as an issue.
 - 15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
 - 16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - 17 Q. Is there a reason that this type of
 - 18 notification wasn't sent out in February 2020?
 - 19 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.
 - 20 BY THE WITNESS:
 - 21 A. I don't know.
 - 22 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - 23 Q. Okay. Let's go to next page after this
 - 24 document beginning on WD 2198. It's a few pages.



- 2 received from Four Seasons Hotel New York?
- 2 received from Four Seasons Floter New Fork:
- 3 A. I think it was presented with the 2022
- 4 budget. I can't recall the dates.
- 5 Q. Do you still have a copy of that budget
- 6 and that position plan?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Prior to the hotel closing in March
- 9 of 2020, did you have any reason to expect that the
- 10 hotel would need to be closed for an extended
- 11 period of time?
- 12 A. No. Prior to COVID, I didn't know of a
- 13 reason why the hotel would be closed.
- 14 Q. So in February 2020, there was no reason
- 15 for the hotel to claim that it needed to close down
- 16 for an extended period of time?
- 17 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 18 BY THE WITNESS:
- 19 A. Again, I don't recall the exact timing.
- 20 I mean, I think by February, COVID was rampant, but
- 21 other than the reason for COVID, I don't know of
- 22 any other reason.
- 23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 24 Q. Okay. Let's say January 2020, was there



April 14, 2023 133–136

Page 135

Page	1	3

- 1 It's ending on WD 2201. I will scroll slowly if
- 2 you want to look on the screen, but I believe you
- 3 have a copy in front of you, as well.
- 4 If you want to look on the screen, just
- 5 tell me when you would like me to go to the next
- 6 page. I'm just going to ask you generally if
- 7 you've seen this document before.
- 8 Does it look familiar to you?
- 9 A. I have not seen this particular
- 10 document. I'm familiar with some of the phrases
- 11 and the wording that was used.
- 12 Q. Were you involved in the drafting of the
- 13 phrasing and wording that was used even if you
- 14 haven't seen this specific version of it?
- A. Four Seasons had sent me their planned
- 16 communications for -- for the website and to the
- 17 media.
- 18 Q. Did you discuss that planned
- 19 communication with Mr. Warner?
- 20 A. I don't recall.
- 21 Q. Did Mr. Warner have any objection to
- 22 being referred to as the hotel's owner publicly?
- 23 MR. BOLAND: Objection to the form.
- 24 BY THE WITNESS:

- 1 let you know?
- 2 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 3 Excuse me.
- 4 BY THE WITNESS:
- 5 A. Yes, he would let me know.
- 6 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - Q. Is it safe to say that he didn't let you
- 8 know that he had any objection to being referred to
- 9 as the hotel's owner?
- 10 A. I think if he was upset about being
- 11 referred to as the hotel's owner, he would have let
- 12 me know.

7

- 13 Q. And you have no recollection of him ever
- 14 objecting to being referred to as the hotel's
- 15 owner?

20

- 16 A. I don't recall.
- 17 Q. And you've never asked him not to refer
- 18 to him as the hotel's owner, right?
- 19 A. I've never what?
 - Q. You've never asked any of the people at
- 21 the hotel not to refer to Mr. Warner as the hotel's
- 22 owner, right?
- 23 A. That's correct.
- 24 Q. Okay. Let's turn to the next document

- A. Is that stated in this document
- 2 somewhere?
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 4 Q. So if you look on the screen. It's the
- 5 second page, WD 2199. It's old. It says e-mail
- 6 and auto reply. The second paragraph, "Following
- 7 the announcement of Governor Andrew Cuomo and8 hotel's owner, Ty Warner, Four Seasons Hotel New
- 9 York is preparing the hotel to accommodate nurses,
- 10 doctors, and it goes on from there."
- 11 A. Okay. Can you please repeat your
- 12 question?
- 13 Q. I'm sorry?
- 14 A. Would you please repeat your question
- 15 earlier.
- 16 Q. Did Mr. Warner have any objection to
- 17 being referred to publicly as the hotel's owner?
- 18 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.
- 19 BY THE WITNESS:
- 20 A. I'm not aware of any objections.
- 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 22 Q. If Mr. Warner had a problem with the way
- 23 the hotel was referring to him, was he the kind of
- 24 person that would keep that to himself or would he

- Page 136
- 1 in this set. This is WD 9126. And this e-mail is
- 2 just talking about the fact that the hotel was
- 3 going to open on April 2nd to medical personnel.
- 4 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 6 Q. Is that your understanding of what this
- 7 e-mail was about?
- 8 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 9 BY THE WITNESS:
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 12 Q. Did Mr. Warner approve the hotel opening
- 13 to the medical personnel?
- 14 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 15 BY THE WITNESS:
- 16 A. He approved the funding to open up the
- 17 hotel for the medical professionals.
- 18 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 19 Q. And why did he -- did he tell you why he
- 20 did that?
- 21 A. He had -- he heard what was going on in
- 22 New York, and he wanted to help the first
- 23 responders.
- 24 Q. Were there any tax benefits to reopening



CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 137–140

Page 139

1 up the hotel?

2 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

3 BY THE WITNESS:

4 A. I don't know.

5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

6 Q. As the chief financial officer, wouldn't

7 tax benefits be something under your purview?

8 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

9 BY THE WITNESS:

10 A. I'm not a tax expert, and we didn't

11 consult with a tax advisor on that matter. It was

12 important for Mr. Warner to help the first

13 responders.

14 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

15 Q. So it was a completely selfless decision

16 for Mr. Warner, from your understanding?

17 A. This is what he wished to do.

18 Q. Turning to the next page, WD 9108. I'm

19 just looking at the top of the page. It says that

20 you discussed the timeline with Mr. Warner, and

21 that has to do with reopening the hotel, right?

22 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

23 BY THE WITNESS:

A. My e-mail communicates to Mr. Tauscher

1 York, correct?

2 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

3 BY THE WITNESS:

4 A. Some of the hotels are in the

5 competitive set. Not all.

6 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

Q. Which ones are?

8 A. Mandarin Oriental, St. Regis, and

9 Baccarat.

7

10 Q. But your understanding from this e-mail

11 was that hotels in New York City were going to

12 reopen in June 2020?

13 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

14 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

15 Q. Right?

16 A. I understood that they were planning to

17 reopen, and there was discussions about reopening

18 in June. But there were a lot of uncertainties

19 with COVID at that point in time.

20 Q. But Mr. Tauscher was asking you about

21 the timeline that Mr. Warner wanted to reopen Four

22 Seasons Hotel New York, right?

23 MR. BOLAND: Objection, fundamentally

24 misstates. Object to the form.

Page 140

Page 138
1 that Mr. Warner wished to extend providing rooms

2 for the medical professionals.

3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

4 Q. Right. And that was in response to

5 Mr. Tauscher talking about reopening the hotel to

6 quests, right?

7 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

8 BY THE WITNESS:

9 A. This is at the end of April. The

10 medical professionals were already at the hotel.

11 And, again, Mr. Warner wanted to continue providing

12 the rooms for the medical professionals, so that's

13 my communication to Rudy to continue on with that

14 program.

15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

16 Q. Now, directing your attention to the

17 second to the last paragraph. It says, "Speaking

18 to industry colleagues, Mandarin Oriental New York,

19 Park Hyatt, Baccarat, The Carlisle, St. Regis, and

20 Peninsula, all hotels prepared to open in June."

21 Do you see that?

22 A. I see the sentence, yes.

23 Q. And those hotels are all in the

24 competitive set for the Four Seasons Hotel New

MR. BRUSTEIN: Again, I appreciate your words.

2 Please limit to objection.

3 MR. BOLAND: Tell the truth about the

4 documents.

5 MR. BRUSTEIN: Mr. Boland, I really am going

6 to remind you that your narration was inappropriate

7 here.

8 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

9 Q. Ms. Hwang, did you discuss reopening the

10 hotel with Mr. Warner after receiving

11 Mr. Tauscher's e-mail on April 24th, 2020?

12 MR. BOLAND: Objection. Object to the form,

13 vague.

14 You can answer.

15 BY THE WITNESS:

16 A. What I see here is Rudy asking to end

17 the program to provide rooms to medical

18 professionals on May 7th. And he said he leaves

19 this decision up to Mr. Warner.

20 And that is what I discussed with

21 Mr. Warner, whether he would like to halt the

22 program or continue the program.

23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

24 Q. But my question to you is if in April



April 14, 2023 141–144

Page 14

1 of 2020, you discussed reopening Four Seasons Hotel

- 2 New York with Mr. Warner?
- 3 MR. BOLAND: Objection, asked and answered.
- 4 You can answer.
- 5 MR. BRUSTEIN: Okay. Mr. Boland, we're going
- 6 to have to call the court if you are going to
- 7 continue to voice your objection.
- 8 MR. BOLAND: She just gave you the answer.
- 9 MR. BRUSTEIN: No, she didn't.
- 10 MR. BOLAND: All right. I think she did.
- 11 BY THE WITNESS:
- 12 A. Would you please -- would you please ask
- 13 the question again, because I believe I gave my
- 14 answer.
- 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 16 Q. My question was at -- in April 2020, did
- 17 you discuss with Mr. Warner reopening the hotel to
- 18 guests?
- 19 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 20 BY THE WITNESS:
- 21 A. In April of 2020, Mr. Warner was focused
- 22 on providing the rooms to the medical
- 23 professionals, so that was not discussed. He
- 24 didn't bring that up explicitly.

- Page 143 employed at the hotel, but we were extending the
- 2 program on a monthly basis. And at some point in
- 3 time in that period, Four Seasons, as the operator,
- 4 had proposed reopening.
 - Q. While the medical program was going on,
- 6 did you have conversations with Mr. Warner about
- 7 reopening the hotel to guests, or did that
- 8 conversation not happen until after the medical
- 9 personnel left?
- 10 A. It didn't happen until after the medical
- 11 professionals left.
- 12 Q. Why didn't Mr. Warner conclude hosting
- 13 medical professionals at the Four Seasons Hotel New
- 14 York?

5

- 15 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.
- 16 You can answer.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. Why did he conclude, is that what you
- 19 said?
- 20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 21 Q. Why did he stop, basically?
- 22 A. I think we stopped at end of June. At
- 23 that point in time he felt that he provided, you
- 24 know, enough support to the first responders. And

- 1 He stated that he would like to continue
- 2 the program providing the rooms for medical
- 3 professionals, and we discussed uncertainties, and
- 4 we said we didn't -- we didn't know when would be a
- 5 good time to halt. I mean, we wanted to continue
- 6 providing the rooms.
- 7 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 8 Q. I'm sorry, you said you didn't know when
- 9 it would be a good time to do what?
- 10 A. Mr. Warner said that he would like to
- 11 continue providing the rooms to the first
- 12 responders, given what was going on in New York
- 13 with COVID. We didn't discuss halting the program.
- 14 He said we would, you know, revisit.
- 15 Q. When is the first time you discussed
- 16 reopening the Four Seasons Hotel New York with
- 17 Mr. Warner after April 2020?
- 18 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 19 BY THE WITNESS:
- 20 A. I would say spring and summer of 2020.
- 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 22 Q. Who initiated that conversation?
- 23 A. Well, it came from Four Seasons as the
- 24 operator. I don't recall if Rudy was still

- Page 144 there were considerations on, you know, ongoing
- 2 capital projects that we needed to complete.
- Q. Did Mr. Warner tell you that?
- 4 A. We discussed the capital projects, and
- 5 he understood the importance of completing those --
- 6 the improvements during hotel closure.
- 7 Q. When did Mr. Warner first discuss doing
- 8 capital projects as a basis to close the hotel?
- 9 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. It assumes
- 10 facts.
- 11 BY THE WITNESS:
- 12 A. I don't recall.
- 13 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 14 Q. Was it before or after the medical
- 15 personnel began staying at the hotel?
- 16 MR. BOLAND: Same objection.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. A number of these capital projects were
- 19 going on. I think it started before and during.
- 20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 21 Q. Did they continue while the medical
- 22 personnel were staying at the hotel?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 MR. BOLAND: Evan, we've been going over an



April 14, 2023 145–148

	Page 1
1	hour and a half on this session. Whenever you get
2	a good time, it probably makes sense to take a
3	break.
4	MR. BRUSTEIN: Well, okay. Just give me a fe

- 4 MR. BRUSTEIN: Well, okay. Just give me a few 5 questions, and then we can take a break.
- 6 MR. BOLAND: Sure.
- 7 MR. BRUSTEIN: Do you want to take a lunch
- 8 break at that point?
- 9 MR. BOLAND: Yeah, sure.
- 10 Cathy, is that good for you --
- 11 THE WITNESS: Yeah.
- 12 MR. BOLAND: -- to break?
- 13 THE WITNESS: Yeah.
- 14 MR. BOLAND: Okay.
- 15 THE WITNESS: That's fine.
- 16 MR. BOLAND: Yeah, that's fine.
- 17 MR. BRUSTEIN: Okay. I'm sorry. Can I just
- 18 have that last question read back.
- 19 (WHEREUPON, the record was read
- 20 by the reporter as requested.)
- 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 22 Q. What projects, capital projects, were
- 23 happening while the medical personnel were staying
- 24 at the hotel?

1

Page 147
A. There -- I can't recall exactly which

- 2 projects were, besides the two that I mentioned. I
- 3 can't recall exactly all the projects that were
- o carriredal exactly all the projects that were
- going on during the medical professional stay.
- 5 Q. Earlier you said there was a wallpaper
- 6 lawsuit. Was there a wallpaper project going on
- 7 when the medical personnel were there?
- 8 A. The installation was -- the initial
- 9 installation was completed before the medical
- 10 professional stay, but then there was a second
- 11 round of reinstalling the wallpaper in certain
- 12 rooms.
- 13 So I can't recall if that was still
- 14 going on while the medical professionals were at
- 15 the hotel.
- 16 Q. Now, was there any capital project that
- 17 required the hotel -- that required the hotel to
- 18 shut down?
- 19 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 20 BY THE WITNESS:
- 21 A. There were many capital projects. Due
- 22 to the nature of the projects, there would be a lot
- 23 of noise complaints. And, as I understand it,
- 24 certain projects would require shutdown of the

- A. The elevator project, elevator --
- 2 elevator monitoring station projects.
- 3 Q. Anything else?
- 4 A. There's the building facade project. I
- 5 can't recall the exact date of completion.
- 6 Q. Do you recall the year the building
- 7 facade project was completed?
- 8 A. No. The project was suspended during
- 9 COVID, so I know it was during 2020. But under
- 10 City mandate, there were certain rules about what
- 11 projects can continue, so --
- 12 Q. Other than the --
- 13 A. So I can't recall -- I'm sorry. So I
- 14 can't recall the exact date of the completion.
- 15 There were many delays.
- 16 Q. Other than the elevator modernization
- 17 and the building facade, were there other projects?
- 18 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 19 BY THE WITNESS:
- 20 A. Again, there's a number of projects that
- 21 were going on. I can't recall the exact timing.
- 22 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 23 Q. Were they going on while the hotel had
- 24 the medical personnel staying there?

- Page 148
 1 power, which would be disruptive during hotel
- 2 operations.
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 4 Q. Which specific projects are you
- 5 referencing would require the hotel to shut down
- because of loss of power?
- 7 A. There's a switch gear project. And then
- 8 I'm not sure about the elevator project if that
- 9 would also require it during testing. But there
- 10 were a number of complaints prior to shutting down
- 11 at the hotel by guests about the noise complaint,
- 12 the elevator project.
- 13 Q. Other than the switch gear and elevator
- 14 project, was there any other capital project that
- 15 required the hotel to shut down?
- 16 MR. BOLAND: Objection, vague.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. There's a shower pan project that's
- 19 going on, and, again, it would be disruptive to
- 20 hotel's operations as it requires removal of
- 21 drywall and ceilings, and drywalls in the hallways,
- 22 as well.
- 23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 24 Q. Anything else?



April 14, 2023 149–152

Page 151

MR. BOLAND: Same objection.

2 You can answer.

3 BY THE WITNESS:

1

4 A. Like, I don't recall every -- every one

5 of the projects that are in progress.

6 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

7 Q. Were there any other big projects?

8 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

9 BY THE WITNESS:

10 A. There is a fire panel replacement

11 project, replace -- replacement/upgrade project.

12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

13 Q. Were these projects all part of the

14 five-year plan?

15 A. I don't know what you mean by the

16 five-year plan.

17 Q. Did the hotel have a five-year plan from

18 2019?

19 A. Again, I don't know what you mean by the

20 five-year plan.

21 Q. What was involved with the switch gear

22 replacement?

23 A. I think they had to apply for permits

24 and such. I -- I don't know the details of the

Page 149 1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

Q. Does he give Mr. Warner regular updates?

3 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.

4 BY THE WITNESS:

5 A. No.

2

6 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

7 Q. How frequently do you receive updates

8 from Mr. Rosati about the status of the renovation?

A. He'll give me the progress of what's

10 going on, but it's hard to determine the completion

11 date with all the delays during COVID and

12 unforeseen, you know, expansion of projects of --

13 during the shower pan replacement project, it may

14 be discovered that other -- you know, additional

15 rooms are impacted.

16 Q. Did he give you estimates of how long

17 the projects were supposed to last?

18 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

19 BY THE WITNESS:

20 A. Those estimates continued to change and

21 it's still ongoing.

22 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

23 Q. But does he give you estimated

24 timeframes of when he expects projects to conclude

Page 150

1 project.

2 Q. What is your understanding of how long

3 the hotel would be required to shut down for the

4 switch gear to be replaced once the permit was

5 approved?

6 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

7 BY THE WITNESS:

8 A. I don't know.

9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

10 Q. Who would have -- who was responsible

11 for overseeing the switch gear project?

12 A. We engaged a third party.

13 Q. Who is the third party?

14 A. Solid Rock and --

15 Q. And -- sorry.

16 A. -- there's a person that is in charge of

17 the capital projects overseeing those projects.

18 Q. Who is that?

19 A. Thomas Rosati.

20 Q. Did he provide you updates on the

21 timeframe for projects?

22 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

23 BY THE WITNESS:

A. No, he does not give me regular updates.

Page 152 and how much money or additional funding is needed?

A. I believe he gets updates from Four

3 Seasons employees who are working on certain

4 projects.

6

16

17

5 Q. Do you ever request updates?

A. When I speak with him, he -- he gives me

7 certain updates, but he does not send me updates

8 regularly.

9 Q. When he sends you updates, are they

10 verbal or are they printed materials or electronic

11 materials?

12 A. They're usually verbal.

13 Q. Does he sometimes give you status

14 reports that are either printed or electronic for

15 you to review?

A. He does not provide reports.

Q. Do you get annual reports from

18 Mr. Rosati about the status of all the renovations

19 or any of the renovations?

20 A. No, I do not.

21 Q. Mr. Warner hasn't asked you to demand

22 reports about how long the renovations or how much

23 the renovations are costing?

A. No, he hasn't demanded updates.



April 14, 2023 153–156

Page 156

		Page 153
Q.	Do you give a blank check to	_

- 2 Mr. Rosati's firm -- Rosati's firm or is there a
- 3 contract that sets forth certain benchmarks of when
- 4 certain projects need to be completed?
- 5 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 6 BY THE WITNESS:
- 7 A. No, I do not give bench -- blank checks
- 8 to Mr. Rosati.
- 9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 10 Q. Do you have contracts with his firm that
- 11 sets certain benchmarks of when projects need to be
- 12 completed by?
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. There's no contracts setting deadlines
- 15 or penalties for taking too long on a project?
- 16 MR. BOLAND: Objection, vague.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. There's a contract, but there's no set
- 19 timelines.
- 20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 21 Q. Does the contract have any sort of
- 22 timeframe for when it's expected to complete?
- 23 A. I don't recall.
- 24 Q. Does the contract actually include the

- Page 155
 A. Mr. Rosati is a third party. He works
- 2 for a third party firm called Solid Rock. He does
- 3 not report to me. He does not report to Four
- 4 Seasons.
- 5 Q. But my question is, who has oversight of
- 6 Mr. Rosati and Solid Rock?
- 7 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 8 BY THE WITNESS:
- 9 A. Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts have engaged
- 10 them to advise on projects, has engaged Solid Rock
- 11 to advise on projects.
- 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 13 Q. Since they're advising, is it your
- 14 testimony that Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts does not
- 15 have the authority to overrule Solid Rock on
- 16 renovation projects?
- 17 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 18 BY THE WITNESS:
- 19 A. They recommend the projects, and it's up
- 20 to Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts to decide if we would
- 21 like to implement those projects.
- 22 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 23 Q. When they recommend projects, do they
- 24 provide a proposal that includes the scope of work

- 1 scope of work?
- 2 A. I don't think the scope of work is
- 3 specifically defined in the contract.
- 4 Q. Is there any limit to the oversight or
- 5 authority that Mr. Rosati has for doing renovations
- 6 at the Four Seasons Hotel New York?
- 7 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the
- 8 question.
- 9 BY THE WITNESS:
- 10 A. He has no authority.
- 11 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 12 Q. Who has the authority?
- 13 A. It would be Four Seasons.
- 14 Q. Is it your testimony that the Four
- 15 Seasons is the one overseeing the progress of the
- 16 renovations at the Four Seasons Hotel New York?
- 17 A. Yes. Thomas serves as an advisor.
- 18 Q. Who was paying Mr. Rosati, Mr. Warner or
- 19 the Four Seasons or someone else?
- 20 A. Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts pays
- 21 Mr. Rosati.
- Q. But it's your testimony that he reports
- 23 not to Ty Warner Hotels & Reports or Mr. Warner or
- 24 yourself but to the Four Seasons?

- 1 and a estimated budget?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. And does that proposal also include a
- 4 proposed or estimated timeframe for the project to
- 5 take?
- 6 A. I don't recall.
- 7 Q. Is it one contract or does it -- or one
- 8 proposal, or does every renovation or capital
- 9 project that they propose have its own separate
- 10 proposal?
- 11 A. They would be proposed separately.
- 12 MR. BRUSTEIN: We're going to call for the
- 13 production of those proposals.
- 14 MR. BOLAND: Issue a document request.
- 15 MR. BRUSTEIN: All right. At this point if
- 16 you want to take a break.
- 17 MR. BOLAND: Okay.
- 18 MR. BRUSTEIN: How much time do you want for
- 19 your break?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: How much time do you need for --
- 21 how much time -- is there something these people
- 22 can do something within a half hour and be back, or
- 23 do we need, like, a little longer than that?
- 24 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We're going off the record



April 14, 2023 157–160

1	D 45
1	PRESENT:
2	
3	BRUSTEIN LAW PLCC,
4	(299 Broadway, 17th Floor,
5	New York, New York 10007,
6	212-233-3900), by:
7	MR. EVAN CRAIG BRUSTEIN,
8	evan@brusteinlaw.com,
9	and
10	RISMAN & RISMAN, P.C.,
11	(299 Broadway, 17th Floor,
12	New York, New York 10007,
13	212-233-6400), by:
14	MS. MAYA RISMAN,
15	info@risman-law.com,
16	appeared Zoom Video Conference on beha
17	of the Plaintiffs;
18	•
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
	Page 16
1	PRESENT (Continued):
2	
3	SMITH GAMBRELL RUSSELL,
4	(1301 Avenue of the Americas, 21st Floor,
5	New York, New York 10019,
6	212-218-8760), by:
7	MS. KATHRYN T. LUNDY,
8	klundy@sgrlaw.com,
9	appeared via Zoom Video Conference on
10	behalf of the Defendants Hotel 57
11	Services, LLC, Hotel 57, LLC, Ty Warner
12	Hotels & Resorts, LLC, H. Ty Warner, an
13	the deponent;
14	
1	
15	SMITH GAMBRELL RUSSELL,
	SMITH GAMBRELL RUSSELL, (311 South Wacker Drive, Suite 3000,
15	•
15 16	(311 South Wacker Drive, Suite 3000,
15 16 17	(311 South Wacker Drive, Suite 3000, Chicago, Illinois 60606,
15 16 17 18	(311 South Wacker Drive, Suite 3000, Chicago, Illinois 60606, 312-360-6000), by:
15 16 17 18 19	(311 South Wacker Drive, Suite 3000, Chicago, Illinois 60606, 312-360-6000), by: MR. JAMES J. BOLAND,
15 16 17 18 19 20	(311 South Wacker Drive, Suite 3000, Chicago, Illinois 60606, 312-360-6000), by: MR. JAMES J. BOLAND, jboland@sgrlaw.com,
15 16 17 18 19 20 21	(311 South Wacker Drive, Suite 3000, Chicago, Illinois 60606, 312-360-6000), by: MR. JAMES J. BOLAND, jboland@sgrlaw.com, appeared on behalf of the Defendants
	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13



April 14, 2023 161–164

	Daga 101	ı	Daga 100
1	Page 161 PRESENT (Continued):	1	Page 163 Q. When did they become involved in the
2	,	2	Four Seasons Santa Barbara?
3	STOKES & WAGNER, ALC,	3	A. I don't recall.
4	(903 Hanshaw Road,	4	Q. Is the Four Seasons Santa Barbara also
5	Ithaca, New York 14850,	5	closed for renovations?
6	607-257-5165), by:	6	A. Four Seasons Santa Barbara closed on the
7	MR. PAUL ERIC WAGNER,	7	same date as Four Seasons New York under the local
8	pwagner@stokeswagner.com,	8	mandate, and it remains closed. During the
9	appeared via Zoom Video Conference on	9	closure, with all the uncertainties with COVID, we
10	behalf of the Defendant FSR	10	decided to work on some CapEx projects to improve
11	International Hotels, Inc.	11	the infrastructure.
12	international Floters, Inc.	12	
	ALCO DECENT.		Q. When did you decide to keep the hotel
13	ALSO PRESENT:	13	closed for capital improvement projects for Four
14	MS. AMANDA YONUSHATIS, The Videographer.	14	Seasons Hotel New York?
15	DEDODTED DV. 14 OOLIELINE 14 THAOLIC	15	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
16	REPORTED BY: JACQUELINE M. TIMMONS,	16	BY THE WITNESS:
17	C.S.R., R.M.R., R.D.R.	17	A. I don't recall the timing.
18	Certificate No. 84-2949.	18	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
19		19	Q. Was it before or after the medical
20		20	personnel left?
21		21	MR. BOLAND: Same objection.
22		22	
23		23	A. I can't give you a clear cut answer, as
24		24	there were projects that were in progress already
	Page 162		Page 164
1	Page 162 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the	1	Page 164 and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing.
1 2			
	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the		and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing.
2	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m.	2	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
2	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the	2 3 4	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not
2 3 4	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons.	2 3 4	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the
2 3 4 5	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure.	2 3 4 5	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New
2 3 4 5 6	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read	2 3 4 5 6 7	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York?
2 3 4 5 6 7	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.)	2 3 4 5 6 7	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.) CATHY HWANG,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes facts.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.) CATHY HWANG, called as a witness herein, having been previously	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes facts. BY THE WITNESS:
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.) CATHY HWANG, called as a witness herein, having been previously duly sworn and having testified, was examined and	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes facts. BY THE WITNESS: A. Can you repeat your question, please.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.) CATHY HWANG, called as a witness herein, having been previously duly sworn and having testified, was examined and testified further as follows:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes facts. BY THE WITNESS: A. Can you repeat your question, please. BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.) CATHY HWANG, called as a witness herein, having been previously duly sworn and having testified, was examined and testified further as follows: EXAMINATION (Resumed)	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes facts. BY THE WITNESS: A. Can you repeat your question, please. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. You sitting here today you don't
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.) CATHY HWANG, called as a witness herein, having been previously duly sworn and having testified, was examined and testified further as follows: EXAMINATION (Resumed) BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes facts. BY THE WITNESS: A. Can you repeat your question, please. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. You sitting here today you don't remember if the decision to not reopen the hotel so
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.) CATHY HWANG, called as a witness herein, having been previously duly sworn and having testified, was examined and testified further as follows: EXAMINATION (Resumed) BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Ms. Hwang, when was Solid Rock first	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes facts. BY THE WITNESS: A. Can you repeat your question, please. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. You sitting here today you don't remember if the decision to not reopen the hotel so that capital improvement projects could occur was
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.) CATHY HWANG, called as a witness herein, having been previously duly sworn and having testified, was examined and testified further as follows: EXAMINATION (Resumed) BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Ms. Hwang, when was Solid Rock first retained?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes facts. BY THE WITNESS: A. Can you repeat your question, please. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. You sitting here today you don't remember if the decision to not reopen the hotel so that capital improvement projects could occur was made before or after the medical personnel left the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.) CATHY HWANG, called as a witness herein, having been previously duly sworn and having testified, was examined and testified further as follows: EXAMINATION (Resumed) BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Ms. Hwang, when was Solid Rock first retained? A. In 2019.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes facts. BY THE WITNESS: A. Can you repeat your question, please. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. You sitting here today you don't remember if the decision to not reopen the hotel so that capital improvement projects could occur was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.) CATHY HWANG, called as a witness herein, having been previously duly sworn and having testified, was examined and testified further as follows: EXAMINATION (Resumed) BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Ms. Hwang, when was Solid Rock first retained? A. In 2019. Q. And were they only retained for the Four	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes facts. BY THE WITNESS: A. Can you repeat your question, please. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. You sitting here today you don't remember if the decision to not reopen the hotel so that capital improvement projects could occur was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Same objection.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.) CATHY HWANG, called as a witness herein, having been previously duly sworn and having testified, was examined and testified further as follows: EXAMINATION (Resumed) BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Ms. Hwang, when was Solid Rock first retained? A. In 2019. Q. And were they only retained for the Four Seasons Hotel New York, or were they retained for any other properties or entities?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes facts. BY THE WITNESS: A. Can you repeat your question, please. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. You sitting here today you don't remember if the decision to not reopen the hotel so that capital improvement projects could occur was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Same objection. BY THE WITNESS:
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.) CATHY HWANG, called as a witness herein, having been previously duly sworn and having testified, was examined and testified further as follows: EXAMINATION (Resumed) BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Ms. Hwang, when was Solid Rock first retained? A. In 2019. Q. And were they only retained for the Four Seasons Hotel New York, or were they retained for any other properties or entities?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes facts. BY THE WITNESS: A. Can you repeat your question, please. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. You sitting here today you don't remember if the decision to not reopen the hotel so that capital improvement projects could occur was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Same objection. BY THE WITNESS: A. There wasn't a clear cut timing of when the decisions were made, because the hotel closed
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.) CATHY HWANG, called as a witness herein, having been previously duly sworn and having testified, was examined and testified further as follows: EXAMINATION (Resumed) BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Ms. Hwang, when was Solid Rock first retained? A. In 2019. Q. And were they only retained for the Four Seasons Hotel New York, or were they retained for any other properties or entities? A. To best of my recollection, they started with Four Seasons New York and	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes facts. BY THE WITNESS: A. Can you repeat your question, please. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. You sitting here today you don't remember if the decision to not reopen the hotel so that capital improvement projects could occur was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Same objection. BY THE WITNESS: A. There wasn't a clear cut timing of when the decisions were made, because the hotel closed due to COVID and then during the closure, you know,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.) CATHY HWANG, called as a witness herein, having been previously duly sworn and having testified, was examined and testified further as follows: EXAMINATION (Resumed) BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Ms. Hwang, when was Solid Rock first retained? A. In 2019. Q. And were they only retained for the Four Seasons Hotel New York, or were they retained for any other properties or entities? A. To best of my recollection, they started with Four Seasons New York and Q. Where did they go?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes facts. BY THE WITNESS: A. Can you repeat your question, please. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. You sitting here today you don't remember if the decision to not reopen the hotel so that capital improvement projects could occur was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Same objection. BY THE WITNESS: A. There wasn't a clear cut timing of when the decisions were made, because the hotel closed
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the record at 1:31 p.m. MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I trouble you for what the last question was, Ms. Timmons. THE REPORTER: Sure. (WHEREUPON, the record was read by the reporter as requested.) CATHY HWANG, called as a witness herein, having been previously duly sworn and having testified, was examined and testified further as follows: EXAMINATION (Resumed) BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Ms. Hwang, when was Solid Rock first retained? A. In 2019. Q. And were they only retained for the Four Seasons Hotel New York, or were they retained for any other properties or entities? A. To best of my recollection, they started with Four Seasons New York and Q. Where did they go? A. Then they moved on to they also	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	and in the plans, so I can't recall the timing. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you don't know if the decision to not reopen the hotel was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes facts. BY THE WITNESS: A. Can you repeat your question, please. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. You sitting here today you don't remember if the decision to not reopen the hotel so that capital improvement projects could occur was made before or after the medical personnel left the Four Seasons Hotel New York? MR. BOLAND: Same objection. BY THE WITNESS: A. There wasn't a clear cut timing of when the decisions were made, because the hotel closed due to COVID and then during the closure, you know, there were ongoing projects which continued. So



Page 165

CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 165–168

Page 168

- 2 Q. Did you -- no, sorry.
- 3 A. Yeah. I said I can't recall the exact
- 4 timing.
- 5 Q. When did COVID stop being a basis for Ty
- 6 Warner Hotels & Resorts to reopen Four Seasons
- 7 Hotel New York?
- 8 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the
- 9 question and assumes facts.
- 10 You can answer.
- 11 BY THE WITNESS:
- 12 A. It continued on for a long length of
- 13 time, as we were concerned for the safety of the
- 14 employees. And to reopen, it would also include
- 15 the safety of the guests.
- 16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 17 Q. Was there a certain time that you
- 18 believed the hotel could reopen safely?
- 19 A. We didn't have the safety protocols and,
- 20 you know, plan that would ensure the safety of the
- 21 guests. Four Seasons had presented a plan and
- 22 ownership felt that it lacked, so the decision was
- 23 to keep the hotel closed.
- 24 Q. You said that ownership believed the

- Page 167 Q. It's a 54-page document that goes all
- 2 the way through 9 -- WD 9427.
- 2 the way though 9 -- VD 9427
- 3 MR. BOLAND: Okay.
- 4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 5 Q. And it's titled, COVID-19 Reopening
- 6 Communications Guidance and Materials, Public
- 7 Relations and Social Media, and it says it was last
- 8 updated August 14, 2020.
 - Do you see that?
- 10 A. Yes.

9

- 11 Q. Is this part of the -- or the materials
- 12 that you received from Four Seasons about a
- 13 proposal to reopen the hotel?
- 14 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.
- 15 BY THE WITNESS:
- 16 A. I don't recall if I've received this
- 17 document before.
- 18 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 19 Q. But you did receive a detailed plan
- 20 about how to open the hotel in a way that Four
- 21 Seasons claimed was safe, right?
- 22 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 23 BY THE WITNESS:
- 24 A. Initially I don't think we received any

- 1 plan lacked what?
- 2 A. The proper safety protocol.
- 3 Q. And when you say ownership, is that
- 4 Mr. Warner?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 MR. BRUSTEIN: I'm now going to mark as
- 7 Exhibit -- Hwang Exhibit 14. This is a new
- 8 exhibit, so, unfortunately, you're going to have to
- 9 download it, but it begins with WD 9374. And I'm
- 10 sharing it in the chat box. This is a document
- 11 that was just provided by the Warner defendants
- 12 late yesterday, and so I was not able to provide it
- 13 in advance.
- 14 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was
- 15 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit
- No. 14, for identification, as of
- 17 4/14/23.)
- 18 MR. BRUSTEIN: So I've shared it in the chat
- 19 box and I'm also going to open it so that you can
- 20 look at this. I'm going to share my screen.
- 21 MR. BOLAND: What is it again? I see
- 22 something -- is it 8 -- was it 9374 something?
- 23 MR. BRUSTEIN: 9374.
- 24 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

- 1 plan from Four Seasons.
- 2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 3 Q. I'm talking about in the summer of 2020.
- 4 Are you claiming that you didn't receive any plans
- 5 in the summer of 2020 about reopening the hotel?
- 6 A. As it relates to safety protocol, I
- 7 don't believe it was initially included in their
- 8 proposal to reopen.
- 9 Q. Prior to reopening the hotel to medical
- 10 staff that were working in the hospitals with
- 11 people dying from COVID, were any safety protocols
- 12 put in place to make sure that the hotel's
- 13 employees and the medical personnel could maintain
- 14 safety?
- 15 A. Are you referring to prior to March
- 16 of 2020?
- 17 Q. No. I'm referring to prior to
- 18 Mr. Warner's decision to open the hotel to medical
- 19 personnel, were there safety protocols put in place
- 20 so that the hotel employees could be safe when they
- 21 housed the doctors and nurses who were treating the
- 22 people dying in the New York City hospitals from
- 23 COVID-19?
- 24 A. There were safety plans presented by the



April 14, 2023 169-172

Page 171

		Page 169
1	hotel.	I don't know if it was implemented and the
2	timing	of it.
3	Q.	Did the hotel hire scientific experts to
١.		

- 4 make sure that there was a safety protocol to keep
- 5 everyone safe or as safe as possible?
- 6 A. Yes, they hired a third-party expert.
- 7 Q. Did Ty Warner Hotel & Resorts also hire
- a safety protocols expert?
- A. No. We relied on our hospitality 9
- 10 advisors.
- 11 Q. And when you say your hospitality
- 12 advisors, who are they?
- 13 A. Solid Rock.
- 14 Q. Now, Four Seasons Hotel relied on Johns
- 15 Hopkins University's medical and scientific
- 16 experts, right?
- 17 A. Yes.
- Q. And you opposed their reopening plans 18
- 19 because of Solid Rock and their expertise?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the
- 21 question.
- 22 BY THE WITNESS:
- 23 A. Four Seasons presented Lead With Care,
- 24 which was a global plan. It wasn't tailored to the

- MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- BY THE WITNESS:
- 3 A. The contacts with employees were
- 4 minimized. Third party services were engaged to
- 5 clean up guest rooms. There were no changing of
- 6 linens. Four Seasons employees would simply drop
- 7 off clean linens outside the medical professional's
- door, but not enter the rooms itself.
- 9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 10 Q. Is Sebastian a doctor?
- 11 A. I don't know.
- 12 Q. Is he a nurse?
- 13 A. I don't know.
- 14 Q. Does he have a science degree of any
- 15 kind?
- 16 I don't recall.
- 17 Q. Was he brought in specifically because
- 18 of COVID-19?
- 19 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 20 BY THE WITNESS:
- 21 A. I don't know. He's an employee of Solid
- 22 Rock.
- 23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 24 Q. As an officer of a hotel corporation,

- 1 hotel specifically.
- 2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 3 Q. It was in consultation with Johns
- 4 Hopkins University's medical and scientific
- 5 advisors, though, correct?
- A. That's what I was informed. 6
- 7 Q. Are you aware of the medical and
- 8 scientific expertise of Solid Rock?
- 9 A. There was an employee who looked into
- 10 and researched safety devices and safety protocols
- 11 from Solid Rock.
- 12 Q. What was that employee's science --
- 13 scientific or medical background?
- 14 A. I don't know.
- 15 Q. And when you say they looked into, did
- 16 they Google stuff?
- 17 A. I don't know.
- 18 Q. What's the name of this employee?
- 19 A. His first name's Sebastian. I don't
- 20 recall his last name.
- 21 Q. Did Mr. Warner have concerns about
- 22 opening up the -- the hotel to the medical workers
- 23 at the time that he had employees working in the
- 24 hotel?

- Page 172
- 1 you relied on Sebastian's expertise in determining
- 2 whether or not it was safe to reopen the Four
- 3 Seasons Hotel New York?
- MR. BOLAND: Objection, vague. 4
- 5 BY THE WITNESS:
- 6 A. As I stated before, the Lead With Care
- plan was not tailored to the hotel. I don't think
- it was suitable for the hotel.
- 9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- Q. Did you rely on Sebastian's COVID-19
- 11 expertise in determining whether or not it was safe
- 12 to reopen the Santa Barbara property?
- 13 MR. BOLAND: Same objection.
- 14 BY THE WITNESS:
- 15 A. Same thing with Santa Barbara, there was
- 16 no specific plan presented for the property.
- 17 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 18 Q. Other than Sebastian, maybe Googling
- 19 COVID --
- 20 MR. BOLAND: That's not what he said.
- 21 MR. BRUSTEIN: Excuse me. I'm going to ask
- 22 the questions and you can --
- 23 MR. BOLAND: I know what you're doing. I know
- 24 what you're doing. Sorry.



April 14, 2023 173–176

Page 176

	Pa	age
MR. BRUSTEIN:	I'm glad that you know ho	ow a

2 deposition works.

1

- 3 MR. BOLAND: No, I know what you're doing. I
- 4 know what you're doing.
- 5 MR. BRUSTEIN: You know, we're going to call
- 6 the court if you continue to act in this manner.
- 7 It's inappropriate. And I've asked you repeatedly
- 8 not to disrupt the deposition. Can you control
- 9 yourself and limit yourself to objection and if you
- 10 need to direction your witness not to answer a
- 11 question, but keep your commentary and your
- 12 laughter and your head nods and other coaching of
- 13 the witness out of this, please.
- 14 MR. BOLAND: Not happening.
- 15 You can answer.
- 16 Ask your questions.
- 17 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 18 Q. Are you aware of any other efforts that
- 19 were made by Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts; Hotel 57
- 20 Services, LLC; Hotel 57, LLC; yourself; Mr. Warner
- 21 or Solid Rock to figure out how to safely reopen
- 22 the Four Seasons Hotel New York other than
- 23 Sebastian Googling?
- 24 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

- Page 175 Q. I'm sorry, you said you requested that?
- 2 A. Yes.

1

4

7

- 3 Q. And did they?
 - A. There may have been another revised plan
- 5 more detailed out, but, again, we didn't feel that
- 6 it was appropriate for the hotel.
 - Q. What about --
- 8 A. Ownership felt --
- Q. Sorry.
- 10 A. Ownership felt that it wasn't
- 11 appropriate for the hotel.
- 12 Q. And when you say "ownership," is that
- 13 Sebastian or Mr. Warner or someone else?
- 14 A. Sebastian is not ownership. I'd say --
- 15 Q. So is that --
- 16 A. -- Mr. Warner and myself.
- 17 Q. What objection did Mr. Warner and you
- 18 have to the safety protocols that were offered or
- 19 suggested by the Four Seasons proposal?
- 20 A. I don't recall the specifics.
- 21 Q. Did you write them down anywhere?
- 22 A. I don't think so.
 - Q. Did you e-mail the Four Seasons your
- 24 objections to their plans so they could try and

Page 174

- 1 BY THE WITNESS:
- 2 A. I did not say Sebastian Googled. I
- 3 don't know if he Googled.
- 4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 5 Q. So he may not have even Googled?
- 6 A. I don't know what he did for his
- 7 research. I don't know.
- 8 Q. So it could have been more or less than
- 9 even Googling?
- 10 A. I don't know.
- 11 Q. So are you aware of anything
- 12 specifically that was done to research how to
- 13 safely reopen the Four Seasons Hotel New York after
- 14 March of 2020?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 A. Can you repeat your question, please.
- 18 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 19 Q. Are you aware of anything specifically
- 20 that was done to research how to safely reopen the
- 21 Four Seasons Hotel New York after March of 2020?
- A. Ownership asked the operator to come
- 23 back with a plan that's specific for the hotel and
- 24 tailored to the hotel's needs.

1 address it?

23

- A. Again, to my recollection, we requested
- 3 a more tailored plan of safety proposals for the --
- 4 for Four Seasons New York.
- 5 Q. Right, but you testified they gave you a
- 6 more detailed plan and that one still didn't suit
- 7 your needs, right?
- 8 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 9 BY THE WITNESS:
- 10 A. I meant -- I meant a plan that's
- 11 tailored for the hotel. We didn't -- we didn't
- 12 feel that it was tailored at all for the hotel.
- 13 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 14 Q. Right. That was about the first plan I
- 15 thought. Was that about the second plan, as well?
- 16 A. Yes.

- Q. So did you give them specific objections
- 18 as to why it wasn't tailored specifically to the
- 19 Four Seasons Hotel New York?
- 20 A. I gave them general comments, no. So no
- 21 specifics.
- 22 Q. And did you provide those in writing?
- 23 Or verbally over the phone?
- 24 A. I don't recall.



April 14, 2023 177–180

Page 180

	ŀ	'nag
Q.	Well, if you were concerned about the	

- 2 specifics and making sure that it was properly
- 3 conveyed, did you give them written instructions so
- 4 they could follow the objections that you and
- 5 Mr. Warner had and try to reopen the hotel safely?
- 6 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 7 BY THE WITNESS:
- 8 A. It may have been over a phone call.
- 9 That's why I don't recall if it was e-mail or phone
- 10 call. I can't recall.
- 11 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 12 Q. How many plans were offered by the Four
- 13 Seasons to reopen the Four Seasons Hotel New York?
- 14 A. I don't recall.
- 15 Q. Was it more or less than five?
- 16 A. Are we including informal plans?
- 17 Q. Let's start with formal plans.
- 18 A. Over the course of three years, I -- I
- 19 can't tell you if it was higher or lower than five.
- Q. Informal plans reduced to writing, more
- 21 or less than five?
- 22 A. Informal plans which did not include
- 23 projections, financial projections and market
- 24 analysis, including those, I would say over five.

- Page 179

 1 it lacked profitability for the hotel to reopen at
- 2 those points in time.
- 3 Q. Was there a specific price point that
- 4 you required, that Mr. Warner required in the
- 5 proposal, to be able to reopen the Four Seasons
- 6 Hotel New York?
- 7 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 8 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. The hotel is a business. We would
- 10 expect the business to make a profit in order to
- 11 reopen.
- 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 13 Q. Is it your testimony that every proposal
- 14 put forth by the Four Seasons included Mr. Warner
- 15 taking a loss?
- 16 A. They gave multiple year projections, and
- 17 in the initial years, it certainly would take a
- 18 loss.
- 19 Q. How long did the proposals say it would
- 20 be before the hotel would be profitable?
- 21 A. I don't recall.
- 22 Q. Did you ever discuss getting paycheck
- 23 protection funding?
- 24 A. Discuss with whom?

Page 178

- 1 Q. Did Mr. Warner accept any of those
- 2 plans?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. Did Mr. Warner reject every single plan,
- 5 both the informal and the formal ones presented by
- 6 Four Seasons to reopen the Four Seasons Hotel New
- 7 York since March 2020?
- 8 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 9 BY THE WITNESS:
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 12 Q. Did he have the same objections for each
- 13 plan, or was there -- were the plans getting closer
- 14 to Mr. Warner's criteria to be able to reopen the
- 15 hotel?
- 16 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. When you say plan, do you mean the
- 19 reopening plan in general or just the safety
- 20 protocol plans?
- 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 22 Q. The reopening plan.
- A. So for the reopening plan, if it
- 24 includes financial projections, we felt that it --

- Q. With Mr. Warner.
- 2 A. Yes.

- 3 Q. What did that conversation consist of?
- 4 A. He was open to it.
- Q. Is there a reason that you did not
- 6 seek -- did you seek PPP funding for the employees
- 7 of the hotel?
- 8 A. We found out the hotel would not qualify
- 9 for the program.
- 10 Q. How come?
- 11 A. Head count. It was not considered a
- 12 small business.
- 13 Q. Now, is it your testimony that the New
- 14 York Four Seasons is -- the New York Hotel Four
- 15 Seasons is -- sorry, the Four Seasons Hotel New
- 16 York is not causing a loss for Mr. Warner as it
- 17 sits shuttered?
- 18 A. There's a loss.
- 19 Q. Based on the projections from the Four
- 20 Seasons, is it more of a loss for the Four Seasons
- 21 Hotel New York to remain shuttered or for it to
- 22 reopen?
- 23 MR. BOLAND: No, object to the form.
- 24 BY THE WITNESS:



April 14, 2023 181–184

Page 183

		Page 181
Α.	I don't recall all the different	

- 2 scenarios that were presented, but it was not
- 3 profitable in the initial years.
- 4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 5 Q. You would agree it's not profitable for
- 6 the hotel to remain closed as well, though, right?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. But sitting here today as the chief
- 9 financial officer for Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts
- 10 and Hotel 57, LLC, and Hotel 57 Services, LLC, you
- 11 can't say with any degree of certainty whether it's
- 12 more or less profitable for the hotel to have
- 13 reopened or to have remained closed under any of
- 14 the proposals put forth by Four Seasons?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 A. Can you repeat your question again.
- 18 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 19 Q. You testified that you're an officer in
- 20 all of the Warner entities involved in the
- 21 ownership of the Four Seasons Hotel New York,
- 22 right?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. And you're the chief financial officer

1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

- 2 Q. I'm going to -- I'm going to break down
- 3 with date numbers, okay, but I'm going to use small
- 4 ones to make this simple. If it cost Mr. Warner \$2
- 5 a day to keep the hotel closed, but reopening the
- 6 hotel would only cost him \$1 a day, would
- 7 Mr. Warner and Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts still
- 8 keep the hotel closed because it was losing a
- 9 dollar a day?
- 10 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. And no
- 11 foundation and assumes facts.
- 12 You can answer.
- 13 BY THE WITNESS:
- 14 A. As an officer of the company, I would
- 15 advise Mr. Warner to select the option that would
- 16 minimize his loss and maximize his profitability.
- 17 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 18 Q. So you would, under that scenario,
- 19 recommend reopening the hotel?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Objection, incomplete
- 21 hypothetical.
- 22 You can answer.
- 23 BY THE WITNESS:
- 24 A. If it was going to -- but, again, it

- 1 for each of those entities?
- 2 A. I'm the chief financial officer for just
- 3 Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts.
- 4 Q. Oh, you're not the chief financial
- 5 officer for the other entities?
- 6 A. No.
- 7 Q. As the officer for all of those entities
- 8 and the chief financial officer for Ty Warner
- 9 Hotels & Resorts, sitting here today, you can't say
- 10 whether it's profit -- it's more profitable for the
- 11 hotel to remain shuttered or to reopen?
- MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 13 BY THE WITNESS:
- 14 A. We weren't going to open up the hotel
- 15 knowing that it's not going to be profitable.
- 16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 17 Q. So even if it was less profitable to
- 18 remain shuttered, you wouldn't open up the hotel
- 19 for a loss?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 21 BY THE WITNESS:
- 22 A. If it was less profitable, is that what
- 23 you said? I don't understand.
- 24 Can you repeat your question.

- Page 184

 1 would not be Mr. Warner's decision to open up the
- 2 hotel. It would be the Four Seasons' decision to
- 3 open up the hotel.
- 4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 5 Q. Just without any money?
- 6 MR. BOLAND: Well, object to the form, assumes
- 7 facts.
- 8 BY THE WITNESS:
- 9 A. Four Seasons can get their money if they
- 10 like. No one is stopping them from, you know,
- 11 seeking financing to open up the hotel.
- 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 13 Q. Is it your position the Four Seasons
- 14 could just go ahead and pay the employees if they
- 15 wanted?
- 16 A. Yes, they paid their employees what they
- 17 want.
- 18 Q. And you're referring to the employees of
- 19 the Four Seasons Hotel New York?
- 20 A. I'm referring to -- I'm sorry? Can you
- 21 repeat your question.
- 22 Q. The employees of the Four Seasons --
- 23 sorry. The employees of the Four Seasons Hotel New
- 24 York.



Page 185

CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 185–188

Page 187

1	MR BOLAND	: Object to the form.
	IVIII. DOLAND	. Object to the follow.

- 2 BY THE WITNESS:
- 3 A. All I heard was employees to the Four
- 4 Seasons Hotel New York.
- 5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 6 Q. You asked who I was referring to, which
- 7 employees. So I'm referring -- you're saying the
- 8 Four Seasons could pay the employees of the Four
- 9 Seasons Hotel New York if the Four Seasons wanted
- 10 to?
- 11 A. Yes. It's up to Four Seasons to decide
- 12 what employees are paid.
- 13 Q. And so it's not just Ty Warner Hotels &
- 14 Resorts' responsibility to pay the employees of
- 15 Four Seasons Hotel New York?
- 16 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the
- 17 question.
- 18 BY THE WITNESS:
- 19 A. Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts is providing
- 20 funding for operating deficits, including payroll,
- 21 during closure. Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts does
- 22 not get to decide what employees are paid.
- 23 It is up to Four Seasons to decide what
- 24 employees are paid.

- A. You have to take the businesses, the
- 2 head count for the businesses collectively --
- 3 Q. When you --
- 4 A. -- to apply for PPP.
- 5 Q. I'm sorry?
- 6 A. You have to count the head count of all
- 7 the employees for all the businesses collectively.
- 8 You can't say there's just -- we'll apply for a
- 9 program for 12 employees. So for --
- 10 Q. When you say all the businesses, do you
- 11 mean the 30 or 40 entities that Mr. Warner has?
- 12 A. Right.
- 13 Q. Is it your position that the employees
- 14 at the time that the Four Seasons Hotel New York
- 15 and the Four Seasons in Santa Barbara are part of
- 16 the same entity?
- 17 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 18 BY THE WITNESS:
- 19 A. I think you're confusing the program.
- 20 That's not how it works. It's not by entity. It's
- 21 by number of employees.
- 22 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 23 Q. And so do you consider the Four Seasons
- 24 Hotel New York employees and the Four Seasons Santa

- 1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 2 Q. Did Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts, LLC,
- 3 receive any PPP money?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. Did they lay off any employees during
- 6 the pandemic?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. How many?
- 9 A. I would say half the department.
- 10 Q. How many people is that?
- 11 A. Approximately five.
- 12 Q. Is there a reason Ty Warner Hotels &
- 13 Resorts did not apply for PPP money for those five
- 14 employees?
- 15 A. It didn't qualify.
- 16 Q. How come?
- 17 A. Head count.
- 18 Q. How many employees work at Ty Warner
- 19 Hotels & Resorts?
- 20 A. Right now there's probably about a
- 21 dozen. At the time I think there were less.
- 22 Q. So what -- what was your understanding
- 23 of how many employees was the cutoff for PPP
- 24 eligibility?

- Page 188
- 1 Barbara employees all under the Ty Warner Hotels &
- 2 Resorts umbrella as employees of Ty Warner Hotels?
- MR. BOLAND: Sorry, object to the form.
- 4 BY THE WITNESS:
- 5 A. Four Seasons' employees do not fall
- 6 under the umbrella of Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts,
- 7 LLC.
- 8 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 9 Q. So what employees prevented Ty Warner
- 10 Hotels & Resorts from qualifying for PPP money?
- 11 A. It would be all the different
- 12 businesses, like I said, but they do not fall under
- 13 the umbrella of Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts.
- 14 Q. Do they fall under Ty Company?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 17 Q. Do they fall under Ty, Inc.?
- 18 MR. BOLAND: Same objection.
- 19 BY THE WITNESS:
- 20 A. No.
- 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 22 Q. What company do they fall under?
- A. They fall into the individual legal
- 24 entities.



CATHY HWANG

April 14, 2023

SE	LENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASO	NS	HOTELS 189–192
4	Page 189 Q. Did you actually try and apply for PPP	4	Page 191
1 2		1 2	Warner Hotels & Resorts?
3	money for Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts? A. Yes. We looked into it, but we didn't	3	A. Yes.
	•		Q. Can you please explain to me what you
4	actually apply for it.	4	mean when you say each individual entity by itself
5	Q. Did you submit an application for the	5	didn't qualify.
6	employees of the Four Seasons Hotel New York?	6	A. So you would have to take TWH, Ty Warner
7	A. No. Again, their	7	Hotels & Resorts employees, along with employees of
8	Q. Why not?	8	other businesses. In aggregate, we didn't qualify.
9	A head count was too high.	9	Q. When you say other businesses, are you
10	MR. BRUSTEIN: Now, let's take a five-minute	10	referring to the Four Seasons Hotel New York
11	break.	11	employees in the aggregate or not?
12	THE WITNESS: Okay.	12	A. There's other businesses like Ty, Inc.,
13	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going off the record	13	Montecito Country Club and, you know, other
14	at 2:07 p.m.	14	properties out in Santa Barbara, as well.
15	(WHEREUPON, a recess was had.)	15	Q. How many employees did Ty, Inc., have
16	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We're going back on the	16	back in January of 2020?
17	record at 2:15 p.m.	17	A. I'd say it was about 200.
18	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	18	Q. So combining Ty, Inc., and Ty Warner
19	Q. Okay. At this point I'm going to ask	19	Hotels & Resorts, you're about 212. That's still
20	that the witness be shown what has previously, or	20	less than the number of employees that your law
21	I'm going to ask that you mark Exhibit 5 as Hwang	21	firm that received the PPP money, right?
22	Exhibit 5, please.	22	A. Right.
23	And I'll share it with electronic	23	Q. Now, did you actually submit an
24	sharing.	24	application on behalf of any of the entities that
_	Page 190	_	Page 192
1	(WHEREUPON, a certain document was	1	you are an officer for?
2	marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit	2	A. I think the question you should ask is,
3	No. 5, for identification, as of	3	what prevented us from filing for PPP.
4	4/14/23.)	4	Q. Sure. What prevented you from filing
5	THE REPORTER: Here's the marked original.	5	for PPP?
6	MR. BOLAND: Okay. Thanks.	6	A. One of the criteria is that if there's
7	THE REPORTER: Okay.	7	alternate source of financing available to an owner
8	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	8	like Ty Warner, then you would not qualify.
9	Q. Smith Gambrell & Russell, that's the	9	Q. What would alternate source what
10	firm that is representing you today, right?	10	alternate source of financing precluded the
11	A. Yes.	11	companies from getting PPP?
12	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	12	,
13	in PPP money?	13	bank and get approved, and he would, then he
14	A. No.	14	wouldn't qualify for the small business PPP loan.
15	Q. And do you see that they were actually	15	Q. So is it your testimony that your

- 17 plus interest? 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. And if you look down at the bottom of

16 forgiven the \$5.53 million, so the entire amount

- 20 the first page, do you see it says 263 jobs
- 21 reported?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. You would agree that that is a lot more
- 24 than the 12 that you said were employed by Ty

- 16 attorneys couldn't apply for a loan at a bank, but
- 17 Mr. Warner was so unique that only he could get a
- 18 loan from a bank?
- 19 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 20 BY THE WITNESS:
- 21 A. Can you repeat your question again,
- 22 please.
- 23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 24 Q. Are you claiming that your own attorneys



CATHY HWANG

April 14, 2023

	THY HWANG ELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASO	N.S	HOTELS 4911 14, 2023
	Page 193	140	Page 195
1		1	MR. BRUSTEIN: Okay. Now, I'm going to mark
2	reason that they applied for PPP money?	2	as Exhibit 9, Hwang Exhibit 9 at this deposition,
3	Withdrawn.	3	and I will put it into the chat, as well.
4	A. I don't know.	4	MR. BOLAND: Do we have a copy of that one or
5	Q. Are you claiming that PPP money was only	5	not?
6	given out to companies that could not get loans	6	THE REPORTER: Yes.
7	from banks?	7	MR. BOLAND: Okay.
8	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	8	(WHEREUPON, a certain document was
9	BY THE WITNESS:	9	marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit
10	A. That's not what I'm claiming.	10	No. 9, for identification, as of
11	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	11	4/14/23.)
12	Q. So let me ask my question again. Did	12	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
13		13	Q. I'm going to share my screen so we can
14	entities, apply on behalf of any of those entities	14	start looking at it.
15	for a PPP loan?	15	MR. BRUSTEIN: Mr. Boland, you may recognize
16	A. Like I say, we didn't qualify. You have	16	the heading.
17	to take all the employees of businesses in	17	THE REPORTER: One for you.
18	aggregate. And we exceeded the head count, so we	18	MR. BOLAND: Okay. Here you go.
19	did not qualify initially even with that criteria.	19	THE WITNESS: Thank you.
20	Q. And where did you determine that you did	20	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
21	not qualify and that all of your employees of the	21	Q. Yeah. I'm just going to direct your
22	30 to 40 entities had to be combined?	22	attention to the middle of the first page. This is
23	A. Where did I determine that, is that what	23	a Freeborn alert. It's a client alert. And that's
24	you asked?	24	your attorney's prior firm, right?
	Dogo 104		Dogg 106
1	Q. Yes.	1	A. Yes.
2	A. I don't understand the question.	2	Q. And it describes who is eligible, and it
3	Q. How did you come to that decision that	3	says (a) 500 employees total (including all
4	none of your companies, even if Ty, Inc., and Ty	4	affiliate entities) or 500 employees per location
5	Warner Hotels & Resorts were combined they had 220	5	for certain industries (including hotels and
6	employees or so	6	restaurants).
7	A. We exceeded	7	Now, the Four Seasons properties you
8	Q could not	8	talked about are hotels, right?
9	MR. BOLAND: Wait. Wait. You have to let him	9	A. Yes.
10		10	Q. Did you ever look into applying for PPP
11	-	11	money for the Four Seasons Hotel New York?
12	•	12	A. Yes.

- 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 13 Q. So how did you determine that you
- 14 exceeded that amount?
- 15 A. I aggregated the head count of all the
- 16 employees of Mr. Warner's businesses, and we
- 17 exceeded the head count requirement.
- 18 Q. Now, were you aware that the PPP head
- 19 count was only per location?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 21 BY THE WITNESS:
- 22 A. I was informed that it's not per
- 23 location, but you need to look at his businesses in
- 24 aggregate.

- 12
- 13 Q. When did you do that?
- 14 A. In 2020.
- 15 Q. Did you complete an application?
- 16 A. No.
- 17 Q. Why not?
- A. Four Seasons provided their employee
- 19 head count, and it exceeded the head count -- head
- count requirement, so it was not filed.
- 21 Q. So it's your testimony that the hotel
- 22 had more than 500 employees?
- 23 A.
- 24 Q. Now, is there a reason you didn't apply



April 14, 2023 197–200

Page 199

Page 200

Page 197

- 1 for PPP for Ty, Inc., and Ty Warner Hotels &
- 2 Resorts since the hotels wouldn't have been
- 3 included in those numbers?
- 4 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 5 BY THE WITNESS:
- 6 A. Mr. Warner also owns golf courses,
- 7 country clubs, and there's employees at those
- 8 locations, as well.
- 9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 10 Q. Are those considered restaurants?
- 11 A. Country clubs and golf courses.
- 12 Q. Now, in terms of the PPP loan money,
- 13 were you responsible for looking into whether or
- 14 not to apply for Four Seasons Hotel New York?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 A. Yes, I looked into it.
- 18 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 19 Q. And why did you take on that
- 20 responsibility?
- 21 A. It's a financial responsibility.
- 22 Q. I'm going to go back to showing you
- 23 Exhibit 1. I'm sharing my screen, and we had left
- 24 off on page 17, but I would like to go to page 20,
 - Page 198
- 1 which is Bates stamp No. WD 9122.
- 2 And this is an e-mail from Mr. Tauscher
- 3 to you indicating that the hotel is discontinuing
- 4 the medical state program as of June 30, 2020, and
- 5 that the hotel would go into temporary closure
- 6 until the end of August or early September.
- 7 Do you see that?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. At that point did you tell Mr. Tauscher
- 10 that Mr. Warner did not want to reopen the hotel?
- 11 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form, assumes
- 12 facts.
- 13 BY THE WITNESS:
- 14 A. I communicated to Four Seasons
- 15 corporate.
- 16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 17 Q. Who at Four Seasons corporate did you
- 18 communicate with in June of 2020 to let them know
- 19 that Mr. Warner did not want to reopen the hotel?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form and assumes
- 21 facts.
- 22 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. I don't recall if it was June of 2020,
- 24 but I would have spoke to Antoine Chahwan.

- 1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - Q. And what did you tell him?
- 3 A. That we -- the hotel is closed, and
- 4 after the doctors and nurses leave, that we would
- 5 continue on with the CapEx projects, the capital
- 6 projects.

- 7 Q. Was the hotel operating at a loss prior
- 8 to COVID?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Has the hotel been operating at a loss
- 11 since 2017 when Ms. Snopek first raised concerns
- 12 about the management of the hotel?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Now, in June of 2020, is there a reason
- 15 that the medical state program ended?
- 16 A. I think that was when COVID spike was
- 17 starting to decline, and we felt that, you know,
- 18 we've given support to the doctors and nurses.
- 19 But, again, you know, we couldn't continue forever.
- 20 So Ty Warner decided to end the program on
- 21 June 30th.
- 22 Q. Now, was -- are you saying that by the
- 23 end of June 2020, COVID was starting to recede?
- 24 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form, vague.
- age 198
 - 1 BY THE WITNESS:
 - 2 A. It was lower than March. I'm not saying
 - 3 that it was going away. That was not the case.
 - 4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - 5 Q. Is it your testimony that the doctors
 - 6 and nurses no longer needed a place to stay?
 - 7 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
 - 8 BY THE WITNESS:
 - 9 A. No, that's not what I said.
 - 10 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - 11 Q. Mr. Warner -- did Mr. Warner tell you
 - 12 that he had gotten enough positive press that it
 - 13 was time to shut it down?
 - 14 A. No, that's not what he said.
 - 15 Q. Was Mr. Warner no longer concerned about
 - 16 the doctors and nurses that were fighting on the
 - 17 front lines?
 - 18 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.
 - 19 BY THE WITNESS:
 - A. No, that's not what he said.
 - 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - 22 Q. Did he need to sell any of his assets to
 - 23 be able to maintain the doctors and nurses that
 - 24 were fighting the pandemic?



April 14, 2023 201-204

Page 204

		Page 201		
1	A.	Sell his properties, is that what you're	1	we didn't we felt that it was not accurate,
2	referrir	ng to?	2	it was unrealistic at the time and it was
3	O	Yes	3	unachievable.

5 Q. So he could afford to keep it open if he 6 had wanted to; he just thought it was enough of his

7 help? 8 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

9 BY THE WITNESS:

10 A. Four Seasons Hotel New York is a

11 business. And it was -- with the pandemic and

12 COVID and what was happening in New York,

13 Mr. Warner was very generous and opened up his

14 luxury hotel to first responders in New York. He

15 didn't have to do that.

A. No.

16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

17 Q. Is there a reason he wasn't as generous

18 with his own employees?

19 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the

20 question.

4

21 BY THE WITNESS:

22 A. No. I don't understand your question.

23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

24 Q. Is it your testimony that the hotel will Page 203 that

I mean, some of these projections came

5 in, you know, prior -- very early on when, you

6 know, we didn't know what was going to happen with

7 COVID.

8 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

Q. When you say experts, is that Sebastian

10 or other people?

A. Sebastian is not a financial expert. It

12 would be other people. We had other firms besides

13 Solid Rock assessing the hotel's projections and

14 the New York market.

15 Q. Did those other experts provide you an

16 analysis of the Four Seasons reopening plan?

17

18 Q. And did they do that orally or did they

19 provide you with written documentation in support

of their analysis?

21 A. Written documentations.

22 Q. And do you still have copies of that

23 written documentation?

24 A. Yes.

Page 202

Q. And is that documentation supporting

your decision not to reopen the hotel?

3 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. That assumes

4 facts.

5 You can answer.

6 BY THE WITNESS:

7 A. Yes.

8 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

9 Q. And you've preserved those documents?

10

11 Q. Does Mr. Warner have any intention of

12 reopening the hotel with Four Seasons as the

operator?

14 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.

15 You can answer.

16 BY THE WITNESS:

17 A. Ownership and operator have been

18 actively discussing and negotiating on the

19 reopening.

20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

21 Q. You testified earlier that you commenced

22 a lawsuit to terminate the operating and hotel

23 management agreement with the Four Seasons, right?

24 A. Right.

1 only reopen if it's profitable?

2 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

3 BY THE WITNESS:

A. Again, it's -- Four Seasons Hotel New 4

5 York is a business, and to conduct a business,

6 there should be profits. It would be irresponsible

7 for me to advise Mr. Warner to open up the hotel 8 when it would not make money.

9 And to rely on projections, there's no

10 guarantee that those projections are accurately

11 estimating when the market may rebound.

12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

13 Q. Does that position hold true for the

14 Santa Barbara property, as well?

15 A. Again, the projections, there are no

16 guarantees on when the market would rebound and

17 start making money.

18 Q. So even if the projection said

19 Mr. Warner would make money, that wouldn't be

20 sufficient to reopen the hotel?

21 MR. BOLAND: Objection, vague.

22 BY THE WITNESS:

23 A. We had third party experts, experts

24 within hospitality reviewing those projections, and



Page 205

CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 205–208

Page 208

I WIK. BULAND: Object to the form.	1	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
------------------------------------	---	---------------------------------

- 2 BY THE WITNESS:
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 5 Q. Is that litigation still ongoing?
- 6 A. It's still ongoing, and the negotiations
- 7 are still ongoing.
- 8 Q. So are you still actively trying to
- 9 terminate the relationship with the Four Seasons?
- 10 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 11 BY THE WITNESS:
- 12 A. As I had indicated, we're negotiating
- 13 with Four Seasons on the reopening.
- 14 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 15 Q. If you win your litigation and are able
- 16 to terminate the agreement with Four Seasons, will
- 17 Four Seasons still be the operator of the Four
- 18 Seasons Hotel New York?
- 19 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.
- 20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 21 Q. You can answer.
- A. The lawsuit has been filed, but, again,
- 23 we're still negotiating. We haven't terminated the
- 24 relationship.

Page 207 MR. BOLAND: Objection, no foundation.

- 2 BY THE WITNESS:
- 3 A. I don't know how to say it otherwise.
- 4 We're -- we're negotiating with Four Seasons.
- 5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 6 Q. I'm asking you if you're successful in
- 7 the litigation and you win and you terminate the
- 8 hotel management agreement, do you understand that
- 9 that means you would no longer have the Four
- 0 Seasons Hotel New York in existence?
- 11 MR. BOLAND: Objection, no foundation.
- 12 You can answer.
- 13 BY THE WITNESS:
- 14 A. We have paused on litigating, and we're
- 15 negotiating with Four Seasons.
- 16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 17 Q. Have you withdrawn your request to
- 18 terminate the negotiation -- terminate the
- 19 management agreement?
- 20 A. No, it -- we're negotiating with Four
- 21 Seasons currently, and --
- 22 Q. What's the status --
- 23 A. -- we're doing that very actively.
- Q. What's the status of those negotiations?

Page 206

- 1 Q. Did you file that lawsuit in good faith?
- 2 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 3 BY THE WITNESS:
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 6 Q. And one of the things that you asked for
- 7 in that lawsuit was for the Four Seasons to not
- 8 operate the Four Seasons Hotel New York, correct?
- 9 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.
- 10 BY THE WITNESS:
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 13 Q. So, then, one of your intentions is for
- 14 the Four Seasons Hotel New York to never be opened
- 15 by the Four Seasons, right?
- 16 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. We're negotiating with Four Seasons to
- 19 reopen the hotel. If the negotiation is
- 20 successful, we will reopen with Four Seasons.
- 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 22 Q. And if the lawsuit is successful, you
- 23 will not reopen the Four Seasons Hotel New York as
- 24 a Four Seasons, right?

- A. It's been ongoing.
- 2 Q. Sitting here today, do you know whether
- 3 the hotel is going to ever open again?
- 4 A. Mr. Warner wants the hotel open. Four
- 5 Seasons wants the hotel open. The hotel will
- 6 reopen. The hotel will reopen. It's just a
- 7 question of when, and it would depend on the
- 8 negotiations.
- 9 Q. Well, Mr. Warner wants the hotel to
- 10 reopen. Does he want it to reopen as a Four
- 11 Seasons, or does he just want it to open as a
- 12 successful hotel no mater who manages it?
- 13 MR. BOLAND: Objection, foundation.
- 14 MR. BRUSTEIN: You really got to stop after
- 15 ever question objecting like this. The next time
- 16 you do it, I'm calling the court.
- 17 MR. BOLAND: We'll take transcript from the
- 18 last three depositions of your clients and we'll
- 19 compare them, shall we?
- 20 You may answer.
- 21 MR. BRUSTEIN: I'm happy to go toe to toe with
- 22 you in court, Mr. Boland, but this is my
- 23 deposition. And I'm going to ask you for the lat
- 24 time to stop having speaking objections.



April 14, 2023 209-212

2E	LENA STALET -against- FOUR SEASO	112	HOTELS	209-212
1	Page 209 MR. BOLAND: I'm not speaking objections. I	1	record, period.	Page 211
2	put a legal basis on the record. Nothing more.	2	MR. BRUSTEIN: We're not in front o	f the
3	Nothing less. Seriously.	3	judge. We're not in front of a jury.	
4	MR. BRUSTEIN: Okay. We're going to go off	4	MR. BOLAND: Well, that's the entire	point,
5	record. We're going to call the court.	5	right, to just preserve the legal ground, n	•
6	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going off record at	6	more, nothing less.	J
7	2:42 p.m.	7	MR. BRUSTEIN: Vague is not an obj	ection under
8	(WHEREUPON, discussion was had	8	the federal rules that you can interrupt th	
9	off the video record as follows:)	9	deposition for.	
10	MR. BOLAND: This is counting against your	10	MR. BOLAND: I'm not interrupting.	
11		11	MR. BRUSTEIN: You state objection	า
12	MR. BRUSTEIN: It's not. We're calling the	12	MR. BOLAND: I'm not interrupting.	
13	court. When we call the court in other instances,	13	It's an objection to the form of the quest	ion,
14	that's not part of the time.	14		
15	MR. BOLAND: No, it's part of the time now.	15	MR. BRUSTEIN: All right. Please st	top
16	MR. BRUSTEIN: How do you figure?	16	coaching the witness. Please stop inter	rupting the
17	MR. BOLAND: Because it's your deposition.	17	deposition, and please allow us to get the	
18	This is not a break. You're calling it and you're	18	so that Ms. Hwang can be finished at a	reasonable
19	stopping it. I am doing nothing other than making	19	hour.	
20	an objection with a plain legal work for a legal	20	Okay. Can we go back on the re	cord.
21	objection. That's it, and not even all the time.	21	MR. BOLAND: I don't think we were	ever off.
22	MR. BRUSTEIN: I want are we on the record	22	THE REPORTER: Well, we were off	the video. I
23	or are we off the record?	23	have this on the transcript if you want.	
24	THE REPORTER: I'm still on.	24	MR. BOLAND: That's all right. Just	continue.
	Page 210			Page 212
1	MR. BOLAND: We're still on.	1	(WHEREUPON, the following	
2	THE REPORTER: I've been writing, so	2	proceedings were had back on t	the
3	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Do you want me to go back	3	video record:)	
4	on?	4	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going	g back on the
5	THE REPORTER: Do you want it on we're not	5	record at 2:44 p.m.	
6	on video, but I'm on the record. Do you want the	6	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	
7	video on?	7	Q. Thank you. I'm now showing you	in the
8	MR. BRUSTEIN: I just want to make sure	8	exhibit the next page.	
9	Mr. Boland's continuous obstruction is part of this	9	MR. BOLAND: Do you want to get to	the paper?
10		10	THE WITNESS: I'm not sure.	
11	MR. BOLAND: I'm not obstructing anything,	11	MR. BOLAND: It was like three page	s up from
12	, ,	12	the last one.	
13	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	13	MR. BRUSTEIN: This is the twenty-fi	rst page.
14	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	14		14
⊥ 15	guestion. The federal rules do not allow speaking	15	MR. BOLAND: No. no. go the other v	vav. Keep

- 17 need to say objection, do not answer, at that point
- 18 you can say more. But you cannot continue to
- 19 interrupt the deposition. It is inappropriate.
- MR. BOLAND: I think you're making --20
- 21 MR. BRUSTEIN: Let's go.
- MR. BOLAND: You're making a big deal out of a 22
- 23 single word legal basis, of which I always thought

15 question. The federal rules do not allow speaking

16 objections. You can say objection. And if you

24 you could put a legal basis for an objection on the

15 MR. BOLAND: No, no, go the other way. Keep

16 going, and then you can get to the one that he's

17 got on the screen, which, "Hello Cathy, the hotel

18 has 58 salaried."

19 MR. BRUSTEIN: She can see the screen just as

20 well as you can.

21 THE WITNESS: Okay. I have it.

22 MR. BOLAND: Okay.

23 Is there a Bates number on this one?

24 MR. BRUSTEIN: Yes, I already put it on the



April 14, 2023 213–216

Page 215

1 record. It's 90.

2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

3 Q. Now, Ms. Hwang, why did you ask

4 in March 2022 about who would be considered calling

5 back when the hotel reopens?

A. I don't recall.

6

7

Q. Did you receive a list of who Elizabeth

8 Ortiz said were the 58 salaried and hourly

9 non-union employees that we would expect to recall?

10 A. I don't recall if she provided a list.

11 Q. Now, she -- she said in her e-mail many

12 of the originally furloughed employees have moved

13 on. Do you know what she meant by that?

14 A. I -- I don't recall this e-mail, but,

15 no, I don't know what she -- I could assume things,

16 but I don't know exactly what she meant.

17 Q. In -- in March of 2022, was there a path

18 to reopening the hotel?

19 A. Was there a path?

20 Q. Yeah. Were you guys ready to reopen the

21 hotel in March of 2022?

22 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

23 BY THE WITNESS:

24 A. No.

Page 213

4

1 Mr. Warner has approved extending the health

2 benefit coverage for two months for 22 employees

3 who were recently furloughed.

Do you see that at the top of the page?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Why did he only extend the health

7 benefits coverage for two months?

8 A. And just to be clear, Mr. Warner

9 approved the funding for the health benefits, and

10 that's what he approved.

11 Q. So he approved what was asked for?

12 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

13 BY THE WITNESS:

14 A. I don't recall if they were asking for

15 two months of health benefits.

16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

17 Q. So my question is how did he decide on

18 two months of health benefits being what's

19 appropriate for the people that housed the medical

20 professionals at the height of COVID?

21 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

22 BY THE WITNESS:

23 A. I was reading up on what other companies

24 were doing in the retail sector and various

Page 214

1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

Q. So was there something that happened

3 that made you reach out to Ms. Ortiz to find out

4 about the number of employees that might be called

5 back?

6 A. I don't recall the reason for this

7 question that I asked her.

8 Q. Had Mr. Warner asked you to look into

9 it?

10 A. I don't know. I -- I can't recall why I

11 asked her this question.

12 Q. Have you asked her this question on

13 other occasions?

14 A. I don't know.

15 Q. Have you asked her this question since

16 March of 2022?

17 A. I don't recall.

18 Q. Sitting here today, do you know what the

19 current number of employees, non-union employees

20 are who may be recalled?

21 A. No.

Q. Okay. Let's turn to the next page.

23 This is WD 1147.

Now, in this e-mail, you indicated that

Page 216

1 industries. Some companies offered nothing, while

2 other companies provided about two months in

3 extension of their health benefits. And I --

4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

5 Q. When you say two --

6 MR. BOLAND: Were you finished?

7 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

8 Q. Are you --

9 A. Yes. And I asked Mr. Warner if he would

10 consider funding for two months of extension in

11 health benefits package, considering what was going

12 on in New York with COVID.

13 Q. Now, you said other companies were

14 paying two months. That was two month's salary

15 that other companies were paying, right?

16 A. No. Other companies were paying nothing

17 for health benefits. And the -- while some

8 companies paid up to and -- again, I'm sure there

19 were other companies that paid even greater than

20 two months, but it seemed that some of the retail

21 sectors, like Macy's, I remember, and some of the

22 other companies that I researched were offering two

23 months of health benefits.

24 Q. Now, in Ms. Ortiz's e-mail at the bottom



April 14, 2023 217–220

	Page
of the page, it refers to a tax credit.	I'm going

- 2 to highlight it on the screen.
- 3 Do you -- do you see where I've
- 4 highlighted?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. You can proceed with your document.
- 7 What is the tax credit that Mr. Warner
- 8 or Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts received during the
- 9 pandemic?
- 10 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 11 BY THE WITNESS:
- 12 A. It's the ERC credit, Employee Retention
- 13 Credit.
- 14 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 15 Q. And what is that?
- 16 A. It's a tax refund from the government to
- 17 employers who are paying for benefits for their
- 18 furloughed employees.
- 19 Q. Was there a limit to how many months the
- 20 tax credit was for?
- 21 A. I don't know.
- Q. Is it possible the tax credit could have
- 23 been more than two months?
- 24 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

- Page 219
 1 they -- how many months of health benefits they
- 2 asked for or if they were specific in that request
- 3 at all, but -- okay. If -- I can't recall.
- 4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 5 Q. What does -- what does "temporary" mean
- 6 to you?

7

- A. Temporary is not permanent.
- 8 Q. How long is temporary?
- 9 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 10 BY THE WITNESS:
- 11 A. I don't know.
- 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 13 Q. When you worked for each of those
- 14 companies that you testified earlier that you
- 15 worked for, were you a temporary or a permanent
- 16 employee?
- 17 A. Permanent employee.
- 18 Q. Even the one that you only worked at for
- 19 three months?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Now, let's go to the next page --
- 22 actually, two pages down. This is bearing Bates
- 23 stamp No. WD 1160, and I'm going to direct you to
- 24 the bottom of the page.

Page 218

Page 220

- 1 BY THE WITNESS: 2 A. I don't know.
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- A O Marchald that have been
- 4 Q. Wouldn't that have been an important
- 5 thing to know before determining how many months of
- 6 benefits to provide out-of-work employees?
- 7 A. We value the employees at Four Seasons,
- 8 and this -- and we value their safety. And
- 9 continuing to, you know, have this relationship
- 10 with them after -- and we planned on recalling them
- 11 when the hotel reopens. I thought it would -- was
- 12 a great gesture on Mr. Warner's part to extend the
- 13 health benefits for these employees.
- 14 Q. My question, though, was if you ever
- 15 looked into how long the government would have
- 16 given you a tax credit for providing health
- 17 benefits to your out-of-work employees?
- 18 A. No, this was something that was
- 19 researched by Four Seasons.
- 20 Q. Did you know that Four Seasons requested
- 21 three months of health benefits coverage?
- 22 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 23 BY THE WITNESS:
- 24 A. As I stated before, I can't recall if

- Do you see where it says FSNY estimated
- 2 cost for furloughed employees?
- 3 A. Yes.

4

- Q. So the Four Seasons had actually
- 5 calculated how much it would cost to provide three
- 6 months of salary and health benefits for the
- 7 workers -- the employees, right?
- 8 A. Yes, they calculated the wages.
 - Q. And they even provided a 50 percent
- 10 reduction in salary in case Mr. Warner didn't want
- 11 to pay all of it, right?
- 12 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 13 BY THE WITNESS:
- 14 A. Where? I don't -- I don't see that.
- 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 16 Q. Do you see the second column says wage
- 17 at 50 percent?
- 18 A. Oh, okay. Yes, I see that now.
- 19 Q. Now, going up to your e-mail, can you
- 20 please read what you wrote to Rudy.
- 21 A. "I discussed the proposed wages and
- 22 health benefits costs as presented in your e-mail
- 23 with Mr. Warner. He approved the standard health
- 24 benefits for furloughed employees for 2 months but



April 14, 2023 221–224

Page 224

no wages will be provided at this time."

- 2 Q. Did Mr. Warner tell you why he did not
- 3 want to provide wages?
- 4 A. The hotel is closed. There's no income
- 5 coming in.
- 6 Q. This was a global pandemic. Was he
- 7 concerned about how his employees would feed
- 8 themselves and their families and stay safe?
- 9 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 10 BY THE WITNESS:
- 11 A. He's not -- he's not required to pay
- 12 wages of employees while they're not working.
- 13 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 14 Q. Well --
- 15 A. He's not required to pay health benefits
- 16 of employees while they're not working.
- 17 Q. If Mr. Warner reopened the hotel, would
- 18 he be paying the wages and benefits of the
- 19 employees?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the
- 21 question.
- 22 BY THE WITNESS:
- 23 A. If employees are working, then they
- 24 would be earning their wages.

- Page 223
 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the
- 2 question.
- 3 BY THE WITNESS:
- 4 A. Employees are eligible for severance if
- 5 they were permanently separated.
- 6 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 7 Q. How many years does the hotel need to be
- 8 closed before you consider the employees to be
- 9 permanently separated?
- 10 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 11 BY THE WITNESS:
- 12 A. The hotel is not permanently closed.
- 13 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 14 Q. My question was, how long do you believe
- 15 employees should remain on furlough and out of work
- 16 before they're eligible for the no fault separation
- 17 pay that they have worked towards --
- 18 MR. BOLAND: Objection.
- 19 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 20 Q. -- for years --
- 21 MR. BOLAND: I'm sorry. I didn't know you
- 22 were finished.
- 23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 24 Q. -- years and sometimes decades?

- 1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 2 Q. Do you believe that continuing to keep
- 3 the hotel closed is hurting the employees?
- 4 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the
- 5 question.
- 6 BY THE WITNESS:
- 7 A. Do you mean the furloughed employees?
- 8 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 9 Q. Yes, the employees that are not working
- 10 at the hotel.
- 11 MR. BOLAND: Same objection.
- 12 BY THE WITNESS:
- 13 A. They're free to find other jobs.
- 14 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 15 Q. Are you aware of the no fault separation
- 16 pay compensation?
- 17 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 18 BY THE WITNESS:
- 19 A. I've read the subsection in the EmPact
- 20 Agreement for Four Seasons.
- 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- Q. Would Mr. Warner pay the no fault
- 23 separation pay for employees who found other jobs
- 24 because the hotel has still not reopened?

- 1 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 2 BY THE WITNESS:
- 3 A. Would you please repeat the question.
- 4 MR. BRUSTEIN: Can I have that read back,
- 5 please.
- 6 (WHEREUPON, the record was read
- 7 by the reporter as requested.)
- 8 BY THE WITNESS:
- 9 A. As I stated earlier, employees are
- 10 eligible for severance if they are permanently
- 11 separated. So I don't know how long that would
- 12 mean, except for if the permanent -- if the hotel
- 13 was permanently closed, or if the employees were
- 14 permanently separated, which is not the case here.
- 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 16 Q. If you win the litigation and terminate
- 17 the hotel management agreement, would the employees
- 18 be entitled to no fault separation pay?
- 19 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the
- 20 question.
- 21 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. We would recall those employees.
- 23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 24 Q. Even if the hotel didn't operate by the



7

12

Page 225

CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 225–228

- 2 A. Yes. As long as --
- 3 Q. Would you --
- 4 A. -- they would want a job, we would
- 5 recall those employees.
- 6 Q. And would they still be entitled to no
- 7 fault separation pay?
- 8 A. No, we would recall those employees and
- 9 offer them jobs.
- 10 Q. So none of these employees are entitled
- 11 to severance?
- 12 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 13 BY THE WITNESS:
- 14 A. Can you clarify your question?
- 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 16 Q. It's your position that all of the
- 17 furloughed workers or all the employees are still
- 18 on furlough if they haven't found another job?
- 19 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 20 BY THE WITNESS:
- 21 A. As long as they didn't resign, they're
- 22 still on furlough.
- 23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 24 Q. Why would any employee have to resign if

Page 227
A. Okay. They're allowed to work now

- The one of the control of the contro
- 2 during the term of their furlough.
- 3 Q. And would the Four Seasons Hotel New
- 4 York reach out to every one of those workers if the
- 5 hotel ever reopened and say to them, you have a
- 6 right to come back to the hotel if you want?
 - A. Is this assuming that Four Seasons would
- 8 continue to manage the hotel? Because your other
- 9 question stated otherwise.
- 10 Q. Let's start with if Four Seasons
- 11 continued to manage the hotel.
 - A. Okay. I can't direct the Four Seasons
- 13 to call their employees. That would be Four
- 14 Seasons' decision.
- 15 Q. Okay. And if it was not operated by the
- 16 Four Seasons, would you be calling every employee
- 17 that had gotten a new job to see if they want to
- 18 exercise their right to be recalled?
- 19 A. I would have to consult with Mr. Warner,
- 20 but my recommendation would be under a new brand,
- 21 yes, let's reach out to those employees, as long as
- 22 Four Seasons does not object -- does not object to
- 23 reaching out to those employees and offering them
- 24 positions.

Page 226

- 1 the hotel is closed?
- 2 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 3 BY THE WITNESS:
- 4 A. I would guess if they wanted to take a
- 5 position at, say, another Four Seasons Hotel
- 6 downtown, for instance, then they would resign from
- 7 their position at this location and move on to
- 8 their new jobs.
- 9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 10 Q. If they took a job not at a Four
- 11 Seasons, let's say they took it at a restaurant,
- 12 when you claim the hotel is going to reopen, would
- 13 you reach out to employee to offer them their job
- 14 back even though they were working at a restaurant?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 A. We would recall the employees and offer
- 18 them positions. Employees are --
- 19 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 20 Q. Is your testimony --
- 21 A. Employees are free to work at other
- 22 jobs. This doesn't interfere after they're
- 23 recalled. They're allowed to moonlight.
- 24 Q. My question is not about moonlighting.

- Q. But sitting here today, you haven't had any conversations with Mr. Warner about whether or
- O most the amenda was a susceled because an automostic visibilities
- 3 not the employees would have an automatic right to
- 4 recall if the hotel opened not with Four Seasons?
- 5 A. We haven't ruled out any possibilities
- 6 of Four Seasons. We still have an ongoing
- 7 negotiation with them.
- 8 Q. But you haven't had conversations with
- 9 Mr. Warner to determine whether or not the
- 10 employees would have that right or not. That's
- 11 still open for discussion?
- 12 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 13 BY THE WITNESS:
- 14 A. No, we haven't had that discussion.
- 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 16 Q. All right. Let's turn ahead. I believe
- 17 it's three pages. Page 26. Maybe it's two pages.
- 18 WD 4202.
- 19 This is an e-mail from Sharon Brambrut
- 20 about New York State COVID sick leave.
- 21 Why is Ms. Brambrut e-mailing you about
- 22 a COVID sick leave policy --
- 23 MR. BOLAND: Object.
- 24 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:



April 14, 2023 229–232

Page 231

Page 232

		Page 229
Q.	if you have no	

- 2 MR. BOLAND: Sorry. Go ahead. I apologize.
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

1

- 4 Q. -- if you have no oversight of
- 5 employee's sick time?
- 6 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 7 BY THE WITNESS:
- 8 A. This would be for funding purposes for
- 9 payroll. Employees' COVID sick time would be
- 10 included in that payroll expense.
- 11 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 12 Q. Now, does the closure of the Santa
- 13 Barbara location have anything to do with the Four
- 14 Seasons Hotel New York closure?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 A. Four Seasons Santa Barbara was closed
- 18 for the same reason Four Seasons New York was
- 19 closed. It was due to COVID.
- 20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 21 Q. But does it remain closed today because
- 22 the owner does not believe it's profitable enough
- 23 to reopen?
- 24 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

- Q. Let's turn to the next page, which is
- 3 WD 9102. This e-mail says that ownership approved
- 4 the employee talking points.
- 5 MR. BOLAND: The -- object to the form.
- 6 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 7 Q. I'm just talking about that first line.
- 8 Do you see that?
 - A. The first line, yes.
- 10 Q. That the ownership approved the employee
- 11 talking points?

9

- 12 A. Yes, I see the first line.
- 13 Q. Why was ownership approval required for
- 14 employee talking points?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 A. I know how things are stated in the
- 18 e-mails, and sometimes it's purposeful on my part,
- 19 but I realize that I don't have the authority to
- 20 make these decisions.
- 21 If ownership did not approve the media
- 22 statements, Four Seasons still has the authority to
- 23 proceed with the media statements as they see fit.
- 24 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

- 1 BY THE WITNESS:
- 2 A. There are capital projects at the hotel,
- 3 and we also want to make sure that the hotel is
- 4 profitable when it opens.
- 5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 6 Q. Two completely separate properties, but
- 7 the same exact excuses for not reopening?
- 8 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 9 BY THE WITNESS:
- 10 A. I didn't say they were excuses. You
- 11 did.
- 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 13 Q. I did. But I'm saying, same reasons for
- 14 not reopening the two?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. When did the Four Seasons -- when did
- 17 Mr. Warner shift his reasoning for not reopening
- 18 from COVID to capital projects and profitability?
- 19 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the
- 20 question.
- 21 BY THE WITNESS:
- 22 A. I don't agree that that's all in the
- 23 same order. And, again, I don't recall the timing
- 24 of these events.

- Q. So would it be fair to say you were
- 2 misrepresenting your authority in this e-mail?
- 3 MR. BOLAND: Object to form.
- 4 BY THE WITNESS:
- 5 A. I wouldn't say that I'm misrepresenting.
- 6 I would say that I think it -- ownership should
- 7 have input. Whether Four Seasons accepts that or
- 8 not, it's their decision.
- 9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 10 Q. Well --
- 11 A. But given --
- 12 Q. -- the e-mail --
- 13 MR. BOLAND: Were you done? Were you done or
- 14 not?
- 15 THE WITNESS: No.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 A. Given that ownership is funding the
- 18 hotel during closure, I feel that ownership should
- 19 have more input.
- 20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 21 Q. Well, this e-mail appears to be
- 22 Mr. Chahwan seeking your approval before sharing it
- 23 with the team, right?
- 24 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.



April 14, 2023 233–236

SE	LENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASO	NS	HOTELS 233–236
1	Page 233 BY THE WITNESS:	1	Page 235 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
2	A. If you read his e-mail, that's not	2	
	exactly what he says. He's not looking for my	3	Q. Have you ever reviewed Mr. Warner's personal taxes?
3	approval.	4	-
5	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	5	A. No, Mr. Warner signs off on his personal taxes.
6	Q. Mr. Chahwan was not involved in the	6	Q. So you've never seen Mr. Warner's tax
7	Santa Barbara property, right?	7	personal taxes?
8	A. No.	8	A. I've not reviewed his personal taxes.
9	Q. But why is he why is Santa Barbara	9	Q. Give me one moment.
10	part of your conversation with Mr. Chahwan?	10	I'm now introducing as exhibit a
11	A. Because Mr. Chahwan works very closely	11	document that I've asked to be shown to the
12	with a colleague of his who oversees the Santa	12	witness.
13	Barbara property.	13	MR. BOLAND: Do we have a copy of this one or
14	Q. And what does that have to do with	14	.,
15	approving employee talking points for the New York	15	MR. BRUSTEIN: Yes, you do.
16		16	, ,
17	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	17	
18	BY THE WITNESS:	18	(WHEREUPON, a certain document was
19	A. I think he was just consulting with his	19	•
20	colleague. I don't know.	20	
21	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	21	4/14/23.)
22	Q. Have all of the other Ty Warner	22	MR. BOLAND: Thanks.
23	properties reopened except the Santa Barbara	23	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
24	location and the Four Seasons Hotel New York?	24	Q. Now, I'm going to share this in a
	Page 234		Page 236
1	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	1	minute. Do you see this document in front of you?
2	BY THE WITNESS:	2	And you're not sharing your screen with
3	A. They're reopened now, yes.	3	me.
4	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	4	Q. I know. I didn't know if you had the
5	Q. When did they reopen?	5	copy in front of you. I'll share it.
6	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	6	A. Oh, I have a copy.
7	BY THE WITNESS:	7	Q. This says it's the declaration of Cathy
8	 Actually, I have to correct my 	8	Hwang in Support of H. Ty Warner's Notice of
9	statement. Coral Casino still remains closed.	9	Removal.
10	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	10	A. Yes.
11	Q. Why is that one closed?	11	Q. And if you look at the last page, it's
12	 A. It's going through construction. 	12	signed by Cathy Hwang.
13	 Q. How long has that construction been 	13	A. Yes.
14	going on?	14	Q. Is that your signature?
15	A. Over two years.	15	A. That's my signature.
16	Q. Does Mr. Warner use the losses on these	16	
17	properties for tax benefit purposes?	17	,
18	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the	18	
19	question.	19	
20	BY THE WITNESS:	20	, ,
21	A. I do think I think some of his legal	21	3 ,
22	entities roll up to his personal taxes, but, again,	22	
23	I'm not certain. That would have to be discussed	23	This is a personal matter. It's not for one of his

24 businesses.



24 with the tax advisor.

April 14, 2023 237-240

Page 239

Page 237 Q. So are you involved in it in a personal

- 2 way or in a business way?
- 3 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 4 BY THE WITNESS:
- 5 A. Like I said, I can't recall every single
- 6 legal matter for Mr. Warner and that was the reason
- 7 why I said I couldn't -- you know, that it would be
- 8 a guess.

1

- 9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 10 Q. But when you completed this declaration,
- 11 you knew it was important to be truthful, right?
- 12
- 13 Q. And you swore to tell the truth that
- 14 everything in this document was true and accurate,
- 15 right?

22

- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. And that's the same oath that you took
- today to tell the truth, right? 18
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Can you please read paragraph No. 11 --
- 21 it's on the third page -- aloud for the record.
- A. "On all personal and business paperwork 23 about which I am aware, including his personal tax
- 24 returns, Mr. Warner has listed his office address
- Page 238

1

- 1 in Westmont, Illinois or his home address in Oak Brook, Illinois as address of record."
- 3 Q. Was that statement based on your
- personal knowledge? 4
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 So had you actually reviewed
- 7 Mr. Warner's personal tax returns to know what he
- had listed as his address?
- 9 A. I looked at all his documentation for
- 10 his residency and his address.
- 11 Q. Had you looked at his tax returns?
- 12 A. I spoke with his advisor, and I may have
- 13 seen a copy, and I just reviewed to make sure that
- 14 his Illinois address was listed, because this was
- 15 one of the questions that came up in terms --
- 16 Q. So when you test -- sorry.
- 17 A. -- in terms of his residency.
- 18 Q. So you reviewed his personal tax returns
- 19 for purposes of residency?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 21 BY THE WITNESS:
- 22 A. I didn't -- I do not review his personal
- 23 tax runs for accuracy or even content. That's up
- 24 to his tax advisor to do so.

BY MR. BRUSTEIN: 1

2 Q. I'm not asking you about whether or not

he's paying what he should in taxes. I'm asking

- about your testimony and whether or not you
- actually reviewed his tax returns.
- A. I consulted with his tax accountant and
- 7 asked if he files in Illinois.
- 8 Q. A moment ago you said you reviewed it
- for his address. Was that not accurate? 9
- 10 A. I said I may have reviewed it for his
- 11 address. I don't recall positively.
- 12 Q. When you submitted a declaration in
- 13 California, the Central District of California
- Federal Court, not everything that you've said in
- there was based on your personal knowledge?
- 16 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. It's based on my personal knowledge.
- 19 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 20 Q. So you had reviewed his personal tax
- 21 returns to know what he listed as his business
- 22 address and his home address; is that correct?
- MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. 23
- 24 BY THE WITNESS:

- To be clear, I may have gained this
- personal knowledge through the tax accountant. I
- can't recall if I actually saw -- saw his tax
- return. And if I did, then it would have been for
- the address.
- 6 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 7 Q. So when you testified today that you had
- not reviewed his personal tax returns, you don't
- 9 know sitting here today if that testimony was true?
- 10 A. So I guess it would have -- it would
- depend on whether you're asking me how I am 11
- 12 reviewing his tax return.
- 13 Q. I just asked you if you reviewed. And
- 14 you said --
- 15 A. I said I don't review Mr. Warner's tax
- 16 returns. He signs off on them.
- 17 Q. And I asked if you ever had, and you
- 18 said no, right?
- 19 A. That's right.
- 20 Q. I didn't ask if you reviewed it for
- 21 accuracy.
- 22 A. Okay.
- 23 Q. Now, do you know if Mr. Warner has paid
- 24 California taxes?



CATHY HWANG

April 14, 2023

SE	LENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASO	NS	
1	Page 241 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Oh, something's going on.	1	A. Yes.
	We have to go off very quickly.	2	Q. And does he work out of the Westmont
3	MR. BRUSTEIN: I'm sorry. I can't	3	location currently?
4	MR. BOLAND: I think she's almost out of time.	4	A. No, he has not been back here.
5	THE REPORTER: She needs to go off the record.	5	Q. When you communicate with Mr. Warner and
6	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Going off the record at	6	you send him business documents, where do you send
	3:24 p.m.	7	them?
8	(WHEREUPON, discussion was had	8	A. To his Santa Barbara house.
9	off the record.)	9	Q. And what's the address of the Santa
10	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We will go back on.	10	
11	Going back on the record at 3:25 p.m.	11	A. 1000 Channel Drive, Santa Barbara.
12	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	12	
13		13	
	Q. Do you need the question read back to	14	
	you?		. , , ,
15	A. Yes, please.	15	
16	(WHEREUPON, the record was read	16	•
17	by the reporter as requested.)	17	
18	BY THE WITNESS:	18	
19	A. I don't know.	19	,
20	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	20	
21	Q. Now, does Mr. Warner have a home office	21	Q. Now, you testified earlier that he
22	in California?	22	,
23	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	23	, 3
24	BY THE WITNESS:	24	January 2020?
	Page 242		Page 244
1	A. Can you please clarify what you mean by	1	A. Yes.
	a home office.	2	Q. The last time you had seen Mr. Warner,
3	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	3	was actually in California, not in Chicago?
4	Q. Where do you understand Mr. Warner to be	4	A. Yes.
5	residing?	5	Q. Does Mr. Warner have a private jet?
6	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	6	A. Yes.
	BY THE WITNESS:	7	Q. Did he take his private jet from
8	A. Mr. Warner has resided in Oak Brook,	8	Chicago, Illinois, to Santa Barbara back in 2019?
9	Illinois, prior to 2020. He's been in Santa	9	A. No. He flew commercial.
10	Barbara since. He went out there for the holidays,	10	•
11	and then with the outbreak of COVID, he has not	11	
12	traveled since.	12	, 5 5
13	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	13	9
14	Q. That's a long holiday. Would you	14	, ,
15	consider that a temporary stay in California?	15	
16	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	16	A. I I don't know.
17	BY THE WITNESS:	17	Q. Is it also since the start of the
18	 Yes, he still has his home here. 	18	pandemic?
19	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	19	A. It was prior to the pandemic.
1	<u> </u>	1 -	

- Q. Now, does Mr. Warner still work for Ty
- 21 Warner -- with Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts and Ty,
- 22 Inc.?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. I'm sorry?

- 19 A. It was prior to the pandemic.
 - Q. Now, you said Mr. Warner went to Santa
- 21 Barbara for the holidays in 2019. Is there a
- 22 reason he didn't come back in January of 2020?
- 23 A. Yes. He stayed because he wanted to
- 24 look after Four Seasons Hotel in Santa Barbara.



April 14, 2023 245–248

Page 247

		Pag
Q.	So he wasn't staying there just for	or the

- 2 holiday, then, if he was going to stay there after
- 3 January 2020, right?
- 4 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 5 BY THE WITNESS:
- 6 A. He visited Santa Barbara for the
- 7 holidays, and when he saw the state that Four
- 8 Seasons Resort Santa Barbara was in, he was
- 9 concerned about the deferred maintenance, and he
- 10 decided to look after the hotel.
- 11 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 12 Q. Was Mr. Warner working when he was in
- 13 California?
- 14 A. Mr. Warner is always working.
- 15 Q. So when he's not in Chicago, does he
- 16 have an office in California that he does work out
- 17 of?
- 18 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 19 BY THE WITNESS:
- 20 A. He doesn't -- unless you consider his
- 21 office in his house, he doesn't have a formal
- 22 office out in California.
- 23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 24 Q. Does he have a home office in

- 1 BY THE WITNESS:
- 2 A. He works remotely.
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - Q. So let's go back to Exhibit 7 for a
- 5 second. Paragraph 14, can you please read the
- 6 first sentence.

7

- A. Did you ask me to read it out loud?
- 8 Q. Yes, please.
- 9 A. Okay. "Mr. Warner routinely works out of
- 10 this office. Prior to the Covid-19 pandemic,
- 11 Mr. Warner was in this office on a daily basis,
- 12 unless he was traveling for business or personal
- 13 reasons."
- 14 Q. And that's referring to the 280 Chestnut
- 15 Avenue office that you're currently sitting in,
- 16 right?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. You would agree that he has not, in the
- 19 present tense, worked out of 280 Chestnut Avenue
- 20 since 2019, right?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. You didn't say that it had been, at that
- 23 point, almost two years since he had worked out of
- 24 that office, did you?

Page 246

1

- 1 California?
- 2 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 3 BY THE WITNESS:
- 4 A. Can you clarify home office.
- 5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 6 Q. You said office in home. I'm using your
- 7 words just together.
- 8 A. Okay.
- 9 Q. Why don't you describe it.
- 10 A. He has a room in his house that he uses
- 11 with a computer.
- 12 Q. Does it have a desk?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Telephone?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Printer?
- 17 A. I don't know if there's a printer.
- 18 Q. When you meet -- when you met with him
- 19 in 2019 in California, where did you meet him?
- 20 A. At his property out in San Ysidro Ranch.
- 21 Q. Now, would it be fair to say that
- 22 Mr. Warner does not routinely work in Chicago
- 23 anymore?
- 24 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

- A. I don't -- I don't recall saying that it
- 2 had been two years.
- 3 Q. Do you think someone that hasn't been to
- 4 a place in two years is still currently doing
- 5 anything there?
- 6 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 7 BY THE WITNESS:
- 8 A. I think how people work has changed
- 9 since COVID.
- 10 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 11 Q. Do you think Mr. Warner is with you in
- 12 Westmont, Illinois, right now because of COVID?
- 13 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 14 BY THE WITNESS:
- 15 A. It started with the reason for COVID.
- 16 He stopped travelling.
- 17 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 18 Q. I'm asking if because of COVID you think
- 19 that means that you can say that he works in
- 20 Chicago still or Westmont?
- A. He's not physically in the office, but
- 22 he's working remotely with us.
- 23 Q. That's not what you said in your federal
- 24 filing that you swore to. So what I would like to



CATHY HWANG

April 14, 2023

SE	LENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASO	NS	HOTELS	249–252
	Page 249			Page 251
1	know is whether you think it's a fair and truthful			
2	statement in October or September of 2021 to say	2	A. I don't know if this is	
3	that Mr. Warner routinely works out of this office	3	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	
4	in Westmont, Illinois?	4	Q. Which of it is your wording?	
5	A. I read that as he worked out of this	5	A. No. 3. No. 4.	
6	office prior to COVID-19.	6	Q. So that's your wording? You ch	ose those
7	Q. When you just testified, I want to make		words or you know them to be true?	
8	sure I heard you correctly, did you say worked,	8	A. Like I said, I worked on it with	
9	"e-d," as in the past tense?	9	Mr. Warner, and those are my wording a	
10	A. It it says here that he works out of	10	is what I know to be true. I can't tell you	
11	his office.	11	every word was my word. It may have	
12	Q. Right, but when you testified	12	Q. So Mr. Warner asked you to sig	gn this for
13	A. I thought	13	him?	
14	Q that	14	A. No, Mr. Warner's attorney aske	d if I
15	A. I thought that to mean that prior to	15	would sign this for him.	
16	COVID, I'm stating that he was at this office	16	Q. All right. Now, let's go down to	
17	physically.	17	paragraph 18. Can you please read that	at sentence
18	Q. Even though it's in the present tense	18	aloud.	
19	and not the past tense, you thought it meant past	19	A. "Mr. Warner does not consider	=
20	,	20	1 1 7	primary
21	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	21		
22	BY THE WITNESS:	22	Q. You testified that you'd been to	his
23	A. I guess it's the spelling, then. I	23	home in California, right?	
24	didn't I didn't catch that to mean something	24	A. Yes.	
	Page 250			Page 252
1	different than he was working in Westmont prior to	1	Q. So that sentence is not true, rig	-
2	COVID-19.	2	MR. BOLAND: No, object to the for	m of the
3	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	3	question.	
4	 Q. Have you been to his home in Santa 	4	BY THE WITNESS:	
5	Barbara?	5	A. I've been to his house in Santa	Barbara
6	A. Yes.	6	if we want to be precisely accurate.	
7	Q. How big is his Santa Barbara home?	7	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	
8	A. I don't know.	8	Q. I want you to just be accurate.	
9	 Q. Before filling out this declaration, did 	9	A. Okay.	
10	you understand that this was because Mr. Warner	10	 Q. You testified you've been to hi 	s home
11	wanted to have the case transferred back to	11	today, right?	
12	Chicago?	12	A. So Mr. Warner considers Wes	tmont or
13	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	13	Oak Brook his home, but he has been	living out in
14	BY THE WITNESS:	14	Santa Barbara since the pandemic. A	nd he
15	 A. No, I don't know the strategy or 	15	considers he considered this to be h	is home here
16	whatever you're inferring.	16	in Westmont and Oak Brook.	
17	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	17	Q. Now, earlier you mentioned th	at you were
18	Q. Did someone tell you what to put in this	18	the an officer in a company called Fa	airway BB
19	sworn declaration?	19	Property, LLC, right?	
20	A. I worked on this with Mr. Warner's	20	A. Yes.	
21	attorney and some of this is my wording, as well.	21	Q. What is that company?	
22	Q. Which of it is Mr. Warner's attorney?	22	A. That entity is for the Santa Bar	bara
23	MR. BOLAND: So well, you signed it. You	23	house.	
24		24	O Mb - 4 - 1 - 0	

Q. What's it do?

24



24 can answer.

April 14, 2023 253–256

Page 255

Page 256

					Page ∠
Α.	We have e	mplovees	that, vou	know.	handle

- 2 and look after his house in Santa Barbara.
- 3 MR. BOLAND: And when you get a chance, we're
- 4 going about an hour. Whenever it's good for you.
- 5 MR. BRUSTEIN: Sure. Just a few more
- 6 questions.
- 7 MR. BOLAND: Sure.
- 8 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- Q. You said they're employees that look
- 10 after his house. That's Mr. Warner's house in
- 11 California?
- 12 A. That's 1000 Channel Drive, the house
- 13 located on 1000 Channel Drive.
- 14 Q. And that, you're saying, is definitely
- 15 not his home, even though he's lived there for the
- 16 last three years straight?
- 17 A. I said that's his house, but he
- 18 considers Oak Brook his home.
- 19 Q. Did he tell you that before or after he
- 20 asked you to sign the declaration to get a case
- 21 removed from California?
- 22 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 23 BY THE WITNESS:
- 24 A. He has always considered Oak Brook his

- 1 her not to answer those.
- 2 MR. BRUSTEIN: Mr. Warner's personal attorney,
- 3 how is that privileged?
- MR. BOLAND: Because she could have a
- 5 relationship with the attorney to help to give
- 6 advice. It could be the exact same thing. An
- 7 attorney can use anybody for work product, and
- 8 there's a privilege that applies.
- 9 She can say -- anything about the
- 10 declaration, fine.
- 11 MR. BRUSTEIN: Okay.
- 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 13 Q. So your attorney said that you can
- 14 answer.
- 15 MR. BOLAND: No, what I said was, you're not
- 16 going to answer the conversations with -- about
- 17 counsel. You can ask -- he can ask you questions
- 18 about what are the statements that you put in the
- 19 declaration because you signed that.
- 20 MR. BRUSTEIN: I was not telling her to ignore
- 21 your advice. I was saying the question I asked,
- 22 you were fine with it.
- 23 MR. BOLAND: I didn't think I was. That's why
- 24 I objected. But maybe I don't recall what it was.

- 1 home. He's lived here for decades.
- 2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 3 Q. But has -- did he ever tell you
- 4 specifically that he didn't consider himself to
- 5 have any property in California to be his home
- 6 before he asked you to sign a legal document to get
- 7 a case removed from California?
- 8 MR. BOLAND: Same objection.
- 9 You can answer.
- 10 BY THE WITNESS:
- 11 A. He did not ask me to sign a legal
- 12 document.
- 13 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 14 Q. Well, his lawyer told you it would help
- 15 Mr. Warner, right?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. And did his lawyer tell you that it was
- 18 important to say that Mr. Warner doesn't consider
- 19 any property in California to be his home or
- 20 residence?
- 21 MR. BOLAND: Okay. I will be happy to allow
- 22 her to answer about the things that she said here.
- 23 Beyond that, conversations with counsel, that's
- 24 going to be privileged, and I'm going to instruct

- 1 BY THE WITNESS:
- 2 A. Can you repeat the question.
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 4 Q. Was it your suggestion or someone else's
- 5 to include, "Mr. Warner does not consider any
- 6 property in California to be his home or primary
- 7 residence"?
- 8 A. I don't recall if it was my wording or
- 9 the attorney's wording.
- 10 Q. How many houses does Mr. Warner own?
- 11 A. Here, Santa Barbara?
- 12 Q. In the world, directly or indirectly.
- 13 A. He has other houses where he allows his
- 14 employees to stay.
- 15 Q. How many houses does Mr. Warner own
- 16 directly or indirectly?
- 17 A. I would say he -- I -- I don't know. I
- 18 would be guessing.
- 19 Q. More than ten?
- A. No, under ten.
- 21 Q. And this sentence, "Mr. Warner does not
- 22 consider any property in California to be home or
- 23 primary residence," did you discuss the
- 24 truthfulness of that statement with Mr. Warner



1

5

CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 257-260

Page 260

Page 257

1 before you signed this document?

- 2 A. Mr. Warner has expressed to me before,
- 3 this is where he resides and this is his home.
- 4 Like I said, he's lived here for decades. And
- 5 maybe I don't know through personal knowledge, but
- 6 he has been a customer of my parents consistently
- 7 for a number of years. I would say 20.
- Q. Did Mr. Warner, however, ever tell you
- 9 specifically that he doesn't consider any property
- in California to be his home?
- A. He has expressed that this is his home
- 12 in Oak Brook, but I don't think he's ever mentioned
- 13 that he has -- that he considers Santa Barbara his
- 14 home.
- 15 I'm asking the opposite. Has he ever Q.
- 16 specifically told you that he does not consider his
- 17 property, his house in Santa Barbara to be his
- 18 home?
- 19 A. No, he hasn't said those words.
- 20 MR. BRUSTEIN: We can take a break now if you
- 21 want. Five minutes or --
- MR. BOLAND: Yeah, about five minutes. 22
- 23 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going off the record
- 24 at 3:49 p.m.

Page 259 Q. Did you say he was reformed?

- He -- he served his community service
- 2
- hours, and I spoke to the CFO about the current 3
- state of his case.
 - Q. And what were you told?
- 6 A. She said that his tax case has been over
- 7 and just exactly what I read in Google when I
- Googled him, that his case was over and he had to
- serve community hours and his business --
- 10 Q. Were you concerned --
- 11 A. -- and his businesses were still in
- 12 operations and she didn't tell me anything that
- made me concerned.
- 14 Q. Is that the chief financial officer who
- 15 was fired?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Was she fired related to his conviction?
- 18 A. I don't know the reason for her
- 19 termination.
- 20 Q. Were you concerned about being the chief
- 21 financial officer for someone where the -- for a
- 22 company where the president had already been
- convicted of tax evasion? 23
- 24 A. No.

- Q. Let's go back to Exhibit 1, page 30. 2 This is an invitation for an August 26, 2020,
- 4 MR. BOLAND: Do you have -- do you have a
- Bates number on that one?
- 6 MR. BRUSTEIN: I'm sorry, yes. It is WD 9101.
- 7 MR. BOLAND: Thank you.
- 8 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 9 Q. Is there a reason there were no Hotel 57
- Services, LLC, employees at the meeting about the
- staffing model for Four Seasons Hotel New York --
- 12 MR. BOLAND: Object --
- 13 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 14 Q. -- on August 26th?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Sorry.
- 16 Object to the form.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. I don't know if there's a reason.
- 19 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 20 Q. When Mr. Tauscher was the general
- manager of Four Seasons Hotel New York, did he
- report directly to you or to someone else?
- 23 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 24 BY THE WITNESS:

Page 258

1 (WHEREUPON, a recess was had.)

- THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the
- 3 record at 4:01 p.m.
- 4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- Ms. Hwang, has Mr. Warner ever asked you 5 Q.
- to lie? 6
- 7 A. To -- I didn't hear your question.
- 8 Q. Has Mr. Warner ever asked you to lie?
- 9 A. No.
- 10 Q. Before going to work for Mr. Warner, did
- 11 you research him?
- A. I Googled him to research his properties 12
- 13 before my interview with the CFO.
- 14 Q. What year did you Google?
- 15 A. 2016.
- 16 Q. When you Googled him in 2016, did you
- 17 find out about his felony tax conviction?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Did that concern you?
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. Why not?
- 22 A. Because it was a closed case, and he was
- 23 reformed and his businesses were still in -- in
- 24 operation.



2

Page 261

CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 261–264

Page 263

Page 264

1	Δ	He did not report to me.	
1	Α.	He did not report to me.	

- 2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 3 Q. So which officer of Hotel 57 Services,
- 4 LLC, did Mr. Tauscher report to?
- 5 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 6 BY THE WITNESS:
- 7 A. I don't know. I don't know. It would
- 8 just -- he worked with Antoine Chahwan quite a bit,
- 9 but I don't know if he actually reported to him.
- 10 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 11 Q. Did he report directly to Mr. Warner?
- 12 A. No.
- 13 Q. Earlier --
- 14 A. Rudy was a Four Seasons employee. He
- 15 reported to Four Seasons.
- 16 Q. Earlier you testified there were only
- 17 two people Mr. Warner had the ability to control
- 18 the hiring and firing of, and one of them I
- 19 thought, correct me if I'm wrong, was the general
- 20 manager.
- 21 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 22 BY THE WITNESS:
- 23 A. That's not exactly what I said. I said
- 24 he had influence over hiring of two people. He

1 BY THE WITNESS:

- A. During operations, I would agree.
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 4 Q. I want to direct you to the next page.
- 5 This is a June 24, 2021, Communications Plan. Have
- 6 you seen this document? It's WD 8977. And it
- 7 continues for the next four pages, to WD 8981. I'm
- 8 sorry, five pages, WD 8982.
 - A. I don't know if I've seen this
- 10 particular document before, but I'm familiar with
- 11 the wording.
- 12 Q. Was there a reason that June 25, 2021,
- 13 it was announced to the staff and employees that
- 14 the hotel was going to be undergoing renovations
- 15 and not reopening for an extended period of time?
- 16 A. I don't recall the timing of the
- 17 financial projections, but I'm sure that was a
- 18 factor. And with the ongoing capital projects, we
- 19 were not planning to reopen.
 - Q. For at least a year?
- 21 A. It said we would -- I believe it said we
- 22 would reassess, right? In '22.
- 23 Q. Do you have a target reopening date as
- 24 you sit here today?

Page 262

- 1 does not have influence of firing. He does not
- 2 make that decision.
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 4 Q. Is he able to hire a new general manager
- 5 today if he wanted to?
- 6 A. Four Seasons would have to hire a
- 7 general manager and make that decision.
- 8 Q. Is Mr. Warner preventing the Four
- 9 Seasons from filling the general manager position
- 10 at the Four Seasons Hotel New York?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. Has Mr. Warner approved funding for a
- 13 general manager position at Four Seasons Hotel New
- 14 York?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 A. Four Seasons provided the staffing plan,
- 18 and after Rudy was -- Rudy resigned, I don't
- 19 believe there was a suggestion for his replacement.
- 20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 21 Q. Would you agree that hotels without
- 22 general managers tend to be less profitable?
- 23 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the
- 24 question.

- MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 2 BY THE WITNESS:
- 3 A. No.
- 4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 5 Q. How long do you expect it would take to
- 6 hire sufficient staff to reopen the hotel once all
- 7 other obstacles are gone to reopen?
- 8 MR. BOLAND: Object to form.
- 9 BY THE WITNESS:
- 10 A. I don't know. Four Seasons would have
- 11 to restaff.
- 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 13 Q. So three years plus into the hotel being
- 14 shut down, you don't have any sense of how long it
- 15 would take to get the hotel up and running?
- 16 MR. BOLAND: Same objection.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. I don't know.
- 19 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 20 Q. Do you think that's important
- 21 information for someone to have if they want to
- 22 actually reopen a hotel?
- 23 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the
- 24 question.



April 14, 2023 265–268

		Page 265
1	BY THE WITNESS:	

- 2 A. I think the plan needs to be reassessed,
- 3 and depending on how long the negotiations take, it
- 4 may not be realistic to set a target reopening date
- 5 at this point.
- 6 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 7 Q. Is it possible that the hotel may not
- 8 open in the next five years?
- 9 A. I don't know.
- 10 Q. So it's possible?
- 11 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 12 BY THE WITNESS:
- 13 A. I don't know.
- 14 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 15 Q. Is it possible that the hotel may not
- 16 open in ten years?
- 17 MR. BOLAND: Same objection.
- 18 BY THE WITNESS:
- 19 A. I don't know.
- 20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 21 Q. Okay. Now, on page 37, the --
- 22 MR. BOLAND: The Bates on this one.
- 23 MR. BRUSTEIN: I apologize. Thank you for
- 24 reminding me. WD9124.

- Page 267 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form, then.
- 1 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form, 2 BY THE WITNESS:
- 3 A. Can you repeat your question, then.
- 4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 5 Q. Are you an officer of the company Hotel
- 6 57 BB?
- 7 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 8 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. I don't recall. I need to look at the
- 10 list of all the legal entities and the entity
- 11 structure to be sure.
- 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 13 Q. So it's possible you're an officer for a
- 14 company you don't even know what the name is?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 A. I don't know all the legal entities for
- 18 the businesses, the exact name of all the legal
- 19 entities.
- 20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 21 Q. Now -- all right. What capital projects
- 22 are still outstanding as we sit here today?
- 23 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 24 BY THE WITNESS:

Page 266

- 1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- Q. Mr. Tauscher sent you an e-mail
 suggesting to reopen in late August of 2020. Did
- 4 you tell him at that point there was no way that
- 5 was going to happen?
- 6 A. I don't know what I communicated to Rudy
- 7 Tauscher in June of 2020. I can't recall.
- 8 Q. Okay. Now, in April of 2020, you asked
- 9 the Four Seasons to reevaluate the current staffing
- 10 and determine additional furloughs needed to reduce
- 11 the labor, right?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. And you sent an e-mail saying that there
- 14 were 133 working employees for Hotel 57 and Hotel
- 15 57 BB. What is Hotel 57 BB?
- 16 A. I think that was just the wording that
- 17 was used by Four Seasons.
- 18 Q. So you don't know what Hotel 57 --
- 19 A. I don't know the exact legal entity
- 20 name. I'm not sure why they're saying Hotel 57 BB,
- 21 but I think there's a small number of employees
- 22 in --
- 23 Q. I'm just asking -- I'm not asking about
- 24 a document. I'm just asking about the company.

- Page 268
 A. My understanding is that the shower pan
- 2 project, the fire panel project. Those are two
- 3 of some of the other ongoing capital projects that
- 4 are still in progress.
- 5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - Q. Are the elevators done?
- 7 A. I'm not -- I'm not positive if it's
- 8 completed yet.

- 9 Q. Is the wallpaper done?
- 10 A. Yes. There are --
- 11 Q. Are the wall --
- 12 A. Well, I just need to disclaim that there
- 13 is -- there's a select number of rooms that we left
- 14 alone, but as far as I know, the wallpaper project
- 15 is completed.
- 16 Q. Why were some of the rooms not finished?
- 17 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 18 BY THE WITNESS:
- 19 A. It was minor, and also I think they
- 20 wanted to have a sample of rooms with the original
- 21 installation of wallpaper.
- 22 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 23 Q. When were the rest of the rooms
- 24 completed?



Page 269

CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 269–272

Page 272

Α	I don't recall.	

- 2 Q. I'm now going to direct you to page 71
- 3 of this exhibit, which I will share. WD 3078.
- 4 MR. BOLAND: Wait, let me -- can I see the --
- 5 the top of it. Oh, is that the top of it, the very
- 6 first page?

1

- 7 MR. BRUSTEIN: Yes.
- 8 MR. BOLAND: Okay. Let me find it.
- 9 What's the date on that one? 3/13/20?
- 10 MR. BRUSTEIN: Correct.
- 11 MR. BOLAND: Okay.
- 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 13 Q. Ms. Hwang, do you see that?
- 14 A. Yeah. I prefer to find the hard copy,
- 15 but I haven't been able to locate it.
- 16 MR. BOLAND: It's pretty far down.
- 17 THE WITNESS: Is it?
- 18 MR. BOLAND: Yeah.
- 19 And, I'm sorry, what did you say the
- 20 Bates number was? I apologize.
- 21 MR. BRUSTEIN: It's 3078. You can just hold
- 22 them up high if you want. I mean, they're probably
- 23 out of order.
- 24 THE WITNESS: I think I found it. Can you

- Page 271
- 1 Q. So prior to the hotel shutting down, the
- 2 hotel was able to have the wallpaper replaced not
- 3 once, but twice in more than 200 rooms?
 - A. The first installation was completed
- 5 during the renovation. I believe that renovation
- 6 completed in 2016.
- 7 Q. And the hotel was open during that
- 8 renovation, right?
- 9 A. I'm -- I'm not sure. I started late in
- 10 2016 when the renovation was substantially
- 11 complete.

15

- 12 Q. Okay. Well, when you started, had you
- 13 been told that the hotel had been shut down?
- 14 A. I don't recall hearing that, no.
 - Q. And it was completed in March of 2020,
- 16 so from the time that you started until the hotel
- 17 shut down in March of 2020, it didn't shut down for
- 18 any renovations up until that point, right?
- 19 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 20 BY THE WITNESS:
- 21 A. Can you repeat your question, please.
- 22 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 23 Q. The hotel didn't shut down at any point
- 24 prior to March 2020 when you were overseeing it,

- 1 scroll up to the top of that page, please.
- 2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 3 Q. It's a March 13, 2020, e-mail.
- 4 A. Okay. I found it.
- 5 Q. So that was before the hotel had shut
- 6 down for COVID, right?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. And it's an invoice for NewGen?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Is that the company that you said you're
- 11 suing for the way the wallpaper was done?
- 12 A. No. NewGen, I believe, is the company
- 13 that installed it for the second time.
- 14 Q. And did NewGen do a good job installing
- 15 it the second time?
- 16 A. As far as I know, there hasn't been any
- 17 issues after the second installation.
- 18 Q. And Frank Galasso, he's one of people
- 19 that works at Hotel 57 Services and oversees some
- 20 of the projects, or did at the time?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. And he said NewGen has completed 210
- 23 rooms as of today, which was March 12, 2020?
- 24 A. Okay.

- 1 right?
- A. So my knowledge of the wallpaper issue
- 3 is limited, because my -- the previous CFO was
- 4 overseeing and in touch with the status of the
- 5 project prior to her leaving.
- 6 Q. Okay. Well, about ten pages further in
- 7 the document, Exhibit 1, WD 5545, there's an e-mail
- 8 to you --
- 9 MR. BOLAND: Hold on. We got to get to it.
- 10 Hold on one second.
- 11 MR. BRUSTEIN: I'll talk while you do your
- 12 thing.
- 13 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 14 Q. Do you recall that the hotel manager
- 15 said that -- this is a June 26, 2020, e-mail. "I
- 16 confirmed with Frank and Sebastian today, the
- 17 wallpaper project is scheduled to be completed in
- 18 mid July, at the latest July 17. All the rooms on
- 19 the schedule except the six rooms left for legal
- 20 purposes will have been completed."
- 21 Sitting here today, do you have any
- 22 reason to believe that any rooms other than the six
- 23 ones for the legal purposes you talked about were
- 24 not completed by July 17, 2020?



April 14, 2023 273–276

A. I don't have a reason to believe

- 2 otherwise, unless there were some delays. I
- 3 don't -- I don't know.
- 4 Q. Okay. So would it be fair to say that
- 5 NewGen had completed all the work of the
- 6 wallpapering by July 2020?
- 7 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 8 BY THE WITNESS:
- 9 A. Again, I don't recall the completion
- 10 date, but if we were to go by this document, yes,
- 11 it's --
- 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 13 Q. And the next sentence in that says, "On
- 14 a side know, I also wanted you to know we're near
- 15 completion of the systems integrated of the
- 16 penthouse as required by Mr. Warner on his last
- 17 visit."
- 18 So Mr. Warner actually had specific
- 19 requirements of what type of renovations needed to
- 20 occur?
- 21 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 22 BY THE WITNESS:
- 23 A. He stayed in the penthouse, and, gosh, I
- 24 don't know what year, but he wanted the lighting

- Page 275 1 should be about four pages later, WD 6339. It's a
- 2 four-page document ending at 6342.
- 3 These are notes. You probably haven't
- 4 seen this e-mail before, but they're notes from, it
- 5 says an owner visit from 12/17. Or it says visit
- 6 check, 12/17 and visit checklist.
- 7 Do you know when Mr. Warner visited the
- 8 hotel to come up with these demands for projects
- 9 and updates?
- 10 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 11 BY THE WITNESS:
- 12 A. I don't know when his last visit to the
- 13 hotel was. I was, however, with Mr. Warner. We
- 14 went to the hotel. The last time we went there was
- 15 fall of 2019.
- 16 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 17 Q. All of the things that you talked about
- 18 as basis for shutting down the hotel can be found
- 19 on this list, right?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 21 BY THE WITNESS:
- 22 A. No. These were --
- 23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 24 Q. Look --

Page 276

- Page 2
- 1 and certain systems in the penthouse updated. It
- 2 was malfunctioning. So Michal was -- Michal had --
- 3 with Four Seasons was tasked to make sure that
- 4 project was completed.
- 5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 6 Q. Now, in the middle of this pandemic you
- 7 said that Mr. Warner was very concerned about the
- 8 medical profession, correct?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. His priority was the health and safety
- 11 of the employees and potential guests?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. He put their well being ahead of any
- 14 financial decisions he was considering?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 A. It's a business. I -- I don't know -- I
- 18 don't know if Mr. Warner -- you would have to ask
- 19 Mr. Warner that question. I don't know if he --
- 20 how he prioritizes.
- 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 22 Q. We'll get to ask Mr. Warner questions
- 23 later. That's fine.
- Now, page 85 of this document, so it

- 1 MR. BOLAND: Let her finish.
- 2 BY THE WITNESS:
- 3 A. These were items that Mr. Warner pointed
- 4 out to the team prior to his last visit. I think
- 5 this has been ongoing.
- BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 7 Q. And nothing on this list required the
- 8 hotel to shut down, correct?
- 9 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 10 BY THE WITNESS:
- 11 A. I don't know what MR level project is,
- 12 but --

- 13 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - Q. Now, with respect to the Montecito
- 15 property that's still closed, was that shut down
- 16 because it wasn't -- is that still shut down
- 17 because it's not profitable to reopen it?
- 18 A. Which property?
- 19 Q. The Montecito property.
- 20 A. Montecito Country Club?
- 21 Q. Yes.
- 22 A. No, it's open.
- 23 Q. I thought -- I thought you said there
- 24 was another property that was closed for



April 14, 2023 277–280

Page 279

Page 280

	Page 277
renovations for more than three years.	

- 2 A. No, they were closed during COVID, and I
- 3 think there were further renovations. Again, I
- 4 don't remember the timing, but it was closed for a
- 5 while for renovations. I don't recall if it was
- 6 three years.
- 7 Q. I'm now going to direct your attention
- 8 to Exhibit 1, page 89, which is the very next
- 9 document, WD 7650.
- 10 This is a May 4, 2020, e-mail exchange
- 11 where you e-mailed Michal, who was the hotel
- 12 manager at the time, right?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. And you said that Mr. Warner was asking
- 15 about the pixel size of the TV at the Ty Bar.
- 16 A. Okay. I see it. I see the e-mail.
- 17 Q. Was the Ty Bar closed at that point?
- 18 A. Yes. The hotel was closed.
- 19 Q. I'm sorry?
- 20 A. Ty Bar is inside of the hotel. The
- 21 hotel was closed.
- 22 Q. Well, medical professionals were staying
- 23 at the hotel, but they couldn't access the Ty Bar,
- 24 right?

1 BY THE WITNESS:

- 2 A. The TV in the Ty Bar, it would
- 3 malfunction periodically while the hotel was in
- 4 operation. And I think this was a project where
- 5 Mr. Warner was reconsidering what we should do with
- 6 the TV screen.
- 7 MR. BRUSTEIN: At this point I'm going to ask
- 8 that the witness be shown Exhibit 8, Hwang. When
- 9 you first bring it up.
- 10 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 11 Q. This is a declaration that you --
- 12 THE REPORTER: Wait a minute. Wait a minute.
- 13 (WHEREUPON, a certain document was
- 14 marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit
 - No. 8, for identification, as of
- 16 4/14/23.)

15

- 17 MR. BOLAND: Thank you.
- 18 THE REPORTER: Okay.
- 19 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 20 Q. May I continue?
- 21 A. Yes, please.
- 22 Q. This is a declaration that you signed in
- 23 connection with this case, right?
- 24 A. Yes.

- 1 A. No, Ty Bar was closed.
- Q. So is there a reason Mr. Warner in May
- 3 of 2020, at the height of the pandemic when people
- 4 were -- when dead bodies were stacking up in the --
- 5 in the streets outside hospitals, needed to know
- 6 how big a TV was in a closed bar in his hotel?
- 7 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 8 BY THE WITNESS:
- 9 A. I think this was initiated by Michal.
- 10 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 11 Q. Well, the bottom e-mail --
- 12 MR. BOLAND: Are you done? I don't know if
- 13 she was done.
- 14 BY THE WITNESS:
- 15 A. He is asking -- this is one of the
- 16 capital items that he had discussed, and I think
- 17 this was -- I'm just trying to see when the e-mail
- 18 was initiated. I think there was discussions
- 19 about this -- I think it was a renewal for rented
- 20 items.
- 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 22 Q. So even the pixel size of the TV was
- 23 something that Mr. Warner was involved in deciding?
- 24 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

- Q. And on the fifth page, you signed it
- 2 declaring under the penalty of perjury, right?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. And that's similar to the oath you took
- 5 today, right?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. And you swore that everything in this
- 8 declaration was true, right?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. I'm going to direct your attention to --
- 11 but before I do, and so you read this carefully to
- 12 make sure that it was accurate and truthful because
- 13 you knew that not only were -- would it be a crime
- 14 to submit false testimony, but that it was in
- 15 connection with a federal lawsuit. And so it was
- 16 important to be accurate, right?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Now, I'm going to direct your attention
- 19 to paragraph 5. You said that Staley signed the
- 20 EmPact Agreement and that true and accurate copies
- 21 of her signature pages of the EmPact Agreement were
- 22 attached as Exhibit B, right?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. And you said that she signed the EmPact



CATHY HWANG

April 14, 2023

	LENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASO	
1 2	Page 281 Agreement you had attached as Exhibit A, right? A. That's what's stated here.	Page 283 1 EmPact Agreement are collectively annexed hereto as 2 Exhibit D. The EmPact Agreement annexed hereto as
3	Q. I'm sorry?	3 Exhibit A is the version that Staley signed in
4	A. Yes, that's what's stated.	4 2018.
5	Q. And by stated, that's what you swore was	5 Is this one also to be about Staley or
6	true?	6 did you mean for this one to be about Ivey?
7	A. Yes.	7 A. I don't know. I would have to review
8	Q. And going down a little bit in	8 the exhibit.
9	paragraph 7, you said that Holmes signed the EmPact	9 Q. Okay. So let's go down to Exhibit B
10	Agreement and true and accurate cop and signed	10 first. I'm just going to warn you, it's far in the
11	an updated version in 2018. Do you see that?	11 back. So if you want to start from the back, it's
12	A. Yes, I see it.	12 a little easier.
13	Q. And it says true and accurate cop	13 And I'm looking at the first page of the
١	true and correct copies of Holmes' signature pages	14 Exhibit B. Is this the EmPact Revision
14		
15	of the EmPact Agreement are collectively annexed hereto as Exhibit C.	15 Acknowledgement Form for the 2018 EmPact Revision
16		16 you were referencing?
17	It then goes on, the EmPact Agreement	17 And if you want, you can keep your
18	annexed hereto as Exhibit A is the version that	18 exhibit open to the first page so you can look at
19	Staley signed in 2018.	19 them side by side if you want that. That may be
20	Do you mean Holmes in that sentence?	20 helpful to you.
21	A. Can you repeat your last statement?	So is this the signature page that you
22	Q. The last sentence says the EmPact	22 said was for the Em the 2018 EmPact Agreement?
23	Agreement annexed hereto is the version that Staley	Ms. Hwang, are you still there?
24	signed in 2018. I'm asking if you meant to say	24 A. Yes, I'm here.
1	Page 282 that Holmes signed in 2018, because the rest of the	Page 284 1 Q. Is this the Acknowledgment Form to the
2	paragraph is dealing with Holmes' signature pages.	2 2018 EmPact Agreement that you were referencing for
3	Is that sentence supposed to be about	3 Ms. Staley?
4	Staley or Holmes?	4 A. Yes.
5	Do you understand the question?	5 Q. Going to the next page in this, it's
6	A. Yes, I'm just trying to understand.	6 2015, and then the next one is back all the way in
7	Q. Do you agree that it should be about	7 2011, and then there's one more for 2008 for
8	Holmes?	8 Ms. Staley, and then it goes to Exhibit C, correct?
9	A. I don't know. I'd have to review that	9 For Exhibit C, that's Ms. Holmes, and
10	again to be sure.	10 the first one she signed was in 1998, and then the
11	Q. So you think you meant to say Staley's	11 next one it says in, I believe I don't know if
12		12 that's 2016, maybe. No, that's '98 again. And
13		13 then the last one for her, it says 2018, then,
14		14 right?
15		15 A. Yes, I see that.
16		16 Q. So that so that's the acknowledgment
17	Q. Okay. Let's jump down to paragraph 9.	17 form you were referencing for Ms. Holmes. Does
18		18 that refresh your recollection as to whether or not
19		19 in the declaration you meant to say Staley for that
20	 Q. And that says that Ivey signed an 	20 paragraph that was referencing Holmes, or if you

21 meant to say Holmes?

24 2018 EmPact Agreement?

It's a simple question. Is this the

23 form that you're saying Ms. Holmes signed for the

22



A. Yes.

22

23

21 updated version in or about 2018, right?

Q. And true and acc- -- and true and 24 correct copies of Ivey's signature pages of the Page 285

CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 285–288

Page 287

Page 288

	_		
1	Α.	Yes.	

- 2 Q. And then going to Exhibit D, the first
- 3 one for Ms. Ivey is in 1997. The second one is
- 4 also 1997. And then there are two from 2018. Do
- 5 you see that? They appear to be the same date,
- 6 just a double copy, right?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. So is that also the Acknowledgment Form
- 9 that you're acknowledging in your declaration?
- 10 A. It's the EmPact Agreement is -- in
- 11 Exhibit A is the same.
- 12 Q. So -- so that's what I'm asking you. So
- 13 is that a yes? Just because on the first page in
- 14 your declaration, you had referenced Staley in the
- 15 earlier paragraphs for Holmes and Ivey. And I just
- 16 want to know, are you saying these are the
- 17 signature pages that you're swearing were for the
- 18 EmPact Agreement in your declaration?
- 19 If you want to go off record and think
- 20 about this, you can.
- 21 MR. BOLAND: No, she's looking. She's
- 22 looking.
- 23 MR. BRUSTEIN: We don't need the coaching.
- 24 MR. BOLAND: No, I'm just saying we're not

- 1 thorough in your review, right?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. You understand that filing false
- 4 statements under oath can result in sanctions both
- 5 for you and your attorneys? Did you know that?
- 6 A. No, I'm not an expert in law.
 - Q. Well, I'm now going to direct your
- 8 attention to page 7 of this exhibit. This is the
- 9 EmPact Agreement that you swore under penalty of
- 10 perjury Ms. Holmes, Ms. Ivey and Ms. Staley signed,
- 11 right?

7

- 12 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 13 BY THE WITNESS:
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 16 Q. In the middle of the page, can you
- 17 please read for the record what the date is that it
- 18 was last revised.
- 19 A. 2018.
 - Q. Give me the full year, date and month.
- 21 A. May 30, 2018.
- 22 Q. Now, can you please tell me whether
- 23 April 4, 2018, happens before or after May 30,
- 24 2018?

20

1

Page 286

- 1 going off the record while you're asking the
- 2 witness to do something. That's all.
- 3 BY THE WITNESS:
- 4 A. It merely says that's the agreement that
- 5 Staley signed in 2018.
- 6 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 7 Q. I'm not saying that's a false statement.
- 8 I'm just asking you if you meant for it to say that
- 9 Holmes signed it and that Ivey signed it.
- 10 A. No, I -- I meant -- I meant that Staley
- 11 signed it in 2018. That's the Exhibit A was signed
- 12 by Staley in 2018.
- 13 Q. But the purpose of attaching the other
- 14 exhibits was because you're saying that Holmes and
- 15 Ivey also signed this exhibit, right?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. And you swore that under penalties of
- 18 perjury, right?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. What research did you do before making
- 21 that representation to the court?
- 22 A. I reviewed the pages that were signed,
- 23 the acknowledgment forms.
- 24 Q. And you took the oath seriously and were

- A. That happens after.
- 2 Q. So would you agree that Selena could not
- 3 have signed an EmPact Agreement on April 4, 2018,
- 4 that had been revised on May 30, 2018.
- 5 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 6 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 7 Q. You agree that she couldn't have signed
- 8 something before it existed?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. So would you agree that when you said
- 11 the April 4, 2018, signature page was related to a
- 12 May 30, 2018, revision of the EmPact Agreement,
- 13 that was not a true statement?
- 14 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 16 Q. You're not going to find the answer in
- 17 the papers. I'm asking you whether or not your
- 18 statement that she signed something on April 4,
- 19 2018, for a document dated May 30, 2018, is true or
- 20 not?
- 21 A. I thought it said 2018. I am just
- 22 reviewing the document that I signed.
- 23 Q. Well, the document you signed said that
- 24 you attached the document that Ms. Staley had



April 14, 2023 289–292

	LENA STALET -against- FOOR SEASO		
1	Page 289 signed, right, as a true and accurate copy?	1	Page 29 ² attorneys submit a false statement to the court,
1 2	A. Yes.		correct?
3	Q. And the document you attached to your	3	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS:
4	exhibit said May 30, 2018, right?		
5	A. Yes.	5	A. Yes, that was submitted by the
6	Q. And so that wasn't true.	6	attorneys.
7	A. It was an oversight on my part. I	7	MR. BRUSTEIN: Let's take a five-minute break
8	didn't see the month and the date.	8	here.
9	Q. Same question. May 3, 2018, is that	9	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Going off the record at
10	before or after May 30, 2018?		4:53 p.m.
11	A. It's before.	11	(WHEREUPON, a recess was had.)
12	Q. So would you agree that Vivian Holmes'	12	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on record
13	May 3, 2018, signature could not have been for the	13	at 4 5 o'clock p.m.
14	May 30, 2018, revision that you claimed it was,	14	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
15	right?	15	Q. Now, Ms. Hwang, you testified that you
16	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	16	were involved in reviewing court documents related
17	BY THE WITNESS:	17	to the wallpaper litigation, right?
18	A. Yes.	18	A. Yes.
19	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	19	 Q. And you testified that you made sure
20	Q. One last time. April 18, 2018, is that	20	that those were truthful and accurate, as well,
21	before or after May 30, 2018.	21	right?
22	A. Before.	22	A. Yes.
23	Q. So you would also agree that when you	23	MR. BRUSTEIN: At this point I'm going to ask
24	swore under oath that Olive Rodriguez signed or	24	that Exhibit 13 be marked and show it to the
1	Page 290 Olive Ivey signed the EmPact Agreement for May 30,	1	Page 292 witness.
2	2018, with an April 18, 2018, signature page, that	2	(WHEREUPON, a certain document was
3	was also not true?	3	marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit
4	A. As I indicated, I didn't see the exact	4	- · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	•	4	No. 13, for identification, as of
5	date.	5	No. 13, for identification, as of 4/14/23.)
			4/14/23.)
6	Q. Well, you also indicated that you	5 6	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in
6 7	Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right?	5 6 7	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat.
6 7 8	Q. Well, you also indicated that youreviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right?A. Yes.	5 6 7 8	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay.
6 7 8 9	Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right?A. Yes.Q. So when you swore under oath that you	5 6 7 8 9	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
6 7 8 9 10	 Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right? A. Yes. Q. So when you swore under oath that you had done that, was it that you hadn't actually read 	5 6 7 8 9 10	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you have conversations with
6 7 8 9 10 11	Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right? A. Yes. Q. So when you swore under oath that you had done that, was it that you hadn't actually read what you were signing?	5 6 7 8 9 10	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you have conversations with Mr. Warner about determining what documents should
6 7 8 9 10 11 12	 Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right? A. Yes. Q. So when you swore under oath that you had done that, was it that you hadn't actually read what you were signing? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. 	5 6 7 8 9 10 11	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you have conversations with Mr. Warner about determining what documents should be considered confidential and which documents are
6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right? A. Yes. Q. So when you swore under oath that you had done that, was it that you hadn't actually read what you were signing? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS:	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you have conversations with Mr. Warner about determining what documents should be considered confidential and which documents are okay to share publicly or to file publicly?
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right? A. Yes. Q. So when you swore under oath that you had done that, was it that you hadn't actually read what you were signing? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Like I said, it was an oversight on my	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you have conversations with Mr. Warner about determining what documents should be considered confidential and which documents are okay to share publicly or to file publicly? MR. BRUSTEIN: Object to the form.
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right? A. Yes. Q. So when you swore under oath that you had done that, was it that you hadn't actually read what you were signing? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Like I said, it was an oversight on my part on the exact date.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you have conversations with Mr. Warner about determining what documents should be considered confidential and which documents are okay to share publicly or to file publicly? MR. BRUSTEIN: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS:
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right? A. Yes. Q. So when you swore under oath that you had done that, was it that you hadn't actually read what you were signing? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Like I said, it was an oversight on my part on the exact date. BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you have conversations with Mr. Warner about determining what documents should be considered confidential and which documents are okay to share publicly or to file publicly? MR. BRUSTEIN: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. No.
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right? A. Yes. Q. So when you swore under oath that you had done that, was it that you hadn't actually read what you were signing? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Like I said, it was an oversight on my part on the exact date. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And so it resulted in you submitting a	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you have conversations with Mr. Warner about determining what documents should be considered confidential and which documents are okay to share publicly or to file publicly? MR. BRUSTEIN: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. No. BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right? A. Yes. Q. So when you swore under oath that you had done that, was it that you hadn't actually read what you were signing? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Like I said, it was an oversight on my part on the exact date. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And so it resulted in you submitting a false statement to the court under penalty of	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you have conversations with Mr. Warner about determining what documents should be considered confidential and which documents are okay to share publicly or to file publicly? MR. BRUSTEIN: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. No. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Who decides from the company, Ty Warner
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right? A. Yes. Q. So when you swore under oath that you had done that, was it that you hadn't actually read what you were signing? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Like I said, it was an oversight on my part on the exact date. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And so it resulted in you submitting a false statement to the court under penalty of perjury?	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you have conversations with Mr. Warner about determining what documents should be considered confidential and which documents are okay to share publicly or to file publicly? MR. BRUSTEIN: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. No. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Who decides from the company, Ty Warner Hotel & Resorts or Hotel 57, LLC, or any of the
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right? A. Yes. Q. So when you swore under oath that you had done that, was it that you hadn't actually read what you were signing? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Like I said, it was an oversight on my part on the exact date. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And so it resulted in you submitting a false statement to the court under penalty of perjury? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you have conversations with Mr. Warner about determining what documents should be considered confidential and which documents are okay to share publicly or to file publicly? MR. BRUSTEIN: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. No. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Who decides from the company, Ty Warner Hotel & Resorts or Hotel 57, LLC, or any of the other entities that you're officer in, what
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right? A. Yes. Q. So when you swore under oath that you had done that, was it that you hadn't actually read what you were signing? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Like I said, it was an oversight on my part on the exact date. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And so it resulted in you submitting a false statement to the court under penalty of perjury?	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	4/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you have conversations with Mr. Warner about determining what documents should be considered confidential and which documents are okay to share publicly or to file publicly? MR. BRUSTEIN: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. No. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Who decides from the company, Ty Warner Hotel & Resorts or Hotel 57, LLC, or any of the other entities that you're officer in, what information should be confidential and what
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right? A. Yes. Q. So when you swore under oath that you had done that, was it that you hadn't actually read what you were signing? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Like I said, it was an oversight on my part on the exact date. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And so it resulted in you submitting a false statement to the court under penalty of perjury? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. You can answer.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you have conversations with Mr. Warner about determining what documents should be considered confidential and which documents are okay to share publicly or to file publicly? MR. BRUSTEIN: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. No. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Who decides from the company, Ty Warner Hotel & Resorts or Hotel 57, LLC, or any of the other entities that you're officer in, what information should be confidential and what information is okay to publicly disclose?
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right? A. Yes. Q. So when you swore under oath that you had done that, was it that you hadn't actually read what you were signing? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Like I said, it was an oversight on my part on the exact date. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And so it resulted in you submitting a false statement to the court under penalty of perjury? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. You can answer. A. Can you repeat your question?	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you have conversations with Mr. Warner about determining what documents should be considered confidential and which documents are okay to share publicly or to file publicly? MR. BRUSTEIN: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. No. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Who decides from the company, Ty Warner Hotel & Resorts or Hotel 57, LLC, or any of the other entities that you're officer in, what information should be confidential and what information is okay to publicly disclose? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. Well, you also indicated that you reviewed it and made sure it was accurate, right? A. Yes. Q. So when you swore under oath that you had done that, was it that you hadn't actually read what you were signing? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. Like I said, it was an oversight on my part on the exact date. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. And so it resulted in you submitting a false statement to the court under penalty of perjury? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. You can answer.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A/14/23.) MR. BRUSTEIN: And I placed a copy of it in the chat. THE REPORTER: Okay. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Do you have conversations with Mr. Warner about determining what documents should be considered confidential and which documents are okay to share publicly or to file publicly? MR. BRUSTEIN: Object to the form. BY THE WITNESS: A. No. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Who decides from the company, Ty Warner Hotel & Resorts or Hotel 57, LLC, or any of the other entities that you're officer in, what information should be confidential and what information is okay to publicly disclose? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.



April 14, 2023 293–296

Page 295

		Page 293
A.	It's discussed with Mr. Warner's	Ū

- 2 attorney.
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 4 Q. Do you get to weigh in on the
- 5 designation of confidentiality, or is that
- 6 something that Mr. Warner, himself, has authority
- 7 over?
- 8 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 9 BY THE WITNESS:
- 10 A. Sure, I have input, and so does
- 11 Mr. Warner, but we discuss that with counsel.
- 12 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 13 Q. Prior to filing this lawsuit, Hotel 57,
- 14 LLC, versus Integral Contracting, Incorporation,
- 15 did you have any reservations about publicly
- 16 disclosing any of the information contained in this
- 17 federal lawsuit?
- 18 A. No, left that up to --
- 19 Q. Did you --
- 20 A. -- the counsel.
- 21 Q. Did you review the complaint before it
- 22 was filed to make sure nothing confidential was
- 23 revealed in the filing?
- 24 A. I reviewed the filing.

1 done through his attorney.

- 2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 3 Q. And so you knew before you approved this
- 4 document to be publicly filed that there was no
- 5 confidentiality concern about disclosing the
- 6 ownership of Hotel 57, LLC --
- 7 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 8 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - Q. -- right?

9

- 10 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. Sorry.
- 11 BY THE WITNESS:
- 12 A. As I said, I discussed that with counsel
- 13 and counsel discussed that with Mr. Warner. I did
- 14 not have a direct discussion with Mr. Warner.
- 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 16 Q. But you knew that by filing this
- 17 publicly, it would become public information who
- 18 owned Hotel 57, LLC?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Can you please read paragraph 6 into the
- 21 record aloud.
- 22 A. "Owner's sole member is Hotel 57 HoldCo
- 23 LLC ('HoldCo'), which is a limited liability
- 24 company organized under the laws of Delaware."

Page 294

- 1 Q. And did you do that before it was filed?
- 2 A. Yes
- 3 Q. And did you make sure that it was
- 4 truthful and accurate?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And did you discuss with Mr. Warner
- 7 relevation -- revelations about ownership of Hotel
- 8 57, LLC?
- 9 MR. BOLAND: Object to -- object to the form.
- 10 BY THE WITNESS:
- 11 A. No, I did not have a discussion with
- 12 Mr. Warner.
- 13 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 14 Q. Did you have the authority to publicly
- 15 disclose the ownership of Hotel 57, LLC?
- 16 A. Can you repeat your question, please.
- 17 Q. Did you have the authority to publicly
- 18 disclose the ownership of Hotel 57, LLC?
- 19 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 20 BY THE WITNESS:
- 21 A. Mr. Warner discussed that with his
- 22 attorney, and his attorney, in turn, discussed it
- 23 with me. So I -- you know, I would have to make
- 24 sure that Mr. Warner's okay with it, but it was

- Page 296 Q. Is that another entity of Mr. Warners
- 2 that you are a director or officer of?
- 3 A. Yes.

4

7

14

- Q. Please read paragraph 7.
- 5 A. HoldCo's members are H. Ty Warner, an
- 6 individual, and Hotel 57 I, Inc., a corporation.
- Q. Is that statement true?
- 8 A. I would have to look at the legal entity
- 9 structure. As I had indicated it's a complex
- 10 structure, and I don't have it committed to memory.
- 11 Q. Before approving this complaint, did you
- 12 look at the operating structure to make sure that
- 13 it was accurate?
 - A. Yes.
- 15 Q. And are you an officer in Hotel 57 Corp.
- 16 I. Inc.?
- 17 A. I'm not sure if those are one of the
- 18 entities. I don't know.
- 19 Q. Now, this lawsuit discusses some pretty
- 20 specific things about vendors at Hotel -- at Four
- 21 Seasons Hotel New York, right?
- 22 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 23 BY THE WITNESS:
- 24 A. Yes.



Page 297

CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 297-300

Page 300

1	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	

- 2 Q. It discloses the identity of vendors
- 3 that the hotel uses?
- 4 MR. BOLAND: Same objection.
- 5 BY THE WITNESS:
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 8 Q. It identifies the type of wallpaper that
- the hotel used in its property?
- 10 Directing your attention to page 5,
- paragraph 37. It says, "Owner ultimately decided
- 12 to use a custom silk wallcovering supplied by Jolie
- Papier, Ltd., which was a reputable New York-based
- 14 wallcovering supplier with decades of experience."
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Is there any concern disclosing the
- 17 identities of these vendors publicly?
- 18 A. Not that I'm aware of.
- 19 Q. No basis to claim it was confidential?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 21 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. I don't know. 22
- 23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

BY THE WITNESS:

BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

A. No.

2

3

4

5

6 7

8 9

12

15

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

11 stated.

16 fees and costs.

24 Q. Did you have any basis as an officer of

MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

Q. This lawsuit also disclosed the dollar

amounts that the hotel was paying both for the

initial wallpaper project and the repairs, right?

10 document now. I don't know if it was specifically

Q. Well, let me direct your attention to 13 paragraph 156. As a result of Integral's breaches

14 of the Agreement, Owner has suffered damages in

excess of \$1.219 million plus interest, attorneys'

Q. And that's related to the cost that the

to NewGen for the replacement of the defectively

Q. Paragraph 142, Owner paid \$1.195 million

A. I don't recall. I am reviewing the

1 the company to claim it was confidential?

- Page 299 Q. And that's the company that we had
- 2 talked about in those e-mails previously, right?
- 3 A. Yes.

4

- Q. So neither you nor Mr. Warner prevented
- misinformation from being publicly filed in a
- lawsuit, right?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Would it be fair to say that the amount
- you're paying your vendors is not confidential?
- 10 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form, overbroad.
- 11 BY THE WITNESS:
- 12 A. Yes, unless we have an agreement for
- 13 confidentiality.
- 14 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 15 Q. Now, in this lawsuit you claim that you
- entered into a contract with NewGen Painting,
- Incorporated, for the wallpaper covering. Is that 17
- 18 true?
- 19 A. Can you repeat that question again,
- 20 please.
- 21 Q. This lawsuit says that you entered into
- 22 a contract with NewGen Painting, Incorporated, for
- the replacement of the wallpaper covering --
- wallcovering, right?

Page 298

- I'm just asking if you entered into a
 - contract with NewGen Painting before they began
 - doing the repairs for the hotel.
 - 4 A. I know they were engaged. I don't
 - recall if there was a contract. I'd have to -- I'm
 - just reading through the document now.
 - 7 Q. Let me direct your attention to
 - paragraph 138. It says, "On approximately
 - November 19, 2021, Owner entered into a contract
 - for the replacement of the wallcovering with NewGen
 - 11 Painting, Inc."
 - 12 Next paragraph, "NewGen Painting was a
 - contractor specializing in commercial, retail, and
 - residential wallcovering and painting and was
 - 15 well-qualified to perform the replacement of the
 - 16 wallcovering."
 - 17 "140. Pursuant to the November 19th
 - 18 contract, NewGen Painting removed the
 - defectively-installed wallcovering, furnished
 - replacement custom silk wallcovering provided by
 - 21 Jolie Papier, Limited, and installed replacement
 - wallcovering." 22
 - 23 Is that statement -- are those
 - 24 paragraphs true and accurate?



A. Okay, yes. I see that.

hotel was paying, right?

installed wallcovering?

A. Yes.

A. Yes.

April 14, 2023 301–304

Page 304

Page 301 Here, let me help you. I am going to

2 turn your attention back to Exhibit 1. I am going

3 to share my screen, because I know it can take you

4 a little bit of time, and we're short on time.

5 Exhibit 1, WD 5545.

MR. BOLAND: We -- is this after the one you

7 just showed us?

8 MR. BRUSTEIN: In a completely separate

9 document. It's page 80 of Exhibit 1.

10 MR. BOLAND: Oh, no, no. I understand that.

11 Just is it earlier -- okay. It's earlier than the

12 one we were just looking at, right?

13 MR. BRUSTEIN: It's about 10 or 11 pages from

14 the back.

15 MR. BOLAND: Okay.

16 MR. BRUSTEIN: I'll read it while you find it.

17 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

18 Q. "Dear Cathy, I confirmed with Frank and

19 Sebastian today that the wallpaper project is

20 scheduled to be completed by mid July, at the

21 latest by July 17th."

And this is June 26, 2020, before the

23 date that you swore was true that you retained them

24 in 2021.

Page 303
Q. This was a true e-mail that was sent by

2 Michal and received by you back on June 26, 2020,

3 right?

4

9

A. Yes. I don't recall when Michal

5 resigned.

6 Q. You know it was before November 2021,

7 right?

8 A. I'm not -- I don't recall.

Q. Okay. Well, I'm going to ask you the

10 same question or similar question that I asked you

11 before.

12 Did June 26, 2020, happen before or

13 after November 19, 2021?

14 A. It's before.

15 Q. It would be fair to say that if the

16 wallpaper was scheduled to be completed by July 17,

17 2020, you wouldn't have retained someone, the same

18 exact company in November 19, 2021, to do the work

19 that they had already done?

20 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

21 BY THE WITNESS:

22 A. I must have misread the date, then. I

23 don't recall exactly when the wallpaper project was

24 completed and when they were engaged.

Page 302

So when you said that you reviewed this

2 lawsuit, going back to Exhibit 13, and you retained

3 this company in November of 2021 to replace the

4 wallpaper, that except for those six legal rooms,

5 had already been replaced back in 2020, that wasn't

6 true, right?

7 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

8 BY THE WITNESS:

9 A. I don't recall the exact date of the

10 agreement.

11 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

12 Q. Does the e-mail I just showed you

13 refresh your recollection that the work was done

14 before November 19, 2021?

15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

16 BY THE WITNESS:

17 A. That's what it says in the e-mail. I

18 don't recall if that was exactly the year when it

19 was completed.

20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

21 Q. Well, Michal didn't work there much

22 after this e-mail, right?

23 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

24 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

2 Q. So you would agree that the statement

3 that the owner entered into a contract with NewGen

4 Painting on November 19, 2021, was not a true

5 statement?

6 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

7 BY THE WITNESS:

8 A. I believe the date -- there's a

9 discrepancy in the dates.

10 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

11 Q. You think it's important to be accurate

12 in federal filings?

13 A. Yes.

14

Q. And you think it's important to be

15 accurate when you swear to the truth of matters

16 under oath?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Do you think the fact that a date may be

19 wrong is something that matters when you swear to

20 tell the truth?

21 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

22 BY THE WITNESS:

23 A. Yes, the date matters. Again, I -- I

24 don't think I caught the date.



April 14, 2023 305–308

SE	LENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASO	NS
1	Page 305 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	1
2	Q. I'm now going to show you a document	2
3	that I'd ask be marked as Hwang Exhibit 3.	3
4	(WHEREUPON, a certain document was	4
5	marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit	5
6	No. 3, for identification, as of	6 7
7	4/14/23.)	
8	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	8
9	Q. Can I continue?	9
10	A. Yes, please.	10
11	Q. I am going to direct your attention to	11
12	page 10, the second to the last page of this	12
13	document. That's your verification and signature	13
14	dated December 23, 2022, right?	14
15	A. Yes.	15
16	Q. And you swore that you were the agent of	16
17	the defendants?	17
18	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	18
19	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	19
20	Q. Right?	20
21	A. Yes.	21
22	Q. Under what authority were you designated	22
23	as an agent of Mr. Warner?	23
24	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	24
4	Page 306	1
1 2	Excuse me. BY THE WITNESS:	1 2
3		3
4	A. Mr. Warner appointed me as the corporate officer for the logal entities.	4
5	officer for the legal entities. BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	5
6	Q. Mr. Warner is an individual defendant in	6
_		
7	this case, though, correct?	7
8	A. Yes.	8
9	Q. And on the first page, the first line	9
10	says, "Defendants Hotel 57 Services, LLC, Hotel 57,	10
11	LLC, Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts LLC, and H. Ty	11
12	Warner ('Defendants')." So when you said you were	12
13	an agent of defendants, did you understand that you	13
14 15	were representing to the court that you were agent	14
	of Mr. Warner?	15
	MD DOLAND. Object to the forms	
16	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	16
16 17	BY THE WITNESS:	17
16 17 18	BY THE WITNESS: A. I meant I was an agent of the legal	17 18
16 17 18 19	BY THE WITNESS: A. I meant I was an agent of the legal entities.	17 18 19
16 17 18 19 20	BY THE WITNESS: A. I meant I was an agent of the legal entities. BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	17 18 19 20
16 17 18 19	BY THE WITNESS: A. I meant I was an agent of the legal entities.	17 18 19

Page 307 indicated you were an agent of? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. Did you not mean that when you swore in your verification --(WHEREUPON, there was a short interruption.) MR. BOLAND: Bless you. 9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. -- that you were an agent of the defendant? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. 3 BY THE WITNESS: A. Again, I'm not an expert of law, and 5 when I signed off on the verification, I took it as 6 I'm a corporate representative for the defendants. 7 BY MR. BRUSTEIN: Q. So you did not mean to represent 9 yourself as an agent of Mr. Warner when you swore o under penalty of perjury that you were? MR. BOLAND: Object to the form of the 2 question. 3 BY THE WITNESS: A. I'm an employee of Mr. Warner, and I'm

Page 308

1 an agent of his legal entities.

2 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

Q. I understand that, but you swore under

4 penalty of perjury that you were an agent of his.

5 And I'm asking if you meant to swear to that under

6 oath or not?

7 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

8 BY THE WITNESS:

9 A. And I'm explaining that I'm the agent of

10 his legal entities, and it didn't occur to me that

11 I needed to be that technical and think of him as

Theeded to be that technical and think of him as

12 an individual. For the defendants, I was acting as

13 an agent for the defendants.

14 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

5 Q. Okay. Now, you also testified that you

16 were involved in reviewing accuracy of submissions

17 for the hotel management termination litigation

18 involving the Hotel Four Seasons -- Four Seasons

9 Hotel New York and Santa Barbara, correct?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And you reviewed that filing before it

22 was filed in court, right?

23 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

24 BY THE WITNESS:



No, he's an individual.

Q. He was one of the defendants that you

22 entity?

23

CATHY HWANG

April 14, 2023 309-312

SE	LENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASO	NS	S HOTELS 309–312
	Page 309	4	Page 311
1	A. Yes.	1	already been terminated, right?
2	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	2	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
3	Q. And you did so to make sure that it was	3	BY THE WITNESS:
4	accurate and truthful?	4	A. We're announcing that the owner wishes
5	A. Yes.	5	to terminate the agreement with Four Seasons.
6	Q. I'm now showing you Exhibit 4. I'd ask	6	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
7	that that be marked as Hwang Exhibit 4.	7	Q. Well, let's be a little bit more
8	I'm going to just let you know that it's	8	accurate as to what you allege. On page 5,
9	several documents. It's not just the Petition for	9	paragraph 16, I will read it, and you tell me if
10	Appointment of the Arbitrators, but I'm going to	10	I'm reading it correctly.
11	start with the first portion of the document.	11	As a result of Four Seasons' breaches,
12	THE REPORTER: Wait a minute. You keep	12	Owner served detailed default notices on Four
13	talking, but I need to grab the exhibit. So,	13	Seasons in February 2021, and then, after Four
14	sorry.	14	Seasons failed to cure those defaults, served
15	MR. BRUSTEIN: I'm sorry. I got ahead of	15	notices in March 2021 terminating Four Seasons'
16	myself.	16	management of both hotels under the HMAs. However,
17	THE REPORTER: That's all right.	17	Four Seasons refused to vacate the properties and
18	(WHEREUPON, a certain document was	18	contested Owner's termination of the HMAs."
19	marked Hwang Deposition Exhibit	19	Did I read that correctly?
20	No. 4, for identification, as of	20	A. Yes.
21	4/14/23.)	21	Q. The two hotels referenced are the Four
22	THE REPORTER: Okay. Thanks.	22	Season Hotel New York and the Four Seasons Santa
23		23	Barbara, right?
24	Q. I'm going to represent to you that it's	24	A. Yes.
	Page 310		Page 312
1	actually a collection of documents from that	1	Q. So according to this federal filing that
2	litigation. I'm right now going to be referencing	2	you swore is true, Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts tried
1 3	the first 11 pages, which are titled the Petition	3	to evict Four Seasons from the Four Seasons Hotel

3 the first 11 pages, which are titled the Petition for Appointment of Arbitrators. 5 Have you seen that document before? 6 Have you seen those documents -- that 7 11-page document before? 8 A. I was reviewing the full stack of 9 information that was handed to me. Yes, I've seen 10 the 10, 11-page document before.

12 to make sure it was accurate, right? 13 A. Yes. 14

11

Q. So that document on page 4 under the

15 Factual Background, paragraph A, can you read that

Q. And you reviewed it before it was filed

16 sentence, please, with the header.

17 A. "Owner Terminates the Parties'

18 Agreements Due to Four Seasons' breaches."

19 More than two decade --

20 Q. Just that sentence is all.

21 A. Okay.

22 Q. Thank you. That's not a future will

terminate or will try to terminate. You and your

company claim in this lawsuit that the HMA had

3 to evict Four Seasons from the Four Seasons Hotel

4 New York because Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts and

5 Mr. Warner considered the HMA to be done, right?

MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. Yeah, object

7 to the form.

8 BY THE WITNESS:

I would not say that we tried to evict

10 them. We announced that we'd like to terminate the

management agreement. We didn't -- when you evict

someone, you're forcing someone out physically.

13 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

Q. Fine. But according to this filing, you 14

considered it to be over. The HMA was terminated

back in March 2021 when Four Seasons failed to cure

17 the default notices, right?

18 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.

19 BY THE WITNESS:

20 A. Can you repeat your question again.

21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

22 Q. Did Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts,

Mr. Warner, and any other entity that he's involved

24 with, send notice that the HMA was terminated --



April 14, 2023 313–316

Page 315

Page 316

		Page 313
terminated and tr	to move on from	Four Seasons?

- 2 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 3 BY THE WITNESS:
- 4 A. Yes, we initiated the termination.
- 5 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 6 Q. And that's because you, meaning
- 7 Mr. Warner, and the entities, collectively,
- 8 considered the HMA to be over and terminated.
- 9 right?
- 10 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 11 BY THE WITNESS:
- 12 A. No, that's not what I would say.
- 13 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 14 Q. Do you understand terminated to be the
- 15 end?
- 16 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. Four Seasons is still managing the
- 19 hotel. So, yes, we filed this --
- 20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 21 Q. My question --
- 22 A. -- to terminate --
- 23 MR. BOLAND: Let her finish.
- 24 BY THE WITNESS:

1 permanent?

- MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 3 BY THE WITNESS:
- 4 A. Are you asking about furloughing an --
- 5 an employee or terminating an employee?
- 6 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 7 Q. I did not say furlough. I said
- 8 terminate. Are you confused about the definition
- 9 of terminating?
- 10 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 11 BY THE WITNESS:
- 12 A. No. I'm not.
- 13 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 14 Q. Are you aware of any definition of
- 15 terminating that is not permanent?
- 16 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 A. Termination is complete when the entire
- 19 process of termination is complete.
- 20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 21 Q. Yes, but the position your company took
- 22 in this lawsuit was that they terminated the
- 23 relationship by serving notices in March of 2021,
- 24 right?

Page 314

- A. -- but they're still managing the hotel.
- 2 The term -- the termination process --
- 3 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 4 Q. My question --
- 5 A. -- is not complete.
- 6 Q. Okay. But my question was about simply
- 7 the word "terminated." Do you understand the word
- 8 "terminated" to mean finished, over?
- 9 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 10 BY THE WITNESS:
- 11 A. The term here, I would define it as
- 12 cutting the relationship with Four Seasons as the
- 13 operator.
- 14 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 15 Q. When you terminate an employee, is that
- 16 considered temporary or permanent?
- 17 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 18 BY THE WITNESS:
- 19 A. In this case, I don't know.
- 20 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 21 Q. Have you ever terminated an employee
- 22 before?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Is that considered temporary or

- 1 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 2 BY THE WITNESS:
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 5 Q. And your understanding of termination is
- 6 a permanent ending, right?
- 7 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 8 BY THE WITNESS:
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 MR. BRUSTEIN: Okay. I'm going to take a
- 11 five-minute break. I -- I don't know if I have
- 12 much more left.
- 13 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going off the record
- 14 at 5:34 p.m.
- 15 (WHEREUPON, a recess was had.)
- 16 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the
- 17 record at 5:40 p.m.
- 18 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - 9 Q. Now, you testified earlier that you,
- 20 Mr. Warner and Mr. Hicks, I believe, are the
- 21 officers of all the 30 or 40 companies that you are
- 22 involved in; is that correct?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. And are the three of you all officers of



1

7

Page 317

CATHY HWANG SELENA STALEY -against- FOUR SEASONS HOTELS

April 14, 2023 317–320

Page 319

1	Hotal 57	Services.	1102
1	Hotel 57	Services.	LLU!

- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. As officers of Hotel 57 Services, LLC,
- 4 do you have supervisory authority over its
- 5 employees?
- 6 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 7 BY THE WITNESS:
- 8 A. No.
- 9 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 10 Q. So as an officer of the company Hotel 57
- 11 Services, LLC, you have no control over any of the
- 12 employees?
- 13 A. Yes, that's correct.
- 14 Q. Does Mr. Warner retain all of the
- 15 authority over the employees at Hotel 57 Services,
- 16 LLC?
- 17 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 18 BY THE WITNESS:
- 19 A. No, Mr. Warner does not have any
- 20 authority over the Hotel 57, LLC, employees.
- 21 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 22 Q. Is it your testimony that the employees
- 23 of Hotel 57 Services, LLC, have no supervisor?
- 24 A. The employees of Hotel 57, LLC, report

- A. Yes. Yes.
- 2 Q. So then you know from reviewing them
- 3 that, at least the allegations are, that two of the
- 4 plaintiffs worked with some level of supervisory
- 5 experience, right?
- 6 A. Yes.
 - Q. Are you testifying that they have more
- 8 authority of the operation and management of
- 9 employees of Hotel 57 Services than you do as a
- 10 officer of the company?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 Q. Are you claiming that they have more
- 13 authority than Mr. Warner himself?
- 14 A. Yes, Mr. Warner nor any of the officers
- 15 for Hotel 57, LLC, has authority over Hotel 57,
- 16 LLC -- I'm sorry, Hotel 57 Services, LLC,
- 17 employees.
- 18 Q. What about Mr. Tauscher, when he was
- 19 actually general manager, who was paying him?
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 21 BY THE WITNESS:
- 22 A. Four Seasons pays him.
- 23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 24 Q. So it's your testimony that

Page 318

- Page 320
 1 Mr. Tauscher, when he was the general manager, was
- 2 a Four Seasons employee, not a Hotel 57 Services,
- 3 LLC, employee?
- 4 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 5 BY THE WITNESS:
- 6 A. He is a Hotel 57 Services, LLC, employee
- 7 but he's paid by Four Seasons. The funding is
- 8 provided during closure by ownership, but Four
- 9 Seasons actually processes the payroll.
- 10 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 11 Q. What about Elizabeth Ortiz?
- 12 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 13 BY THE WITNESS:
- 14 A. The same.
- 15 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 16 Q. Meaning she's paid by Four Seasons when
- 17 the hotel is operating?
- 18 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 19 BY THE WITNESS:
- 20 A. Maybe I need to define that a little bit
- 21 better. Hotel -- Four Seasons processes the
- 22 payroll and pays the employees, but it --
- 23 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 24 Q. Okay.

1 to Four Seasons.

- 2 Q. Is there anyone within Hotel 57
- 3 Services, LLC, that's actually in charge?
- 4 A. In charge of?
- 5 Q. The other employees.
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Who?
- 8 A. The Four Seasons managers are in charge
- 9 of the Hotel 57, LLC, employees.
- 10 Q. When you say managers --
- 11 A. Property --
- 12 Q. -- is that the general?
- 13 A. I'm sorry. I'll let you finish.
- 14 Q. Is that general manager or someone else?
- 15 A. Anyone in managerial role, including the
- 16 general manager. It could be food and beverage
- 17 manager or HR manager.
- 18 Q. Some of the plaintiffs in this case were
- 19 managers at Hotel -- at the Four Seasons Hotel New
- 20 York, right?
- 21 A. I don't -- I don't know. I'm -- I'm not
- 22 familiar with employees by name.
- 23 Q. Well, you reviewed the filings in this
- 24 case, right?



April 14, 2023 321–324

Page 323

		Page 321
A.	But I guess it's paid out of the legal	Ü

- 2 entity for Hotel 57 Services, LLC. It's a bit
- 3 complicated because even the funding goes through.
- 4 Q. I will ask a different question.
- 5 A. Okay.
- 6 Q. Who supervises Elizabeth Ortiz?
- 7 A. Before Rudy Tauscher resigned, I believe
- 8 Elizabeth reported to Rudy Tauscher.
- 9 Q. And now who does she report to?
- 10 A. I don't know. I believe she reports to
- 11 someone at another Four Seasons employee, but she
- 12 does not report to any of the corporate officers.
- 13 Q. Are the Warner entities joint employers
- 14 with Four Seasons?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form. That calls
- 16 for a legal conclusion.
- 17 MR. WAGNER: I object, as well.
- 18 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 19 Q. You can answer.
- A. No. The employees are employed by Four
- 21 Seasons. They are not employed by Ty Warner
- 22 entities.
- 23 Q. Now, earlier you testified that there
- 24 was a third property that -- of Mr. Warner's that

- 1 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 2 Q. Is the testimony you've given today
- 3 complete and accurate in every respect?
- 4 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 5 BY THE WITNESS:
- 6 A. As to -- to my knowledge, yes, it's
- 7 accurate.

9

- 8 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
 - Q. Give me just one second.
- 10 Did Mr. Warner want the general manager
- 11 and hotel manager positions eliminated after the
- 12 hotel shut down in March 2020?
- 13 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 14 BY THE WITNESS:
- 15 A. Which positions? Can you repeat your
- 16 question?
- 17 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 18 Q. Rudy Tauscher's general manager
- 19 position.
- 20 MR. BOLAND: Same objection.
- 21 BY THE WITNESS:
- 22 A. Mr. Warner didn't see a need for a
- 23 general manager during hotel closure.
- 24 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:

Page 324

- Page 322
 1 has been closed for years for renovations. What
- 2 property was that?
- 3 A. Can you repeat that question again.
- 4 Q. There was a third property, in addition
- 5 to the two Four Seasons hotels, that Mr. Warner
- 6 owns that has been closed for years for7 renovations. What is that third property?
- 8 A. So Montecito Country Club was closed for
- 9 renovation.
- 10 Q. Okay. But -- but it's now reopened?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Okay. Now, is there anything else you
- 13 haven't already testified to that you want to add
- 14 now?
- 15 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 A. No, I'm here to answer your questions.
- 18 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 19 Q. Is there anything else relating to this
- 20 lawsuit that you haven't testified to that you want
- 21 to add now?
- 22 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 23 BY THE WITNESS:
- 24 A. No.

- Q. What about hotel manager during a hotel
- 3 A. He was fine having a hotel manager, but
- 4 he didn't see the need for a general manager during
- 5 hotel closure.

closure?

- Q. So it would be fair to say he was
- 7 looking to eliminate that position during the hotel
- 8 closure?
- 9 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 10 BY THE WITNESS:
- 11 A. He -- Mr. Warner cannot eliminate a
- 12 position or employees, terminate employees. That's
- 13 up to Four Seasons.
- 14 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 15 Q. Mr. Warner did decrease the salaries
- 16 during the closure of the hotel management
- 17 including bonuses, right?
- 18 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.
- 19 BY THE WITNESS:
- 20 A. The salaries were not reduced for the
- 21 hotel employees.
- 22 BY MR. BRUSTEIN:
- 23 Q. For the management, didn't they get a
- 24 reduced salary?



April 14, 2023 325–328

1	Page 325 MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	1	STATE OF ILLINOIS)
2	BY THE WITNESS:	2) SS:
3	A. Not to my knowledge, they did not get a	3	COUNTY OF DU PAGE)
4	reduced salary.	4	I, JACQUELINE M. TIMMONS, a Notary
5	BY MR. BRUSTEIN:	5	Public within and for the County of DuPage, State
6	Q. Does Mr. Warner use funding or the lack	6	of Illinois, and a Certified Shorthand Reporter of
7	of funding to try and have people eliminate their	7	said state, do hereby certify:
8	own positions?	8	That previous to the commencement of the
9	MR. BOLAND: Object to the form.	9	examination of the witness, the witness was duly
10	BY THE WITNESS:	10	sworn to testify the whole truth concerning the
11	A. No.	11	matters herein;
12	MR. BRUSTEIN: I have no further questions for	12	That the foregoing deposition transcript
13	today. I am going to leave it open based upon the	13	was reported stenographically by me, was thereafter
14	testimony that there are e-mails and documents that	14	reduced to typewriting under my personal direction
15	Ms. Hwang sent and received that have not been	15	and constitutes a true record of the testimony
16	provided. Those documents were specifically	16	given and the proceedings had;
17	requested in our discovery request. Those	17	That before the conclusion of the
18	documents also were part of the motion to compel,	18	deposition, the witness has requested a review of
19	which was granted by the court, and the court	19	this transcript pursuant to Rule 30(e)(1);
	ordered the defendants to produce those documents.	20	That the said deposition was taken
20	·	21	before me at the time and place specified;
21	So we will be having a meet and confer	22	That I am not a relative or employee or
22	probably on Monday to address the deficiencies of	23	attorney or counsel, nor a relative or employee of
23	defendant's productions. And we will, after	24	
24	reviewing the additional productions, determine	24	such attorney or counsel for any of the parties
	Page 326	-	Page 328
1	whether or not we need to depose Mr. Hwang	1	hereto, nor interested directly or indirectly in
2	Ms. Hwang further.	2	the outcome of this action.
3	Ms. Hwang, thank you very much for your	3	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I do hereunto set my
4	time today.	4	hand and affix my seal of office at Chicago,
5	MR. BOLAND: Two things. One, we disagree	5	Illinois, this 21st day of April, 2023.
6	with everything you just said. Two, she's this	6	Jacqueline m Jimmons
7	deposition is over. And three, actually, three	7	, 0
8	things, we will reserve signature.	8	Notary Public, DuPage County, Illinois.
9	MR. WAGNER: No questions from FSR. Thank	9	My commission expires January 23, 2026.
10	•	10	
11	MR. BRUSTEIN: Are we off?	11	
12	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going off record at	12	C.S.R. Certificate No. 84-2949.
13	5:52 p.m.	13	
14	FURTHER DEPONENT SAITH NOT.	14	
15		15	
16		16	OFFICIAL SEAL
17		17	JACQUELINE M TIMMONS
18		18	NOTARY PUBLIC, STATE OF ILLINOIS MY COMMISSION EXPIRES 1/23/2026
19		19	
20		20	
21		21	
22		22	
23		23	
24		24	
		1	



April 14, 2023 329–332

		Page 329			Page 331
1	INDEX	1 age 626	1	DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET	r ago oo r
2	WITNESS E	XAMINATION	2	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
3	CATHY HWANG		3		
4	By Mr. Brustein		4	December of the shape of	
	By Mr. Brustein	6		Reason for change:	
5			5	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
6	EXHIBITS	\$	6		
7	NUMBER M	MARKED FOR ID	7	Reason for change:	
8	Hwang Deposition		8	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
9	Exhibit No. 1	104	9		
10	Exhibit No. 3	305	10	Reason for change:	
11	Exhibit No. 4	309	11	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
				rage NoLine NoChange to	
12	Exhibit No. 5	190	12		
13	Exhibit No. 7	235	13	Reason for change:	
14	Exhibit No. 8	279	14	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
15	Exhibit No. 9	195	15		
16	Exhibit No. 13	292	16	Reason for change:	
17	Exhibit No. 14	166	17	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
18			18		
19			19	Reason for change:	
				-	
20			20	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
21			21		
22			22	Reason for change:	
23			23	SIGNATURE:DATE:_	
24			24	CATHY HWANG	
1	DEPOSITION ERRATA SH	Page 330	1	DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET	Page 332
	DEFOUTION ENGAGE OF	BB1	2		
2				Page NoLine NoChange to:	
3	Our Assignment No. J9562590		3		
4	Selena Staley, et al., vs. Four Se	asons Hotels and	4	Reason for change:	
5	Resorts, et al.,		5	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
6			6		
7	DECLARATION UNDER PENALTY	OF PERJURY	7	Reason for change:	
8			8	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
9	I declare under penalty	of perjury that I	9		
10	have read the entire transcript of		10	Reason for change:	
11	taken in the captioned matter or t		11	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
12	read to me, and the same is true a		12		-
	•	•		Decree for shower	
13	and except for changes and/or corr		13	Reason for change:	
14	as indicated by me on the DEPOSITI		14	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
15	hereof, with the understanding tha	t I offer these	15		
16	changes as if still under oath.		16	Reason for change:	
17			17	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
18	Signed on the	day of	18		
19		20	19	Reason for change:	
20			20	Page NoLine NoChange to:	
21	CATHY HWANG		21		
22	CHITI IMANG		22	Peagon for change:	-
				Reason for change:	
23			23	SIGNATURE:DATE:_	
24			24	CATHY HWANG	
			1		



1	DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET
2	
3	Our Assignment No. J9562590
4	Selena Staley, et al., vs. Four Seasons Hotels and
5	Resorts, et al.,
6	
7	DECLARATION UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY
8	
9	I declare under penalty of perjury that I
10	have read the entire transcript of my Deposition
11	taken in the captioned matter or the same has been
12	read to me, and the same is true and accurate, save
13	and except for changes and/or corrections, if any,
14	as indicated by me on the DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET
15	hereof, with the understanding that I offer these
16	changes as if still under oath.
17	
18	Signed on the 22nd day of
19	<u>May</u> , 20 <u>23</u> .
20	Cothy Awang
21	CATHY HWANG
22	
23	
24	



	DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET
	Page No. 12 Line No. 14 Change to: "Yes" to
l	"Montecito Country Club LLC was the plaintiff"
	Reason for change: Clarification
	Page No. 19 Line No. 8 Change to: "No." to "Yes."
	Reason for change: Correction
	Page No. 26 Line No. 20 Change to: Add "as president of
	Hotel 57, LLC." at end of sentence
	Reason for change: Clarification
	Page No. 30 Line No. 11 Change to: "Hotel 57, LLC"
	Reason for change: Correction
	Page No.30 Line No.19 Change to: FSR International
	Hotels, Inc."
	Reason for change: Clarification
	Page No.31 Line No.20 Change to: Change
	"Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts" to "Hotel 57, LLC"
	Reason for change: Correction
	Page No. 32 Line No. 9 Change to: Change
	"Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts" to "Hotel 57, LLC"
	Reason for change: Correction
	SIGNATURE: later Awang DATE: 5/22/23
	CATHY HWANG
1	



DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET
Page No. 39 Line No. 19 Change to: "Tell" to "Hill"
Reason for change: Spelling
Page No. 39 Line No. 17 Change to: Change "Montecito
Club" to "Montecito Country Club"
Reason for change: Correction
Page No. 4 Line No. 18 Change to: Change "Course"
to "Trust"
Reason for change: Correction
Page No. 49 Line No. 10 Change to: "Yes, or it might
have been at a later time in 2016."
Reason for change: Clarification
Page No. 69 Line No. 15 Change to: "SYR Service
Company"
Reason for change: Correction
Page No. 87 Line No. 3 Change to: Insert "as president
of Hotel 57 LLC" after "over"
Reason for change: Clarification
Page No. 91 Line No. 24 Change to: Insert "Hotel 57,
LLC" after "wants"
Reason for change: Clarification
SIGNATURE: Cathy Award DATE: 5/22/23
CATHY HWANG



1	DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET
2	Page No. 113 Line No. 24 Change to: Change "Mr.
3	Warner's" to "Hotel 57, LLC's"
4	Reason for change: Clarification
5	Page No. 114 Line No. 8 Change to: Change "Mr.
6	Warner" to "Hotel 57, LLC"
7	Reason for change: Clarification
8	Page No. 120 Line No. 11 Change to: Change "we" to
9	"Hotel 57, LLC"
10	Reason for change: Clarification
	Page No. 120 Line No. 18 Change to: Change "we" to
11	"Hotel 57, LLC"
12	Reason for change: Clarification
13	Page No.121 Line No.22 Change to: Change "we" to
14	"Hotel 57, LLC"
15	
16	Reason for change: Clarification
17	Page No. 123 Line No. 18 Change to: Add "for Hotel 57,
18	LLC" after "together"
19	Reason for change: Clarification
20	Page No. 126 Line No. 21 Change to: Add "Hotel 57, LLC"
21	after "For"
22	Reason for change: Clarification
23	SIGNATURE: Cathy Having DATE: 5/22/23
24	CATHY HWANG



1	DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET
2	Page No. 127 Line No. 23 Change to: Add "Hotel 57, LLC
3	refused to fund" after "recall"
4	Reason for change: Clarification
5	Page No. 129 Line No. 17 Change to: Change "We were"
6	to "Hotel 57, LLC was"
7	Reason for change: Clarification
8	Page No. 129 Line No. 23 Change to: "as part of Ty Warner
9	Hotels & Resorts" to "as President of Hotel 57, LLC"
LO	Reason for change: Correction
1	Page No. 136 Line No. 16 Change to: Insert "Hotel 57,
2	LLC" between "the" and "funding"
. 3	Reason for change: Clarification
L4	Page No. 144 Line No. 12 Change to: Add "but the Hotel
.5	was already closed because of Covid."
L6	Reason for change: Clarification
L7	Page No. 146 Line No. 22 Change to: Change
L8	"monitoring" to "modernization"
19	Reason for change: Transcription error
20	Page No. 155 Line No. 20 Change to: Change "Ty Warner
21	Hotels & Resorts" to "Hotel 57 LLC"
22	Reason for change: Correction
23	SIGNATURE: Catty Awang DATE: 5/22/23
24	CATHY HWANG



1	DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET
2	Page No. 165 Line No. 12 Change to: Replace first
3	sentence with "Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts does not decide when the Hotel opens."
4	Reason for change: Clarification
5	Page No. 166 Line No. 5 Change to: Add "as president of
6	Hotel 57, LLC."
7	Reason for change: Clarification
8	Page No. 169 Line No. 9 Change to: Change "We relied
9	on" to "Hotel 57, LLC relied on Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts"
LO	Reason for change: Clarification
L1	Page No. 178 Line No. 3 Change to: "Hotel 57 LLC did
12	not accept them."
L3	Reason for change: Clarification
14	Page No. 178 Line No. 10 Change to: "Hotel 57, LLC
15	rejected them."
16	Reason for change: Clarification
17	Page No. 175 Line No. 16 Change to: Add "for Hotel 57,
18	LLC" after "myself"
19	Reason for change: Clarification
20	Page No. 179 Line No. 17 Change to: Change "It" to "Hotel
21	57, LLC."
22	Reason for change: Clarification
23	SIGNATURE: Cathy Surang DATE: 5/20/23
24	CATHY HWANG
	GET TO THE SECOND SECON



1	DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET
2	Page No. 180 Line No. 18 Change to: Add "to Hotel 57,
3	LLC" after "loss"
4	Reason for change: Clarification
5	Page No. 183 Line No. 14 Change to: Change "the
6	company" to "Hotel 57, LLC"
7	Reason for change: Clarification
8	Page No. 183 Line No. 14 Change to: Change "the
9	Company" to "Hotel 57, LLC"
10	Reason for change: Clarification
11	Page No. 183 Line No. 16 Change to: Change "his" to
12	"Hotel 57, LLC's"
13	Reason for change: Clarification
14	Page No. 185 Line No. 19 Change to: Add "has no
15	responsibility to pay employees" after "Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts"
16	Reason for change: Clarification
17	Page No. 198 Line No. 14 Change to: Add "No, and I"
18	to start of answer
19	Reason for change: Clarification
20	Page No. 199 Line No. 4 Change to: Change "we" to
21	"Hotel 57, LLC"
22	Reason for change: Clarification
23	SIGNATURE: Cathy Lwang DATE: 5/22/23
24	CATHY HWANG



1	DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET
2	Page No. 202 Line No. 22 Change to: Change "We" to
3	"Hotel 57, LLC"
4	Reason for change: Clarification
5	Page No. 204 Line No. 24 Change to: Add "Hotel 57 LLC
6	commenced proceedings"
7	Reason for change: Clarification
8	Page No. 205 Line No. 22 Change to: Change "lawsuit" to
9	"arbitration"
10	Reason for change: Clarification
11	Page No. 206 Line No. 4 Change to: Change answer to
12	"It is an arbitration filed in good faith."
13	Reason for change: Clarification
14	Page No. 206 Line No. 11 Change to: "In the arbitration,
15	yes."
16	Reason for change: Clarification
17	Page No. 207 Line No. 14 Change to: Change "litigating"
18	to "arbitrating"
19	Reason for change: Clarification
20	Page No. 208 Line No. 4 Change to: Change to Mr.
21	Warner wants" to "Mr. Warner and Hotel 57, LLC want"
22	Reason for change: Clarification
23	SIGNATURE: Cathy Hwang DATE: 5/22/23
24	CATHY HWANG



1	DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET
2	Page No. 213 Line No. 24 Change to: Add "FSR was not
3	ready" after "No"
4	Reason for change: Clarification
5	Page No. 216 Line No. 10 Change to: Insert "Hotel 57,
6	LLC" beween "consider" and "funding"
7	Reason for change: Clarification
8	Page No. 218 Line No. 7 Change to: Change "We" to
9	"Hotel 57 Services, LLC"
LO	Reason for change: Clarification
11	Page No. 221 Line No. 11 Change to: "He's not he's not
12	required to pay" to "Hotel 57, LLC's not required to fund"
13	Reason for change: Clarification
14	Page No. 224 Line No. 22 Change to: Change "We" to
15	"Hotel 57 Services, LLC"
16	Reason for change: Clarification
17	Page No. 225 Line No. 4Change to: Change "We"
18	to "Hotel 57 Services, LLC"
19	Reason for change: Clarification
20	Page No. 225 Line No. 8 Change to: Change "we" to
21	"Hotel 57 Services, LLC"
22	Reason for change: Clarification
23	SIGNATURE: Cather Alwang DATE: 5/22/23
24	CATHY HWANG



DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET
Page No. 226 Line No. 17 Change to: Change "we" to
"Hotel 57 Services, LLC"
Reason for change: Clarification
Page No. 235 Line No. 8Change to: "I have seen his
personal taxes, but I have not reviewed them substantively."
Reason for change: Clarification
Page No. 247 Line No. 21 Change to: "Yes, physically.
He works remotely."
Reason for change: Clarification
Page No. 254 Line No. 16 Change to: "I don't recall what his
lawyer said."
Reason for change: Correction
Page No.261 Line No.7 Change to: Change "I don't
know. I don't know." to "None."
Reason for change: Correction
Page No. 261 Line No. 23 Change to: change "I said he" to
"As president of Hotel 57, LLC, he had influence over hiring of two people."
Reason for change: Clarification
Page No. 293 Line No. 24 Change to: Add ", but not for
that purpose."
Reason for change: Clarification
- way 111 say
CATHY HWANG



DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET
Page No. 297 Line No. 18 Change to: Add "in this
complaint."
Reason for change: Clarification
Page No. 298 Line No. 4 Change to: Add ", not in the
complaint."
Reason for change: Clarification
Page No. 312 Line No. 9 Change to: Add "No, Ty Warner
Hotels and Resorts is not a party."
Reason for change: Clarification
Page No. 12 Line No. 10 Change to: Change "we" to
"Hotel 57, LLC"
Reason for change: Clarification
Page No. 313 Line No. 4 Change to: Change "Yes, we" to
"Hotel 57, LLC"
Reason for change: Clarification
Page No. 316 Line No. 3 Change to: "Yes, Hotel 57 LLC
took a position in arbitration."
Reason for change: Clarification
Page No. 224 Line No. 20 Change to: Add "Mr. Warner
does not determine salaries, and the" to beginning of answer
Reason for change: Clarification
SIGNATURE: Cathy Hwang DATE: 5/22/23
CATHY HWANG



1	DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET
2	Page No. 118 Line No. 19 Change to: Change "He" to
3	"Hotel 57 Services, LLC"
4	Reason for change: Clarification
5	Page No. 185 Line No. 19 Change to: Add "Ty Warner
6	Hotels and Resorts funds Hotel 57 LLC's" before "providing"
7	Reason for change: Clarification
8	Page NoLine NoChange to:
9	
10	Reason for change:
11	Page NoLine NoChange to:
12	
13	Reason for change:
14	Page NoLine NoChange to:
15	
16	Reason for change:
17	Page NoLine NoChange to:
18	
19	Reason for change:
20	Page NoLine NoChange to:
21	
22	Reason for change:
23	SIGNATURE: Lothy Awarg DATE: 5/22/23
24	CATHY HWANG

